

Meta-informações das revisões bibliográficas (2018)

Várias dessas informações não podem ser extraídas do artigo e devem ser obtidas via internet.

O artigo de revisão que você irá analisar nem sempre contém informações para todas as meta-informações, além das que você pode encontrar na web. Se ele não contiver, digite NADA no tópico correspondente.

As informações podem ser inseridas em inglês, como cópia do original (citar a página)

Salvar este artigo antes de inserir o conteúdo, com o título: SEP5843 2018 - análise revisão <nome do aluno> <ano, autor principal>

1. Referência completa do artigo

LUOTO, S.; BRAX, S. A.; KOHTAMÄKI, M. Critical meta-analysis of servitization research: Constructing a model-narrative to reveal paradigmatic assumptions. **Industrial Marketing Management**, v. 60, p. 89–100, 2017.

2. Autores (um registro por autor)

Seppo Luoto

- 2.1. Tipo: Former Postdoc (agora trabalha na indústria)
- 2.2. Idade: ?
- 2.3. Anos pesquisando no assunto: ~2 anos (1º artigo sobre PSS em 2016)
- 2.4. Instituição: Hyria Education (anteriormente na University of Vaasa)
- 2.5. Índice-h: ~1
- 2.6. Colegas da mesma instituição: Não se encontra em nenhuma instituição de pesquisa
- 2.7. Quantidade de artigos já publicados: 6 (de acordo com o ResearchGate)
- 2.8. Outros artigos significativos (mais citados) sobre outros temas:
 - 100 citações - Kautonen, T., Luoto, S., & Tornikoski, E. T. (2010). Influence of work history on entrepreneurial intentions in 'prime age' and 'third age': A preliminary study. *International small business journal*, 28(6), 583-601.
- 2.9. Outros artigos significativos (mais citados) neste tema
 - Não há outros artigos significativos neste tema.
- 2.10. Co-autores recorrentes: Esa Viitamo, Timo Seppälä, Teemu Kautonen, Marko Kohtamäki, Henri Hakala (de acordo com o ResearchGate).

Saara A. Brax

- 2.11. Tipo: Postdoc
- 2.12. Idade: ~45 anos
- 2.13. Anos pesquisando no assunto: ~17 anos (1º artigo sobre PSS em 2001)
- 2.14. Instituição: Lappeenranta University of Technology (sendo pesquisadora visitante na Aalto University)
- 2.15. Índice-h: 16 (segundo google scholar)
- 2.16. Colegas da mesma instituição: Jero Ahola, Tero Ahonen, Christian Breyer, Jukka Hallikas, Jukka Lassila, Antti Kosonen, Tuomas Koironen
- 2.17. Quantidade de artigos já publicados: 37 (segundo google scholar)

2.18. Outros artigos significativos (mais citados) sobre outros temas:

NADA

2.19. Outros artigos significativos (mais citados) neste tema

- 547 citações - Brax, S. (2005). A manufacturer becoming service provider—challenges and a paradox. *Managing Service Quality: An International Journal*, 15(2), 142-155.
- 223 citações - Brax, S. A., & Jonsson, K. (2009). Developing integrated solution offerings for remote diagnostics: A comparative case study of two manufacturers. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 29(5), 539-560.
- 68 citações – Brax, S. A. (2007). Palvelut ja tuottavuus. *Teknologiakatsaus*, 204, 2007.
- 62 citações – Toivonen, M., Tuominen, T., & Brax, S. (2007). Innovation process interlinked with the process of service delivery: a management challenge in KIBS. *Economies et sociétés*, 41(3), 355.
- 56 citações - Paloheimo, K. S., Miettinen, I., & Brax, S. (2004). Customer oriented industrial services.

2.20. Co-autores recorrentes

- Marja Toivonen, Anders Gustafsson, Jan Holmström, Lars Witell, Max Finne (de acordo com o ResearchGate)

Marko Kohtamäki

2.21. Tipo: Professor

2.22. Idade: ~45 anos (estimado a partir do ano de formação)

2.23. Anos pesquisando no assunto: ~6 anos (primeiro artigo em 2012)

2.24. Instituição: University of Vaasa

2.25. Índice-h: 18 (segundo google scholar)

2.26. Colegas da mesma instituição: Rodrigo Rabetino, Yassine Talaoui (colegas do mesmo grupo de pesquisa)

2.27. Quantidade de artigos já publicados: 110 (segundo google scholar)

2.28. Outros artigos significativos (mais citados) sobre outros temas

- 152 citações - Sirén, C. A., Kohtamäki, M., & Kuckertz, A. (2012). Exploration and exploitation strategies, profit performance, and the mediating role of strategic learning: Escaping the exploitation trap. *Strategic Entrepreneurship Journal*, 6(1), 18-41.
- 70 citações - Hakala, H., & Kohtamäki, M. (2011). Configurations of entrepreneurial-customer-and technology orientation: Differences in learning and performance of software companies. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 17(1), 64-81.
- 48 citações - Kohtamäki, M., Vesalainen, J., Henneberg, S., Naudé, P., & Ventresca, M. J. (2012). Enabling relationship structures and relationship performance improvement: The moderating role of relational capital. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 41(8), 1298-1309.

2.29. Outros artigos significativos (mais citados) neste tema

- 106 citações - Kohtamäki, M., Partanen, J., Parida, V., & Wincent, J. (2013). Non-linear relationship between industrial service offering and sales growth: The moderating role of network capabilities. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 42(8), 1374-1385.
- 96 citações - Kohtamäki, M., Partanen, J., & Möller, K. (2013). Making a profit with R&D services—The critical role of relational capital. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 42(1), 71-81.

- 70 citações - Parida, V., Sjödin, D. R., Wincent, J., & Kohtamäki, M. (2014). Mastering the transition to product-service provision: Insights into business models, learning activities, and capabilities. *Research-Technology Management*, 57(3), 44-52.

2.30. Co-autores recorrentes

- Rodrigo Rabetino, Elina Varamäki, Jukka Vesalainen, Charlotta Sirén, Jukka Partanen (de acordo com o ResearchGate)

3. Estrutura do abstract (**contextualização**, **gap/lacuna**, **objetivo**, **metodologia**, resultados e conclusão)

The literature on servitization in the manufacturing context has grown rapidly. This study is the first systematic analysis of the paradigmatic assumptions of servitization research. Considering scientific research as a rhetorical activity, this study introduces the methodological approach to industrial marketing management research. This systematic review identifies both stylistic and structural aspects characterizing servitization research. The current review is based on a representative sample of 55 articles covering marketing, management, operations, innovation, and entrepreneurship research. The review discovered four paradigmatic assumptions that guide servitization research: 1) alignment to the Western narrative of constant development; 2) realist ontology; 3) positivist epistemology; and 4) managerialism. Following these findings, the study develops alternative directions for servitization research to challenge these paradigmatic dominances. The refined method of the model-narrative has the potential to generate insightful future research in the field of industrial marketing management. As an effective approach to analyzing research streams systematically, it facilitates critical meta-level reflection on servitization and could be widely applied beyond that topic.

4. Palavras-chaves e se foram citadas no abstract.

- O paper traz as seguintes palavras-chave que aparecem no abstract:
 - Servitization, Paradigmatic assumptions.
- O paper traz as seguintes palavras-chave que NÃO aparecem no abstract:
 - Manufacturing industry, Narrative analysis, Meta-analysis, Literature review.

5. Introdução e/ou revisão bibliográfica introdutória, afirmações / constatações (tipo) versus citações (essa lista pode ser longa, por isso coloquei em forma de tabela)

Afirmação / Constatação	Tipo (*1)	Referência (*2)
The transition of industrial companies towards increasingly service-dominant business models has been on the research agenda of industrial marketing since the late 1980s.	C	-
During the past decade, this research stream has grown from a niche topic into a broad cross- disciplinary research area as service-based strategies and business models have become increasingly common in different industries	C	(Turunen, 2013)
The term servitization, taken from the article by Vandermerwe and Rada (1988), has become an accepted label for this stream of research.	C	Vandermerwe and Rada (1988)

<p>Servitization studies typically either take the implementation view and consider the manufacturer's process of becoming an increasingly service focused business (e.g. Brax, 2005; Oliva & Kallenberg, 2003; Salonen, 2011), or analyze the different strategic options through the new types of offerings (e.g., integrated solutions) and roles (systems integrators) enabled by the service approach (Davies, Brady, & Hobday, 2007; Mathieu, 2001; Wise & Baumgartner, 1999).</p>	C	<p>(e.g. Brax, 2005; Oliva & Kallenberg, 2003; Salonen, 2011) (Davies, Brady, & Hobday, 2007; Mathieu, 2001; Wise & Baumgartner, 1999)</p>
<p>This study concentrates on the underlying paradigmatic assumptions that have developed within servitization research and influenced the progress of the field.</p>	G	-
<p>While some literature reviews of servitization have been conducted, they have rarely employed a critically oriented research approach.</p>	L	-
<p>Existing meta-analyses summarize the empirical research on servitization and concentrate on research themes, agendas, and methodologies, concepts, and managerial or technical expertise</p>	C	<p>(Antonacopoulou & Konstantinou, 2008; Baines, Lightfoot, Benedettini, & Kay, 2009; Beuren, Gomes Ferreira, & Cauchick Miguel, 2013; Gebauer, Ren, Valtakoski, & Reynoso, 2012; Grubic, 2014; Lightfoot, Baines, & Smart, 2013; Ostrom et al., 2010; Reim, Sjödin, Parida, & Persson, 2014; Tukker & Tischner, 2006; Velamuri, Neyer, & Möslin, 2011)</p>
<p>These previous reviews have not examined the paradigmatic assumptions of servitization research, although such discussion has emerged on related topics such as general service research and definitions (e.g. Araujo & Spring, 2006; Lovelock & Gummesson, 2004; Tronvoll, Brown, Gremler, & Edvardsson, 2011; Vargo & Lusch, 2008) and industrial networks (Peters, Pressey, Vanharanta, & Johnston, 2013).</p>	L	<p>(e.g. Araujo & Spring, 2006; Lovelock & Gummesson, 2004; Tronvoll, Brown, Gremler, & Edvardsson, 2011; Vargo & Lusch, 2008) (Peters, Pressey, Vanharanta, & Johnston, 2013).</p>
<p>Only a few recent studies have recognized the need to increase awareness of the basic assumptions underlying servitization research</p>	L	<p>(Finne, Brax, & Holmström, 2013; Kowalkowski, Windahl, Kindström, & Gebauer, 2015; Kowalkowski, Witell, & Gustafsson, 2013; Spring & Araujo, 2013)</p>

For instance, Finne et al. (2013) identified patterns of reversed servitization, and the study by Antonacopoulou and Konstantinou (2008) presented an analysis of the governing assumptions of the New Service Model.	C	Finne et al. (2013) Antonacopoulou and Konstantinou (2008)
More recently, the study by Kowalkowski et al. (2015) utilized the problematization method introduced by Alvesson and Sandberg (2011) to analyze the assumptions of the service transition concept.	C	Kowalkowski et al. (2015) Alvesson and Sandberg (2011)
Kowalkowski et al. (2015, p. 67) also encouraged scholars "not to uncritically accept the usual assumptions and blind spots in the discipline".	C	Kowalkowski et al. (2015, p. 67)
While starting the critical analysis of servitization related concepts these studies neither extensively discuss the paradigmatic assumptions behind servitization research nor suggest paradigmatic extensions.	L	-
As a relatively new stream of research (as exemplified by the rapid increase in the amount of published research within the last ten years), a reflective meta-analysis of servitization literature is both necessary and timely (Turunen, 2013, p. 7).	L	(Turunen, 2013, p. 7).
Therefore, to address this research gap, the present study investigates: What paradigmatic assumptions guide servitization research?	Questão de Pesquisa	-
This critical study contributes in three main areas. First, it is the first systematic review on the paradigmatic assumptions of servitization research, targeting the underlying basic assumptions in servitization studies. Second, by doing so, it identifies areas for paradigmatic extensions and alternative research topics for servitization researchers. Third, it introduces a new methodological concept, the model-narrative, for use in conducting critical reviews, which, in general, could be useful for industrial marketing scholars	J	-
In this study, we define the concept of paradigmatic assumption based on the writings of Burrell and Morgan (1979), Deetz (1996), Silverman (2010), and Alvesson and Sandberg (2011) as an underlying, meta-theoretical framework of acquiring, structuring and justifying the knowledge in the study field.	Resultados	Burrell and Morgan (1979), Deetz (1996), Silverman (2010), and Alvesson and Sandberg (2011)
These paradigmatic assumptions essentially guide the research settings and construct the objects of study in a given field and are	C	(Bazerman, 1988; Deetz, 1996; Myers, 1990)

discursive elements underpinning the production of scientific research		
A crucial part of this discursive production is “the role of rhetoric in the construction of knowledge claims and justification of research practices	C	(Shepherd & Challenger, 2013, p. 227)
Following this definition, we consider scientific writing to be a discursive and rhetorical activity connected to a certain meta-theoretical framework.	C	-
Within the meta-theoretical framework, researchers use various rhetorical strategies to promote acceptance of their ideas and findings, to secure interest in their work and to align with what is considered current, popular or acceptable in the field.	C	-
Influenced by their (often implicit) assumptions about the different actors involved in the publishing process, authors make choices in positioning and justifying their constructions	C	(Welch, Plakoyiannaki, Piekkari, & Paavilainen-Mäntymäki, 2013, p. 246)
Rhetorical performance is a fundamental element of knowledge creation in a discipline	C	(Gross, Harmon, & Reidy, 2002; Latour, 1987; Prelli, 1989)
The use of language in scholarly research is explicitly or implicitly dialogical: texts must gain acceptance and legitimation in the dialogical relationship between authors and their target audience.	C	-
Hence, authors must convince readers if they are to win the readers' acceptance	C	(Bazerman, 1988; deWaard, 2010; Gross et al., 2002)
This study employs the concept of the narrative to examine the rhetorical aspects of servitization research.	Metodologia	(Bazerman, 1988; Latour & Woolgar, 1986; Rouse, 1990)
The study outlines the methodological concept of the model-narrative based on prior approaches considering scientific texts as narratives.	Metodologia	-
This methodological concept is used to analyze how rhetorical issues are codified in one of the core products of academic research: the journal article, which has become “the canonical form for communicating original scientific results”	C	(Gross et al., 2002, p. 4)
This approach allows industrial marketing scholars to identify dominant paradigmatic assumptions and, by deconstructing them, enables servitization research to move towards “alternative paradigmatic directions” in the industrial context.	J	(Tronvoll et al., 2011, p. 562)

This analytical journey is structured as follows. First, the methodological concept of the model-narrative is explained.	Metodologia	-
Second, the selection methods employed to obtain a representative sample of servitization research articles are explained, and the narrative analysis producing the meta-synthesis is outlined.	Metodologia	-
Next, the model-narrative concept is utilized to structure and communicate the meta-level storyline systematically produced from this literature set.	Metodologia	-
This model narrative has three main parts that echo the different roles of the beginning, middle, and concluding sections in research articles.	Metodologia	-
The article concludes with critical observations of prior research on servitization and proposes alternative orientations for future research.	Metodologia	-

(*1) Tipos de afirmação / constatação: G (geral), C (contexto), J (justifica o artigo / pesquisa), L (**explicita a lacuna**). A constatação da lacuna é muito importante. Mas é difícil diferenciar J de L.; (*2) Inserir somente autor(es) e ano. A referência completa encontra-se no próprio artigo

6. Casos citados e principais características dos casos

- Apenas cita casos, sem oferecer detalhes dos casos, quando cita outros atores. As citações estão copiadas abaixo:
 - “Manufacturers such as Honeywell with its aerospace equipment, ABB with its power plant equipment, Siemens with its medical equipment, and GE with its jet engines and locomotives all produce assets so critical to customers' work...” (Allmendinger & Lombreglia, 2005,p. 132).
 - “Organizations such as IBM, General Electric, Xerox, Cannon and Parkersell have had a significant share of revenues and profits from services since the middle of 1990s...attributed to a shift from product to service...” (Martinez et al., 2010,p. 450).

7. Questão da pesquisa, Foco (escopo) e Objetivos (geral primário e secundários)

- Questões de pesquisa: “What paradigmatic assumptions guide servitization research?” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 90)
- Foco: “This study concentrates on the underlying paradigmatic assumptions that have developed within servitization research and influenced the progress of the field.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 90)
- Objetivos: To make “a reflective meta-analysis of servitization literature” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 90)

8. Qual o diferencial deste artigo (análise da revisão) com relação a outras revisões e/ou surveys? (segundo o autor, caso ele tenha citado). Avaliar uma por uma, caso o autor tenha feito isso. Pode montar uma tabela se for o caso.

O que fala de outros trabalhos	Trabalhos aos quais se refere
“While some literature reviews of servitization have been conducted, they have rarely employed a critically oriented research approach.”	-
“Existing meta-analyses summarize the empirical research on servitization and concentrate on research themes, agendas, and methodologies, concepts, and managerial or technical expertise”	(Antonacopoulou & Konstantinou, 2008; Baines, Lightfoot, Benedettini, & Kay, 2009; Beuren, Gomes Ferreira, & Cauchick Miguel, 2013; Gebauer, Ren, Valtakoski, & Reynoso, 2012; Grubic, 2014; Lightfoot, Baines, & Smart, 2013; Ostrom et al., 2010; Reim, Sjödin, Parida, & Persson, 2014; Tukker & Tischner, 2006; Velamuri, Neyer, & Möslein, 2011)
“These previous reviews have not examined the paradigmatic assumptions of servitization research, although such discussion has emerged on related topics such as general service research and definitions”	(e.g. Araujo & Spring, 2006; Lovelock & Gummesson, 2004; Tronvoll, Brown, Gremler, & Edvardsson, 2011; Vargo & Lusch, 2008)
“These previous reviews have not examined the paradigmatic assumptions of servitization research, although such discussion has emerged on related topics such as [...] industrial networks”	(Peters, Pressey, Vanharanta, & Johnston, 2013).
“Only a few recent studies have recognized the need to increase awareness of the basic assumptions underlying servitization research”	(Finne, Brax, & Holmström, 2013; Kowalkowski, Windahl, Kindström, & Gebauer, 2015; Kowalkowski, Witell, & Gustafsson, 2013; Spring & Araujo, 2013)
For instance, Finne et al. (2013) identified patterns of reversed servitization,	Finne et al. (2013)
and the study by Antonacopoulou and Konstantinou (2008) presented an analysis of the governing assumptions of the New Service Model.	Antonacopoulou and Konstantinou (2008)
More recently, the study by Kowalkowski et al. (2015) utilized the problematization method introduced by Alvesson and Sandberg (2011) to analyze the assumptions of the service transition concept. Kowalkowski et al. (2015, p. 67) also encouraged scholars “not to uncritically accept the usual assumptions and blind spots in the discipline”.	Kowalkowski et al. (2015)

9. Metodologia

9.1. Descrição Geral: Nome do(s) método(s); se é qualitativo, quantitativo ou combinação de ambos

- A seleção de artigos seguiu revisão sistemática da literatura, citando os seguintes autores: (Denyer & Tranfield, 2006; Tranfield, Denyer, & Smart, 2003). Complementou com snowballing.
- A análise dos artigos seguiu um método chamado de “Narrative analysis”

9.2. Período de análise das referências (publicações desde que ano)

- Não estabelece período de análise

9.3. Tamanho da amostra analisada

- +900 artigos reduzidos a 55 artigos

9.4. Quantidade de referências citadas

- 153 referências citadas

9.5. Foram realizadas observações complementares?

- Seguiu técnicas de snowballing e referências cruzadas para incluir mais artigos.

9.6. Fontes da revisão (casos, periódicos específicos, e quais bases de dados). Quais as justificativas para escolher essas fontes.

- 1a busca - Foco em “leading research”. Logo: “To ensure broad coverage, relevance, and good quality research both top-tier journals from the fields of marketing, organization studies, management and entrepreneurship (levels 3 and 4 in ABS 2010 ranking) and journals specifically targeted at the service-sector were included (Harvey, Kelly, Morris, & Rowlinson, 2010). The criteria led us to investigate content from 62 journals.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)
- 2a busca – “Next, the reference lists of all the selected articles were studied to identify additional articles in other journals beyond the original set (i.e., those not ranked as top-tier).” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)
- 3a busca – “Furthermore, the idea of snowballing was applied by examining the references of references (Greenhalgh et al., 2005, p. 420)” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)
- 4a busca – “Closer examination of the articles revealed that an author or authors who had written several articles on the subject were consistent in their approach and style. Thus, multiple articles from the same authors were included only if the contents of the articles differed in terms of the research question, background theory and methodology.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)
- 5a busca – “Finally, the list of articles was cross- checked against the 58 related articles reviewed by Baines et al. (2009), which led to two additional articles being identified” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)

9.7. Estratégia para construção da string de busca

- Utilizou as dimensões chave da servitização, as quais foram propostas por Baines, Lightfoot, Benedettini and Kay (2009, p. 548).

9.8. String de busca

- Service (Serv*) AND industry (Indust* OR Manuf*); AND transformation OR change OR transition OR transformation OR infusion OR adapting OR migration.

9.9. Filtros

- Filtro seguinte à 1ª busca: “Next, we examined the abstracts in detail, as we considered it best to evaluate all the papers manually instead of artificially limiting the search criteria. This fine-grained analysis revealed that most of the articles were not relevant for the purposes of the study: even when the words in the search strings included terms such as change, transition and transformation, most of the articles did not address these aspects of servitization. As a result, **studies that addressed topics relating to the service business in manufacturing, but did not address the process of strengthening the service focus were excluded** from further analysis. **The excluded studies focused** on topics such as contracting and governance, service categories or offerings, service networks, service productivity or revenue models, without any observable connection to issues related to organizational change.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)

9.10. Técnica / método de análise utilizada

- O método de análise é chamado de “Narrative analysis”. A seleção do método é justificada em uma seção inteira, concluindo o seguinte: “The methodological concept makes it possible to construct a meta-level synthesis of a generalized narrative identified in the literature within a research stream. This approach differs from standard literature reviews in two ways: 1) the researcher takes an active role: narratives are interpretative accounts reinterpreted by the narrative analyst (Riessman, 2002), and 2) the analysis does not just focus on the immediate or explicit notions such as themes and research agendas easily extractable from the articles, but instead probes beyond the data (Coffey & Atkinson, 1996). The model-narrative generated does not directly represent the narrative of a single study but reflects the underlying paradigmatic assumptions of a group of research articles, and is therefore suitable for the purposes of this study” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)
- As leituras utilizando este método de análise seguiram 4 padrões: “Thematic reading accounts for the different subject topics in the texts. Narrative reading concentrates on **the plot, tensions, story world, characters and voices**. Rhetorical reading identifies the discursive strategies and rhetorical devices of the researchers. Paradigmatic reading creates an understanding of the wider and underlying rules and conventions of scientific texts.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 91)

9.11. Metodologia para definição de pesquisas futuras

- Não cita metodologia para definição de pesquisas futuras.

10. Resultados

10.1. Quantidades resultantes antes e após cada filtro

- 1ª busca: +900 resultados

- Após filtro: 37 artigos de top-tier journals
- Após 2ª busca: 48 artigos
- Após 3ª busca: 53 artigos
- Após 4ª e 5ª busca: 55 artigos

10.2. Definições (resultantes da análise ou mesmo adotadas como premissas no início da publicação)

- NADA

10.3. Evolução da pesquisa / das publicações no assunto

- NADA

10.4. Comunidades / “tribos” / “igrejas”/ áreas de conhecimento / disciplinas identificadas

- NADA

10.5. Características de cada tribo (os atributos e/ou explicações são definidos pelo próprio artigo)

- NADA

10.6. Principais “achados” (*findings*)

- A estruturação da análise narrativa ofereceu os seguintes resultados

Table 2
Summary of structural and rhetorical elements in the narrative of servitization research.

Narrative elements	Preliminary narrative	Main narrative	Concluding narrative
Plot	Western manufacturers are losing competitive advantage to low-cost rivals.	Strong and visionary management can conquer the obstacles and reorient the company become a service-dominant business.	Manufacturers have chosen the right path but must maintain focus, and further research must convince them of this necessity.
Tension	The move from equilibrium to disequilibrium	Struggle to regain equilibrium	Affirmation of new equilibrium: explaining the struggle, validating the outcome and the threat of new disequilibrium
Setting	Global competition in manufacturing industries and good markets	The manufacturing company, its customers and close networks	The servitizing population of manufacturing firms; The academic of community of servitization research
Protagonists	Well-established manufacturers in developed economies	The visionary and persistent manager	Managers Researchers
Antagonists	Low-cost rivals in developing economies	Managers, company staff, and customers who do not understand the potential of servitization.	Internal: managers and company members who either lose focus or remain unconvinced of the promise of servitization; External: new industrial rivals entering the servitized offerings market
Discursive strategies	Polarization Authorization	Invalidation Managerialization	Verification Intimidation

(LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 95)

- A tabela gera os seguintes findings:
 - “Western manufacturing companies need to change from being product-based businesses towards offering bundled, integrated solutions of products and services. This need derives from the entry of low-cost rivals into manufacturing markets, which causes disequilibrium in the current state of being. In this situation, the Western manufacturer must eliminate this outdated product-

based business and identify a more attractive service-based business verified by various authorities (customers, advanced industrial companies, academics). However, for the manufacturer, this change is not simple but difficult and challenging. Still, with the proper management, the manufacturer may overcome these problems and achieve the successful delivery of integrated solutions. Through this operation, Western manufacturers will achieve a new equilibrium. However, the new equilibrium will not last long, particularly if the company does not constantly nurture the solution business logic. Thus, we conclude that paradigmatic patterns are identified in the multidisciplinary stream of servitization literature in the ways authors build the storylines of their articles and utilize rhetorical devices.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 96)

- Findings após análise detalhada:
 - “(i) this narrative (a common set of narrative setting elements, players and discursive strategies to convince their target audience of the benefits of servitization) has become institutionalized in this research field” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 96)
 - “(ii) clearly, servitization researchers more or less implicitly address their texts to an audience of Western readers and write from a Western manufacturing point of view.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 96)
 - “(iii) servitization research is based on a realist ontology: the ‘secrets of servitization’ are treated as separate entities or ‘truths out there’, yet to be revealed by researchers.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 96)
 - “(iv) servitization research is connected to a positivist epistemology in which servitization is seen to consist of universal laws or models that refer to change as a linear and planned process.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 96)
 - “(v) authors focus on managers as the focal actors (protagonists) contributing to the regeneration of the manufacturing firm. If and when servitization is about manufacturers developing universal capabilities to offer integrated solutions, then the central action role is the one of managers.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 97)

10.7. Outros tópicos que não foram tratados aqui (sugestão para nova meta-informação ou resultados significativos)

- NADA

10.8. Proposições de pesquisas futuras (geral)

- Em relação à metodologia empregada: “Therefore, we conclude that the model-narrative is a promising approach for conducting meta-theoretical research in and beyond industrial marketing and management. Because we identified such a strong and institutionalized meta-narrative in servitization research, we argue that other research streams will benefit from similar critical research. Thus, we invite researchers to shape and implement this approach and encourage them to extend the use of the model-narrative approach beyond servitization research in different research streams connected with industrial marketing and management.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 97)

- “Is the servitization phenomenon characteristic to OEM (original equipment manufacturers) companies of Western origin, or does it concern a wider set of organizations? Thus, answering that question would involve researching “idiosyncrasies around manufacturing in developing countries” (Gebauer et al., 2012, p. 127) and complementing it with comparative research that makes servitization in ‘developing countries’ visible. Such research could validate, diversify and enrich existing knowledge.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 97)
- “Existing research represents servitization as a solution for companies. Future research could adopt a critical stance and investigate whether companies adopt a servitization agenda when under threat, or to what extent this experience of competition is down to the rhetorical strategy of polarization. Is servitization associated with market maturity and commoditization or are there other reasons for it? Has servitization been a successful strategy for all the companies that have pursued it? Supposing the manufacturing industry is not one category, but includes a variety of different organizations, we might then ask: what kind of manufacturing companies might benefit from this type of strategy? To produce convincing answers, a critical realist would demand research designs that objectively assess the ‘problem state’ faced prior to servitization, and apply longitudinal or follow-up designs to investigate the impact of the service dominant approach. Because many of these studies are based on selected successful cases, researches should investigate larger populations of companies to be able to identify possible counter-evidence and alternative explanations.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 97)
- “Servitization studies should evaluate the role of the manager in the research design and context more critically – and ask what else is needed besides managerial action. Critical studies should investigate whether the transition to a service-dominant business takes place as a planned strategic organizational transformation, or whether it might unfold as an emergent, path-dependent process. What is the role of external factors in explaining servitization success and failure? What about contextual factors such as the market situation and disruptions? In addition to shifting the focus from the Western to a global context, we would encourage a shift of focus at the company level beyond the managers and taking a closer look at the ‘complementary voices’ of customers as well as employees on both sides of service exchange.” (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 97)

10.9. Contribuições (para academia / prática / ambas?)

- Contribuições para a academia: “This critical study contributes in three main areas. First, it is the first systematic review on the paradigmatic assumptions of servitization research, targeting the underlying basic assumptions in servitization studies. Second, by doing so, it identifies areas for paradigmatic extensions and alternative research topics for servitization researchers. Third, it introduces a new methodological concept, the model-narrative, for use in conducting critical reviews, which, in general, could be useful for industrial marketing scholars”. (LUOTO; BRAX; KOHTAMÄKI, 2017, p. 90)
- Não há contribuições explícitas para a prática.

11. Conclusões

11.1. Trabalhos futuros (que o autor se propõe, diferente das proposições futuras)

- NADA
- 11.2. Limitações
- O autor não explicita as limitações do trabalho

12. SUA ANÁLISE

12.1. Pontos fortes

- Dentre os artigos que foram atribuídos a mim, achei este o artigo com maior fundamentação metodológica e descrição detalhada dos procedimentos seguidos.
- A estruturação do texto é clara, fluida e passa de forma objetiva a mensagem do texto.
- Os findings fazem muito sentido quando associados aos métodos empregados e é possível entender de forma clara como o método foi executado pelos pesquisadores.

12.2. Pontos fracos

- Ao mesmo tempo que a metodologia é forte, o artigo traz a necessidade de 5 buscas distintas e fracamente justificáveis para os artigos que serão incluídos na análise. Isso me dá a impressão de que o autor tinha artigos que gostaria de incluir na análise, os quais não resultaram da busca inicial e, por isso, foram “criadas” as 5 buscas para justificar essa inclusão.
- Além disso, a metodologia não é replicável. Isso não é exatamente um ponto que merece destaque, dado que nenhuma das revisões de literatura que vimos até então segue um método de análise replicável, e, definitivamente, não desmerece a estruturação metodológica do artigo. Mas isso reforça como é difícil garantir replicabilidade dos trabalhos acadêmicos na área.
- O trabalho se baseia exclusivamente na análise de outras publicações, as quais têm influências pessoais dos autores e podem não necessariamente refletir a necessidade do mercado.

12.3. Sugestões para melhoria do artigo

- Acredito que os resultados obtidos da análise teórica poderiam ser verificados com informações de mercado, retirando, assim, o viés “literário” do trabalho.
- Os autores poderiam colocar algumas informações de forma mais explícita, como objetivo, limitações do trabalho, entre outros. O texto é fluído, mas, às vezes, algumas informações que deveriam ser destaque requerem uma leitura mais atenta para serem identificadas.

13. Figuras ou tabelas importantes (caso você queira copiar e citar nos tópicos anteriores)

- A tabela que foi necessária foi posicionada dentro do tópico para facilitar o relacionamento de seu conteúdo com o texto.