

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

# Journal of CO<sub>2</sub> Utilization



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/jcou

# Microbial electrosynthesis of carboxylic acids through CO<sub>2</sub> reduction with selectively enriched biocatalyst: Microbial dynamics



## J. Annie Modestra<sup>1</sup>, S. Venkata Mohan<sup>1,\*</sup>

Bioengineering and Environmental Sciences Lab, EEFF Department, CSIR-Indian Institute of Chemical Technology (CSIR-IICT), Hyderabad 500 007, India

## A R T I C L E I N F O

# ABSTRACT

Keywords: CO<sub>2</sub> sequestration Chronoamperometry Volatile fatty acids (VFA) Heat pretreatment Microbial electrochemical technology Microbial electrosynthesis is an emerging strategy of transforming CO<sub>2</sub> into valuable chemicals by exploiting the capabilities of bacteria. As biocatalyst is considered as prime factor in bioelectrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction, we used an enrichment technique comprising of heat pretreatment of parent inoculum followed by enrichment under gas mixture of H2 and CO2. Here, we use a double chambered bioelectrochemical system (BESH) wherein cathode chamber was inoculated with enriched acetogenic (homoacetogenic) bacteria, subsequently polarized with voltage of -0.8 V vs Ag/AgCl (s). BES<sub>H</sub> operation resulted in synthesis of carboxylic acids/volatile fatty acids (VFA), with major proportion confined to production of acetic acid (12.57 mM) with a maximum current density of 650  $\pm$  50 mA/m<sup>2</sup> generated in response to applied voltage. While in the previous study, BES<sub>C</sub> (untreated) depicted comparatively low yield of acetic acid (3.19 mM). A maximum of 67% reduction in bicarbonate concentration and columbic efficiency of 38% was noticed signifying the utilization of inorganic carbon for bio-electrochemical synthesis of acetic acid. Efficiency of BES was also discussed in terms of energy discharge. Few signals were obtained on voltammetric signature at various potentials which might correspond to the redox potential of cytochromes, flavo proteins and Fe-S proteins suggesting their involvement as electron carriers during microbial electrosynthesis. Phylogenetic analysis was comparatively made between untreated and heat treated enriched bacteria which revealed members belonging to Clostridiaceae dominant in heat treated inoculum, while methanogens appeared in untreated inoculum. Selective enrichment of biocatalyst proves to be advantageous for CO2 reduction in BES which yielded high productivity of carboxylic acids in comparison to untreated biocatalyst.

#### 1. Introduction

Although  $CO_2$  is considered as a green house gas, the potential benefits offered by  $CO_2$  are driving the research towards using it as a valuable resource [1–3]. Microbial electrosynthesis (MES) research finds the utilization of  $CO_2$  as substrate to synthesize multi carbon organic chemicals [4]. MES or bioelectrochemical system (BES) uses biologically driven electrode potential as a source of reducing equivalents replacing the external supply of hydrogen [1,5–8]. BES comprises of various components viz., biocatalyst, electrode materials, reactor configuration, membrane etc. which play a key role in determining its performance. Among all these components, microbial community/ biocatalyst can be considered as corner stone in BES, as they promote biochemical reactions for utilizing  $CO_2$  to synthesize multi-carbon organic chemicals.

Studies were carried out using pure/single strain as well as mixed microbial population in BES [6,9–21]. However, adequate knowledge is

required in understanding the mixed microbial community and its interactions towards electro-synthesizing green chemicals. A special group of bacteria is able to sequester or uptake  $CO_2$  anaerobically and chemolithoautotrophically which thereby synthesizes value added chemicals/products with hydrogen as an electron donor [5]. Enrichment of specific group of bacteria for utilizing  $CO_2$  as substrate for high yield of desired products is therefore of high importance in microbial electrosynthesis. Homoacetogenic bacteria are the notable bacteria to date in diverse MES experiments for their ability in fixing  $CO_2$  [9,11,19,22,23].

Pretreatment of microbial population is a key step in developing a homoacetogenic bacterial community. Various methods of pretreatment generally suppress the growth of methanogenic bacteria that essentially utilize  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$  for their growth and synthesize methane [24,25]. Choice of pretreatment method need to be optimized to validate the sustenance of methanogenic inhibitory effect on mixed bacterial community. The bacterial population resulted after pretreat-

\* Corresponding author.

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jcou.2017.05.011

Received 9 March 2017; Received in revised form 8 May 2017; Accepted 12 May 2017 Available online 01 June 2017 2212-9820/ © 2017 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

E-mail address: vmohan\_s@yahoo.com (S.V. Mohan).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Academy of Scientific and Innovative Research (AcSIR).

ment will be selectively enriched where various procedures exist to grow and develop a homoacetogenic bacterial community by subjecting to a gas mixture of H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> [26–30]. After successful growth in anaerobic conditions, the enriched culture will be used as biocatalyst at cathode. The most studied metabolic pathway for CO<sub>2</sub> utilization is the Wood-Ljungdahl/acetyl-CoA pathway where homoacetogens (acetogens) would synthesize acetate through a cascade of steps [31,32]. Members of *Clostridiaceae* are popular acetogens that aid in the synthesis of carboxylic acids, in which acetate production is dominated. Acetogens are versatile and are capable of growing at mesophilic, thermophilic and psychrophilic range of temperature conditions [29]. Some of them have flagella, spore formation capability and can be either Gram negative or Gram positive. Exploration of various bacteria is needed which would bring a dramatic change in the performance of BES/MES in fixing CO<sub>2</sub> for the synthesis of multi-organic chemicals.

Keeping in view about the role of microbiome in BES system, we designed the present study by choosing heat pretreatment for enriching acetogens and suppressing methanogenic bacteria for bioelectrochemical reduction of  $CO_2$  towards synthesis of multi-carbon organic acids. Bacterial community structure is identified for pre and post enrichment inoculum and is comparatively analyzed with control BES operation (previous study, [9]). Bio-electrochemical circuitry responsible for electron transfer and potential of BES in terms of energy discharge is also studied and discussed.

#### 2. Materials and methods

#### 2.1. Biocatalyst

### 2.1.1. Selective enrichment of homoacetogenic bacteria (biocathode)

Selective enrichment of homoacetogenic bacteria was carried out in two stages. During stage-I, anaerobic consortia acquired originally from full scale anaerobic bioreactor treating wastewater was used as parent inoculum. This was subjected to heat pretreatment by heating at 80 °C for 2 h to enrich acidogenic bacteria and to suppress non-spore forming hydrogen consuming methanogenic bacteria coexisting in bacterial consortia [25,33]. Methanogenic bacteria, if present would redirect the metabolic pathway towards methane production upon consuming most of the available reducing equivalents. During stage-II, enrichment of homoacetogens was conducted by growing the bacteria resulted from stage-I in serum bottles (200 ml) filled with 120 ml of designed synthetic wastewater (DSW: KH<sub>2</sub>PO<sub>4</sub>: 0.25 g/l, K<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub>: 0.25 g/l, NH<sub>4</sub>Cl: 0.5 g/l, MgCl<sub>2</sub>: 0.3 g/l, CoCl<sub>2</sub>: 25 mg/l, ZnCl<sub>2</sub>: 11.5 mg/l, CuCl<sub>2</sub>: 10.5 mg/l, CaCl<sub>2</sub>: 5 mg/l, MnCl<sub>2</sub>: 15 mg/l, NiSO<sub>4</sub>: 0.16 g/l, FeCl<sub>3</sub>: 0.03 g/l, yeast extract: 0.5 g/l) and subjecting to a head space gas mixture of CO2:H2 (20:80) [9]. Addition of yeast extract exerts a stimulatory effect on the growth of autotrophic acetogens subjected to CO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub> environment [28]. Bacteria were grown by incubating at 30 °C in rotary shakers maintained at 100 rpm.

#### 2.1.2. Anodic biocatalyst

Anode chamber of BES was inoculated with anaerobic untreated parent inoculum as biocatalyst enriched in DSW excluding yeast extract. As a source of carbon, 1.5 g/l of glucose was supplemented for the growth and metabolism of bacteria.

#### 2.2. Design of bioelectrochemical system

A double chambered BES was designed and fabricated using Schott-Duran glass bottles with a total/working volume of 2.5/2.01 [9]. BES consisted of an anode and a cathode chamber separated by a proton exchange membrane (PEM: Nafion 117, Sigma–Aldrich). Prior to use, NAFION 117 was pretreated by boiling sequentially in 30% H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, followed by deionized water (pH 7.0), 0.5 M H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and deionized water each for 1 h to increase the porosity and activate the sulfonated groups responsible for proton transfer. Non-catalyzed graphite plates were used as electrodes at both anode and cathode chambers to aid surface catalyzed microbial electron transfer reactions. Prior to use, graphite electrodes were pretreated using 0.1 N HCl to eliminate impurities and enable the active reactive sites on electrode surface. Copper wires were used to establish contact with electrodes as current collectors. The electrodes were completely submerged in anolyte and catholyte respectively and mixing was enabled with the aid of magnetic stirrers. Proper leak proof sealing was employed to ensure anaerobic environment at both the chambers.

#### 2.3. Operation

A two phase experimental methodology was employed for the bioelectrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to carboxylic acids using BES. During phase-I, selective enrichment of homoacetogenic bacteria was carried out and was subsequently used as cathodic biocatalyst. Experimental operation at phase-II was carried out in BES using enriched biocatalyst at cathode and parent inoculum at anode chamber respectively. BES was operated chronoamperometrically with a polarized potential of -0.8 V (vs Ag/AgCl (S)) using a potentiostatgalvanostat system (Biologic VMP3). pH of catholyte was set to 8.5 using 1 N HCl/NaOH. Uniform distribution of carbon source was ensured by allowing mixing of catholyte with the aid of magnetic stirrer. CO<sub>2</sub> as sole carbon source was supplemented in the form of sodium bicarbonate to the catholyte consisting of DSW. In the case of anode chamber, untreated parent inoculum was used as biocatalyst with glucose as carbon source. Initially, pH of the anolyte was set to 6 using 1 N HCl/NaOH. The reducing equivalents generated through the metabolic activity of anodic bacteria will be driven towards cathode with the aid of applied potential for the reduction of  $CO_2$  into carboxylic acids. Drop in carboxylic acids concentration (acetic acid) and reductive catalytic currents were used as indicators for feed change. Experiment was carried out in fed batch mode with each cycle operated for a retention time of 72 h. The experimental results of BES<sub>H</sub> (BES operated with heat treated and enriched inoculum) in present study is compared with BES<sub>C</sub> (BES operated with untreated and enriched inoculum) reported during previous study [9]. Results during enrichment and phylogenetic analysis were discussed for BES<sub>H</sub>, BES<sub>B</sub> (BES operated with BESA treated and enriched inoculum), BES<sub>C</sub> along with C<sub>En</sub> (control inoculum which is untreated but enriched) and H<sub>En</sub> (heat treated and enriched inoculum).

#### 2.4. Bio-electrochemical analysis

The biochemical behavior of biocatalyst was studied at respective time intervals. Change in pH was monitored by pH meter. Carboxylic acids profile was analyzed using high performance liquid chromatography (HPLC; Shimadzu LC10A) employing UV-Vis detector (210 nm) and C18 reverse phase column (250  $\times$  4.6 mm diameter; 5  $\mu$ m particle size; flow-rate: 0.5 ml/h) with mobile phase of 40% acetonitrile in 1 mN H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> (pH, 2.5–3.0). Twenty  $\mu$ l of filtered sample (0.22  $\mu$ porosity) was injected to column for analysis. Gas consumption during enrichment stage of experiments was monitored using Gas Chromatography (NUCON 5765) with thermal conductivity detector (TCD) and Heysep O column  $(1/8" \times 2 m)$  employing Argon as carrier gas. The injector and detector were maintained at 60 °C each and the oven was operated at 40 °C isothermally. Reduction in bicarbonate concentration was estimated according to standard methods [34]. Bioelectrochemical behavior of BES system in terms of reductive catalytic currents, energy discharge and charge in coulombs was analyzed through chronoamperometry (CA) technique using a potentiostatgalvanostat system (Biologic VMP3 model). In addition, variation in redox catalytic currents, electron discharge phenomenon and involvement of redox mediators as electron carriers was studied by performing cyclic voltammetry (CV) and derivative cyclic voltammetry (DCV) at a scan rate of 10 mV/s vs Ag/AgCl (S).

#### 2.5. Microbial inventory

Bacterial dynamics of biocathodes along with selectively enriched bacteria with respect to parent inoculum was analyzed through PCR-DGGE by collecting the samples prior and post operation of BES reactors. Total genomic DNA was extracted using Soil Kit (Macherey-Nagel) following the manufacturer's protocol, and the V3 region of 16s rRNA coding gene [primer 341F, 50-CCTACGGGAGGCAGCAG-30; primer 517R, 50-ATTACCGCGGCTGCTGG-30; GC clamp added to primer is 40 bp clamp 50-GCCCGGGGCGCGC CCC GGGCGGGGGGGG GGGCACGGGGGG-30] was amplified using 341F, 517R and 341 FGC primers, with 40 bp of GC repeats added to 5' end of 341 FGC primer. PCR product was purified using Oiagen PCR purification kit and subjected to denaturing gradient analysis to evaluate the shifts/ diversity in microbial community. A denaturing gradient of 40-60% was executed to separate the amplified 16S rDNA fragments by carrying out electrophoresis at a constant voltage of 80 V for 8 h at 60 °C. The gel images were captured using a Molecular Imager G: BOX EF System (Syngene International Ltd.). Selected bands from all the samples were excised with a sterile pipette tip. The excised gel was incubated over night at 4 °C in 50 µl sterile distilled water. DNA from these overnight incubated samples was used as template for PCR amplification using 341F and 517R primers. Amplified PCR products after purification (Fermentas) were sent for sequencing. All the 16S rDNA partial sequences were subjected to BLASTN to identify the nearest taxa. These sequences were further aligned with closest matches found in the GenBank database (http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/) using CLUSTAL X. Phylogenetic trees were constructed using neighbor-joining methods using MEGA6 software.

#### 3. Results and discussion

#### 3.1. Phase I- Enrichment of homoacetogenic bacteria

Fig. 1 illustrates the decrement in headspace gas represented in percentage as an average for ten cycles with each cycle comprising a total retention time of 60 h. A maximum of 57%  $H_2$  and 62%  $CO_2$  reduction was observed in  $H_{En}$  during enrichment which depicts the consumption of headspace gas for their metabolism towards acetogenesis (homoacetogenesis). Decrement in headspace gas was presumed to be an indicator for the enrichment of homoacetogens and the growth was determined by monitoring the gas consumption profiles with respect to time analyzed through gas chromatography. This enriched culture was subsequently used for microbial electro synthesis reaction



Fig. 1. Enrichment of homoacetogens depicted in terms of gas consumption.



Fig. 2. (a) Bicarbonate reduction in percentage and acetic acid production represented in mM for single cycle operation (b) Maximum bicarbonate removal and acetic acid production represented for each fed batch cycle.

in cathode chamber. In the case of  $C_{En}$ , a maximum consumption of 58%  $H_2$  and 49%  $CO_2$  was noticed [9]. Marginal variation observed in gas consumption profiles of  $H_{En}$  and  $C_{En}$  might be attributed to the favorable conditions for growth of methanogens and homoacetogens in the presence of  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$ . The same was depicted in phylogenetic analysis, which showed the members related to homoacetogens in  $H_{En}$ , while  $C_{En}$  showed the presence of diverse bacteria along with methanogenic bacteria.

#### 3.2. Phase II-microbial electrosynthesis

#### 3.2.1. Acetic acid synthesis

Fig. 2 depicts maximum acetic acid productivity for five cycles of operation represented post optimization. BES<sub>H</sub> resulted in a maximum acetic acid production of 12.57 mM (3.01 g/l) during microbial electrosynthesis reaction catalyzed by enriched biocatalyst. While in the case of BES<sub>C</sub> (0.9 g/l), comparatively low productivity of acetic acid was noticed than  $BES_{H}$  [9]. This might be due to the effective enrichment of biocatalyst (homoacetogens), which direct the reducing equivalents towards acetic acid production rather than methane production. Opting for alkaline pH and inoculum pretreatment lead to the production of desirable acetic acid and not methane [35]. Fig. 2a represents the acetic acid productivity with respect to time for one cycle (taken as average for 5 cycles). Acetic acid production was initiated from 12 h of operation and was observed to increase gradually till 60 h followed by a decrement at 72 h of operation. This might be ascribed to the bio-electrochemical reaction aided by biocatalyst towards utilization of bicarbonate for synthesis of acetic acid. A decrement observed in acetic acid concentration can be attributed to the consumption of acetic acid as carbon source by other bacteria co-existing in mixed population



**Fig. 3.** (a) Change in pH and volatile fatty acid (VFA)/carboxylic acids generation during single cycle operation (b) Maximum total VFA production, pH drop and other VFA production represented for each fed batch cycle.

along with the enriched homoacetogenic bacteria.

#### 3.2.2. Total carboxylic acids

Although the biocatalyst used at biocathode is enriched homoacetogenic bacteria, study depicted the bio-electrochemical synthesis of a mixture of carboxylic acids upon CO<sub>2</sub>/bicarbonate reduction. Fig. 3 illustrates the synthesis of a mixture of carboxylic acids during BES<sub>H</sub> operation. A gradual increment in concentration of carboxylic acids was noticed till 60 h followed by a decrement at 72 h. The decrement in carboxylic acids concentration might be due to the utilization of C2-C4 compounds as carbon source by other bacteria co-existing in mixed population or utilization for the synthesis of other compounds viz., alcohols (not analyzed during the study). A total of 3.72 g/l of carboxylic acids were bioelectrochemically synthesized by utilizing bicarbonate as sole carbon source along with an applied potential acting as driving force for directing the reducing equivalents. On the contrary, BES<sub>C</sub> (control) synthesized a total of 1.2 g/l carboxylic acids which is comparatively lower than BES<sub>H</sub>, depicting the role of enriched biocatalyst as an effective inducer towards high productivity of carboxylic acids. Among the mixture of carboxylic acids synthesized in BES<sub>H</sub>, acetic acid concentration was high followed by butyric and propionic acids. This is in congruence with the enrichment adopted during the study, wherein the major population of bacteria was homoacetogens which would specifically direct the metabolism towards acetic acid synthesis by utilizing CO2/bicarbonate as carbon source. A total of 0.62 g/l of butyric acid and 0.09 g/l of propionic acid were synthesized during BES<sub>H</sub> operation. Production of butyric (C4) and propionic acids (C3) might have been either due to the activity of other bacteria capable of synthesizing butyrate/propionate or the elongation of C2 compounds (acetic acid) towards C3 and C4 compounds. It is also to be noted that the presence of bicarbonate enhances VFA synthesis during anaerobic conditions by maintaining optimal pH, as bicarbonate acts as a buffering agent as well [36]. Synthesis of C2–C4 compounds through C1 (CO<sub>2</sub>/bicarbonate) reduction seemed to be advantageous which would aid in reducing CO<sub>2</sub> concentration as well as synthesizing high value chemicals in a bio-electrochemical route.

#### 3.2.3. Bicarbonate reduction

The sole carbon source used during the study is sodium bicarbonate which will be utilized chemoautotrophically by the enriched homoacetogenic bacteria [26]. Initially 20 mM of bicarbonate was supplemented and the concentration was observed to decrease with the increase in time for each cycle operation. Samples were collected at regular time intervals for each cycle operation to monitor the changes in bicarbonate concentration. Fig. 2 represents the increase in bicarbonate reduction percentage for five cycles along with the decrement in concentration at regular time intervals during one cycle operation. A maximum of 68% reduction in bicarbonate concentration was depicted during BES<sub>H</sub> operation which signifies the utilization of bicarbonate as inorganic carbon substrate by biocatalyst towards microbial electrosynthesis of carboxylic acids. While in the case of BES<sub>C</sub> (control), bicarbonate reduction was only 28% which is relatively lower than BES<sub>H.</sub> This might be attributed to the well enriched chemolithoautotrophic homoacetogenic bacteria in utilizing bicarbonate in BES<sub>H</sub>. Besides this, bicarbonate reduction was also monitored with respect to time in BES<sub>H.</sub> which was observed to increase gradually till the end of cycle. Prevalence of alkaline range of pH also favored dissolution of bicarbonate in catholyte which in turn aided in the utilization of bicarbonate for carboxylic acids synthesis [9]. Bicarbonate also acts as electron acceptor which seemed to be reduced bioelectrochemically towards the targeted carboxylic acids synthesis in the present study.

#### 3.2.4. pH

pH determines the redox behavior of system, since the metabolism of biocatalyst is regulated by variation in pH. Initially BES<sub>H</sub> was operated at alkaline pH of 8.5 and the variation in pH was monitored at regular time intervals (Fig. 3). pH was observed to decrease gradually with time till 60 h. Thereafter, an increment in pH was noticed at 72 h. This variation in pH is in congruence with the bio-electrochemical synthesis of carboxylic acids. Increment in pH noticed after 60 h is attributed to the utilization of carboxylic acids as substrate by bacteria, which causes a rise in extracellular pH in BES<sub>H</sub> system environment [35]. A maximum drop in pH was observed in BES<sub>H</sub> during cycle-3 which is noticed to be 6.98, However, variation in pH is not below 6.98 (nearly 7) in  $BES_H$  maintaining a buffered environment for the production of carboxylic acids. Optimal pH regulation in the presence of bicarbonate, which acts as a buffering agent might have contributed for bio-electrosynthesis of carboxylic acids maintaining a buffered environment. On the contrary, less pH drop (7.82) was observed in BES<sub>C</sub>, which is in correlation with low yield of carboxylic acids and less reduction in bicarbonate concentration.

#### 3.3. Chronoamperometric currents generation

A polarized voltage of -0.8 V (vs Ag/AgCl (S)) was chronoamperometrically employed on working electrode (biocathode) of BES to evaluate the generation of reductive catalytic currents (RC) in response to applied potential. RC were recorded for every 300 s during the polarized conditions. Fig. 4a represents the evolution of current density (CD) which is observed to increase with each additional cycle operation. The current density profiles reported in Fig. 4 are drawn post optimization of BES<sub>H</sub> operated for atleast 10 cycles. Initially, CD was observed to be -250 mA/m<sup>2</sup> which successively progressed to -600 mA/m<sup>2</sup> by second cycle and remained more or less similar for the next consecutive cycles. This shows the acclimatized nature of the enriched biocatalyst in synthesizing carboxylic acids inclined with the



**Fig. 4.** (a) Chronoamperometry profiles illustrating the response current generation and charge in coulombs derived at an applied voltage of -0.8 V vs Ag/AgCl (s). Inset figure indicates the current generation profile over a period of 24 h (Arrow mark indicates feed change) (b) Chronoamperometry profiles illustrating the current generation and energy generation in the form of energy discharge (ED) in W.h derived at an applied voltage of -0.8 V vs Ag/AgCl (s).

polarized potential, nutrient medium and pH conditions. Thereafter, a maximum CD of  $-720 \text{ mA/m}^2$  was noticed during third cycle. Successive increment in current density during BES operation is an indicator of increased biofilm formation on electrode surface that catalyzes the bioelectrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction towards more yield of carboxylic acids electrotrophically. Whereas operation of BES<sub>C</sub>, was able to generate a maximum of  $-250 \pm 30 \text{ mA/m}^2$  of RC which is comparatively lower than BES<sub>H</sub>. This is in congruence with the enriched bacterial community in BES<sub>H</sub> that would accept the reducing equivalents via surface catalyzed bioelectrochemical CO2 reduction. While in the case of BES<sub>C</sub> microbiome community was different which might utilize the reducing equivalents towards undesirable metabolites synthesis or for interspecies electron transfer among the diverse microbiome. Besides CA analysis, columbic efficiency (CE) was calculated for BES<sub>H</sub> and was found to be 38% higher than  $BES_{C}$  (15%). This is in congruence with bicarbonate reduction and utilization of reducing equivalents towards the synthesis of acetic acid.

#### 3.3.1. Electron storage

In addition to CD evolution, the amount of charge which depicts the number of electrons passed during bioelectrochemical reduction reactions was monitored [37]. The observed charge profiles depict the amount of coulombs utilized during bio-electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction towards carboxylic acids synthesis. A progressive increment in the amount of electrons utilized was observed in BES<sub>H</sub> which was -3 C during first cycle, which increased up to -10 C during third cycle. On

the contrary,  $\text{BES}_{\text{C}}$  depicted a maximum charge of -3 C during the complete bioelectrochemical reduction reaction. The observed results are in congruence with bicarbonate reduction and acetic acid productivity, which indicates the bacterial community of biofilm consisting of enriched biocatalyst in  $\text{BES}_{\text{H}}$  in utilizing the reducing equivalents.

#### 3.3.2. Energy discharge

More traditionally, BES was always discussed in terms of current density evolution and the number of electrons supplied during bioelectrochemical reduction reactions. However, BES operated either potentiostatically/galvanostatically can also generate power portraying the potential of bioelectrochemical circuitry. In terms of a chemical fuel cell/battery, energy discharge represents the amount of energy that can be discharged under polarized potential/current conditions [38]. Generally, the factor energy discharge is dependent on two parameters which are applied voltage and responsive current density [38]. In the case of BES, which involves bio-electrochemical circuitry, the effective capabilities of biocatalyst in addition to the aforementioned parameters will be considered to determine the efficiency of BES. Fig. 4b represents the energy discharge obtained during BES<sub>H</sub> operation potentiostatically, which generates current in response to an applied voltage of -0.8 V (vs Ag/AgCl (S)). In addition, the energy discharge can also be evaluated by considering the input voltage (polarized reduction potential) and the response current generation. With the increase in current density in response to applied voltage, the energy discharge also increased progressively. A maximum of 0.0025 W h (equivalent to 9000 mJ/energy) was recorded during BES<sub>H</sub> operation, while it was 0.0009 W h for BES<sub>C</sub>. This shows the efficiency of BES in not only sequestering CO<sub>2</sub>, but also in generating energy under an applied voltage of -0.8 V with a response current density. The efficiency of generating the bio-electrochemically derived power proves that BES posses inherent advantageous over conventional electrochemical techniques, which does not need regeneration of catalysts.

#### 3.4. Bio-electrochemistry

Cyclic voltammetry (CV) analysis was performed for  $BES_H$  to elucidate the redox catalytic currents generation as well as the involvement of electron carriers in a scan window of -1.0 to +1.0 V at a scan rate of 10 mV/s. CV depicted simultaneous oxidation and reduction behavior where the redox catalytic currents were appeared to be -3.9 mA and 3.89 mA (Fig. 5). This might be due to the regulated transfer and acceptance of electrons at working electrode from counter electrode under the polarized environment. Capacitance noticed in the



Fig. 5. Cyclic Voltammogram at a scan rate of 10 mV/s depicting the presence of electron carriers in the form of peaks in a scan window of  $E_i = -1.0$  V and  $E_f = 1.0$  V vs Ag/AgCl (S).

voltammogram might be attributed to the transient currents generated due to the electrochemical activity of electrode in addition to faradic activity by microbial catalyst. In addition, biofilm formed on electrode surface holds biochemical and electrochemical charge carriers within, that might contribute for capacitance and might be have functional advantageous as capacitive biocathode. A maximum exchange current density (ECD) of  $0.2 \text{ A/m}^2$  per electrode surface was observed throughout oxidation and reduction reactions observed during CV analysis. This represents the number of electrons exchanged for carrying out oxidation and reduction reactions for the microbial electrosynthesis of carboxylic acids through CO<sub>2</sub> reduction. Two reversible peaks and a quasi reversible peak were observed during both oxidation and reduction scans depicting their role in electron transfer during oxidation and reduction. The peaks were observed at -0.261 V, -0.696 V, 0.29 V, -0.459 V, 0.59 V vs Ag/AgCl (S). The obtained peak potentials were tailored against standard redox potentials which will result in the identification of electron carriers participated during the bioelectrochemical reduction. The redox mediators detected at these potentials are identified to be cytochromes, flavo proteins, nitrates and cytochrome complexes. Cytochromes are the membrane bound proteins which are commonly associated with most kind of bacteria. These help in pumping the electrons out of the membrane to the outside of cell. Flavo proteins are generally flavin adenine dinucleotide (FAD) or flavin mononucleotide (FMN) that involve in the electron transport. This is also often termed as electron transfer flavoprotein (ETF) which functions as a specific electron acceptor for dehydrogenases in transferring the electrons. The flavo proteins detected during CV analysis might have been responsible in shuttling electrons towards dehydrogenases involved during bioelectrochemical reduction reactions. In addition nitrates, an inorganic electron acceptor has been observed during CV, which might be attributed to the involvement of one of the simulated wastewater components that contains nitrogen/nitrates source within it. The observed redox peaks during voltammetric analysis elucidates the role of these complexes/molecules as electron carriers during the bioelectrochemical reduction reactions towards the synthesis of carboxylic acids. On the other hand, a quasi reversible peak was obtained for BES<sub>C</sub> which might be ascribed to the presence of cytochrome, a membrane bound protein that acts as electron carrier.

#### 3.4.1. Redox mediators

In order to unravel the unidentified/unnoticed peaks during voltammetric analysis, derivative voltammetry analysis was carried out [39]. Derivative cyclic voltammetry (DCV) depicted the presence of additional peaks apart from the redox mediators identified from CV analysis (Fig. 6). Most of the peaks were observed at negative potentials



Fig. 6. First derivative voltammetry deduced from CV (scan rate: 10 mV/s) portraying the peaks as electron carriers in a scan window of  $E_i = -1.0$  V and  $E_f = 1.0$  V vs Ag/AgCl (S).

which represent the electron donating capacity, while the other peaks identified at positive potentials represent the electron acceptors. The fate of appearance/participation of any electron carrier depends on the difference in potential between the electron donor and electron acceptor. Redox mediators were observed at 0.075 V, 0.0166 V, -0.520 V, -0.339 V and -0.373 V vs Ag/AgCl (S). These potentials were tailored with respect to standard hydrogen electrode (SHE) and are discussed. Peak potentials might correspond to the presence of cytochromes-C, NAD + /NADH, Ubiquinone and iron-sulfur proteins (Fe-S). Since the bacteria used is mixed culture and contains diversified population, detection of electron mediators cannot be confined to specific bacteria. The identified redox mediators were appeared similar to proteins/molecules/complexes that are being involved during electron transport. NAD + /NADH is the most widely known electron couple that donates two electrons during the bio-electrochemical reduction. In addition, ubiquinone is also a complex that transfers two electrons during the process by donating the electrons. Iron-sulfur proteins are the surface associated proteins characterized by iron-sulfur clusters that majorly participate in oxidation and reduction reactions during electron transport. Most of the Fe-S proteins act as subunits for many enzymes/ metallo proteins viz., hydrogenases, dehydrogenases, oxido-reductases etc. which will aid in the electron transport and also regulation their expression. The Fe-S proteins detected during DCV also might have played a pivotal role in assisting NAD+/NADH couple, a class of dehydrognases responsible for reduction reactions.

#### 3.5. Phylogenetic analysis

To elucidate the shifts/changes in bacterial community prior to and after operation in BES, phylogenetic analysis was performed for parent inoculum (UN C) along with enriched control inoculum (UN C<sub>En</sub>) and enriched control inoculum operated in BES (UN BES<sub>C</sub>). This was compared with heat treated enriched inoculum (H<sub>En</sub>) and heat treated enriched inoculum operated in BES (BES<sub>H</sub>) (Fig. 7). Parent inoculum which was untreated and acquired from anaerobic wastewater treatment plant showed members belonging to Phyla Proteobacteria, Bacteroides, Firmicutes and other uncultured bacteria. Bacteria belonging to family Bacilleacea, Clostridieaceawere dominant in phylum Firmicutes, while methylobacterium belonging to phylum Proteobacteria was also present. Since the culture was sampled from a wastewater treatment plant, mixed diversity was observed owing to the conditions prevailing in the treatment plant [40]. All these bacteria have diverse functions but only a few aid in the synthesis of carboxylic acids . This population was enriched under the headspace gas mixture of H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub>. This enriched culture demonstrated the presence of bacteria belonging to Methylobacterium sp., uncultured type-II methylotrophs, uncultured bacteria and a few Firmicutes in UN  $C_{\mbox{\scriptsize En}}.$  Major portion of bacterial distribution was dominated by the presence of methanogens and uncultured bacteria. This is attributed to the prevalence of favorable conditions (H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub>) for the enrichment of hydrogenotrophic methanogens that can readily utilize CO<sub>2</sub> in the presence of hydrogen as electron donor for methane formation [41-43]. As observed in UN CEnoperation, acetic acid/carboxylic acids productivity was less in comparison to pretreated and enriched bacteria (H<sub>En</sub>). This might be because of the presence of methanogenic population which tend to form methane rather than carboxylic acids synthesis [9]. These methanogens can also be considered as hydrogenotrophic methanogens which will utilize  $CO_2$  in the presence of  $H_2$  and synthesize methane.

In the case of UN BES<sub>C</sub> which is untreated, enriched and operated at cathode in BES, bacterial community remained more or less similar to what was present during the enrichment (stable microbial community). However, a few shifts in population were identified showing the enrichment of members belonging to *Proteobacteria* and *Clostridiaecea* in UN BES<sub>C</sub>. Presence of other methanogenic bacterial population remained similar as during enrichment. Members belonging to *Proteobacteria* and *Clostridiaecea* that were present in parent inoculum



Fig. 7. Microbial community structure depicted in the form of Phylogenetic trees based on boot-strap neighbor joining method (a) UN C: Parent inoculum (b) UN C<sub>En</sub>: Untreated control and enriched under H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere (c) UN BES<sub>C</sub>: Control, enriched and operated in BES (d) H<sub>En</sub>: Heat treated and enriched under H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere (e) BES<sub>H</sub>: Heat treated, enriched and operated in BES.

and also UN  $BES_{C}$ , did not appear during enrichment. This shift in microbial population might be due to the prevalence of experimental conditions that would stimulate the enrichment of few bacteria and suppress other bacteria [44]. Since bacterial metabolism favor the pathway towards methane formation rather than acetic acid synthesis in the presence of H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub> (according to Gibbs free energy), the same was depicted during UN  $BES_{C}$  with major portion of reducing equivalents directed towards methane [45]. Carboxylic acids, more specifically acetic acid productivity was less in UN  $BES_{C}$ , which is in congruence with the microbial community structure where methanogens were found to be dominant that are responsible for utilizing electrons for methane production (Table 1).

On the contrary, phylogenetic analysis performed for heat pretreated culture ( $H_{En}$  and  $BES_{H}$ ) demonstrated shifts in microbial community. Heat pretreatment suppress the growth of methane forming methanogens and enrich the acidogenic and acetogenic bacteria.  $H_{En}$ , which depicts the heat treated and enriched bacteria under gas mixture of  $H_2$  and  $CO_2$ , revealed the presence of members belonging to *Firmicutes,Proteobacteria* and uncultured bacteria. Various species of *Clostridiaecea* and *Bacilleacea* were enriched among the phylum



Fig. 7. (continued)

Table 1											
Comparative data of BES <sub>C</sub>	BESB	and $BES_H$	representing	the variation	in acetic	acid pr	roduction	with re	espect to	other	parameters.

Biocatalyst in BES operation ( <sup>a</sup> )	Maximum drop in pH	Maximum current density (mA/m <sup>2</sup> )	Acetic acid productivity (mM)/(g/ l)	Total carboxylic acids (g/l)	Other carboxylic acids (g/l)	Columbic efficiency (CE%)	Bicarbonate reduction (%)
BES <sub>C</sub>	7.82	$250 \pm 30$	3.19/0.9	1.2	0.3	15	28
BES <sub>B</sub>	8.1	$340 \pm 20$	8.01/2.1	3.5	1.4	24	35
BES <sub>H</sub>	6.98	$650 \pm 50$	12.57/3.01	3.72	0.71	38	67

<sup>a</sup> BES<sub>C</sub>: Control operation where BES was operated without any pretreatment of inoculum. BES<sub>B</sub>: BES operated with BESA treated inoculum [9]. BES<sub>H</sub>: BES operated with heat treated inoculum.

Proteobacteria. Major proportion of bacteria was related to Clostridiaecea family comprising of Clostridium hydrogeniformans, Clostridium tyrobutyricum and uncultured Clostridium sp. These are known to be potential acetogens which would synthesize the carboxylic acids with acetic acid being the major fraction [46]. Besides *Clostridiaecea*, bacteria belonging to Phylum Proteobacteria viz., Propionivibrio dicarboxylicus was also identified which is a strict anaerobe capable of synthesizing propionic acid. A small fraction of propionic acid detected during BES operation, might have been due to the presence of this potential strain. Proteiniphilum acetatigenes, belonging to Phylum Bacteroidetes was also identified which can grow at pH 6.0-9.7 in the presence of yeast extract and anaerobic conditions [47]. The prevalence of favorable conditions for growth of P. acetatigens might have contributed for the enrichment and synthesize acetic acid. In the case of BES<sub>H</sub>, members belonging to Clostridium were dominant followed by the presence of Proteobacteria, Bacteroides and Flavobacteriaecea. Members of Clostridiaecea are known to have a significant role in carboxylic acids synthesis, specifically acetate. The aforementioned microbial community composition was more or less similar to the bacterial population present during H<sub>En</sub>. Interestingly, members of Rhodospirillum and Rhodocycleacea were enriched during BES<sub>H</sub> operation. Rhodospirillum sp. is known to grow at diverse conditions viz., aerobic and anaerobic with CO2 as carbon source [48].

Presence of applied potential, anaerobic conditions and  $CO_2$  as carbon source might have stimulated the enrichment of *Rhodospirillum centenum*, a member belonging to photosynthetic group of organisms. Phylogenetic analysis revealed the enrichment of *Clostridiacea* members, which are known potential acetogens in the heat pretreated cultures responsible for the biosynthesis of acetic acid through bioelectrochemical  $CO_2$  reduction. High carboxylic acids productivity and columbic efficiency are in congruence with the microbial population observed in BES<sub>H.</sub> On the contrary, in control operation (untreated and enriched under headspace gas mixture of H<sub>2</sub> and CO<sub>2</sub>) methylotrophs, also called hydrogenotrophic methanogens were the dominant population which would utilize the reducing powers more towards methane formation than carboxylic acids. This is also well correlated with the low columbic efficiency and carboxylic acids production in control operation.

#### 3.6. Interphasial Chemistry of H<sub>2</sub>, H<sub>2</sub>O and CO<sub>2</sub>

 $CO_2$  containing a single carbon atom is electron poor with an oxidation state of IV. Also, oxygen of water molecule is electron rich and will donate an electron pair to carbon. Carbonic acid is formed upon transfer of proton from water to oxygen of  $CO_2$  unit which will be in equilibrium with bicarbonate anion (Eq. 1–5). Reaction between water and dissolved carbon dioxide is reversible and rapid.  $CO_2$ , when dissolved in H<sub>2</sub>O can exist in any of the three forms viz., carbonates ( $CO_3^{2-}$ ), bicarbonates ( $HCO_3^{-}$ ), carbonic acid ( $H_2CO_3$ ) or  $CO_2$  in gaseous or soluble form along with hydroxyl ions and other ions based on the pH range (Eq. 6–8) (Fig. 8).

$$\operatorname{CO}_2(\mathfrak{g}) \leftrightarrow \operatorname{CO}_2(\mathfrak{l})$$
 (1)

$$\operatorname{CO}_2(l) + \operatorname{H}_2\operatorname{O}(l) \Leftrightarrow \operatorname{H}_2\operatorname{CO}_3(l) \tag{2}$$



AA: acetic acid; BA: butyric acid; PA: propionic acid

Fig. 8. The possible presence of various ionic species and the bioelectrochemical CO2 reduction towards carboxylic acids synthesis.

 $H_2CO_3 + H_2O \leftrightarrow HCO^{3-} + H_3O^+$ (3)

 $HCO^{3-} + H_2O \Leftrightarrow CO_3^{2-} + H_3O^+$  (4)

$$\mathrm{CO_3}^{2-} + \mathrm{H_2O} \Leftrightarrow \mathrm{H_3O} + + \mathrm{CO_2} \uparrow \tag{5}$$

More generally, the aforementioned species of  $CO_2$  exists based on the pH range

 $CO_2 + H_2O \leftrightarrow H_2CO_3 \text{ (acidic/low pH)}$  (6)

 $H_2CO_3 \leftrightarrow HCO_3^- + H^+$  (neutral to low alkaline pH) (7)

$$HCO_3 - \leftrightarrow CO_3^{2^-} + H^+$$
 (alkaline/high pH) (8)

In the present study, as near neutral to alkaline pH range was opted, bicarbonate is the most readily available form of  $CO_2$ , which acts as electron acceptor by accepting the electrons directly from electrode in BES.

 $H_2$  can be represented as  $H_2$  (g) or  $2e^-$  and  $2H^+$ . In BES,  $H_2$  is more commonly represented in the form of reducing equivalents (e – and H +). In a study on enzymatic electrosynthesis, CO<sub>2</sub> in carbonates form was found to be utilized as substrate for methanol synthesis at low acidic pH [49]. However, homoacetogenic bacteria, which can grow at diverse range of pH from slightly acidic to alkaline range, bicarbonate form of CO<sub>2</sub> is the predominantly available form as a substrate. Therefore,  $HCO^{3-} + 8e^- + 8H^+ \rightarrow CH_3COOH$  is the required step for microbial electrosynthesis of acetic acid from CO<sub>2</sub>.

Homoacetogenic bacteria employs Wood-Ljungdahl pathway, wherein  $CO_2$ /bicarbonate gets reduced to carbon monoxide (CO), by accepting two electrons/two protons [26]. The pathway initiates with the formation of CO, which follows Eastern/methyl branch and Western/carbonyl branch to finally synthesize 1 mole of acetic acid from 2 moles of  $CO_2$ /HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> [50]. Enzymes are involved at each step for the conversion of CO<sub>2</sub> to acetate via formate and other reduced intermediates.

#### 4. Conclusions

This study demonstrates the potential of enriched microbial community to utilize  $CO_2$  as substrate electrolithoautotrophically by using bioelectrochemical system. Heat pretreatment used as a strategy for selectively enriching homoacetogenic bacteria was proved to be efficient in the development of a microbial community dominantly comprising of members belonging to *Clostridiaecea*. BES<sub>H</sub> resulted in the synthesis of mixture of carboxylic acids, with acetic acid (12.57 mM) being the major fraction, while it was comparatively lower in BES<sub>C</sub> (3.19 mM), depicting the role of enriched bacterial community towards high yield of carboxylic acids in BES<sub>H</sub>. A minor proportion of butyric (C4) and propionic acids (C3) were also observed during BES<sub>H</sub> operation, which might be attributed to the existence of other bacterial population that are capable of synthesizing these C3 and C4 chemicals as depicted in phylogenetic analysis. Voltammetric analysis of BES<sub>H</sub> depicted the involvement of NAD + /NADH, membrane bound proteins, Fe-S proteins, flavins etc. as electron carriers during bio-electrochemical reduction reactions. Energy discharge of 9000 mJ/energy was noticed in BES<sub>H</sub> in response to chronoamperometrically polarized voltage of -0.8 V vs Ag/AgCl (S). Study unraveled the potential of BES in not only synthesizing the multi-carbon organic chemicals but also in generating energy by simultaneously minimizing the gaseous waste.

#### Acknowledgements

The authors wish to thank the Director, CSIR-IICT, Hyderabad for the support and encouragement in carrying out this work. Research was supported by Department of Biotechnology (DBT), Government of India as National Bioscience Award (BT/HRD/NBA/34/01/2012(vi)) and CSIR-XII network project (SETCA, CSC-0113). J.A.M duly acknowledge CSIR for providing fellowship.

#### References

- S.V. Mohan, J.A. Modestra, K. Amulya, S.K. Butti, G. Velvizhi, Trends Biotechnol. 34 (2016) 506–519.
- [2] R.C. Franca, A. Azapagic, J. CO<sub>2</sub> Util. 9 (2015) 82–102.
- [3] S.V. Mohan, S.K. Butti, K. Amulya, S. Dahiya, J.A. Modestra, Trends Biotechnol. 34 (2016) 852–855.
- [4] T. Ueki, K.P. Nevin, T.L. Woodard, D.R. Lovley, mbio.asm.org. 5 (2014) 14–1636.
  [5] S.V. Mohan, G. Velvizhi, J.A. Modestra, S. Srikanth Ren, Sustain. Energy Rev. 40 (2013) 779–797.
- [6] K.P. Nevin, T.L. Woodard, A.E. Franks, Z.M. Summers, D.R. Lovley, mBio 1 (2010) 00103–00110.
- [7] K. Rabaey, R.A. Rozendal, Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 8 (2010) 706-716.
- [8] L. Jourdin, Y. Lu, V. Flexer, J. Keller, S. Freguia, Chem. Electron Chem. 3 (2015) 581–591.
- [9] J.A. Modestra, B. Navaneeth, S.V. Mohan, J. CO<sub>2</sub> Util. 10 (2015) 78-87.
- [10] G. Mohanakrishna, J.S. Seelam, K. Vanbroekhoven, D. Pant, Faraday Discuss. 183 (2015) 445–462.
- S.A. Patil, J.B.A. Arends, I. Vanwonterghem, J.V. Meerbergen, K. Guo, G.W. Tyson, K. Rabaey, Environ. Sci. Technol. 49 (2015) 8833–8843.
- [12] T. Zhang, H. Nie, T.S. Bain, H. Lu, M. Cui, O.L. Snoeyenbos-West, A.E. Franks,
- K.P. Nevin, T.P. Russell, D.R. Lovley, Energy Environ. Sci. 6 (2013) 217–224.
  [13] C.W. Marshall, D.E. Ross, E.B. Fichot, R.S. Norman, H.D. May, Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 8 (2012) 8412–8420.
- [14] C.W. Marshall, E.V. LaBelle, H.D. May, Curr. Opin. Biotechnol. 24 (2013) 391–397.
- [15] H. Nie, T. Zhang, M. Cui, H. Lu, D.R. Lovley, T.P. Russell, Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys. 15 (2013) 14290–14294.
- [16] S. Bajracharya, A. Heijne, X.D. Benetton, K. Vanbroekhoven, C.J.N. Buisman, D.P.B.T.B. Strik, D. Pant, Bioresour, Technol. 195 (2015) 14–24.
- [17] M. Su, Y. Jiang, D.J. Li, Microbiol. Biotechnol. 23 (2013) 1140–1146.
- [18] P.L. Tremblay, T. Zhang, Front. Microbiol. 6 (2015), http://dx.doi.org/10.3389/ fmicb.2015.00201.
- [19] P.L. Tremblay, D. Hoglund, A. Koza, I. Bonde, T. Zhang, Sci. Rep. 5 (2015) 16168, http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/srep16168,2015.
- [20] R. Ganigue, S. Puig, P.B. Vilanova, M.D. Balaguer, J. Colprim, Chem. Comm. 51 (2015) 3235–3238.
- [21] N. Xafenias, V. Mapelli, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy 39 (2014) 21864–21875.
- [22] K.P. Nevin, S.A. Hensley, A.E. Franks, Z.M. Summers, J. Ou, T.L. Woodard,

- O.L. Snoeyenbos-West, D.R. Lovley, Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 77 (2011) 2882–2886.
- [23] L. Jourdin, T. Grieger, J. Monetti, V. Flexer, S. Freguia, Y. Lu, J. Chen, M. Romano, G.G. Wallace, J. Keller, Environ. Sci. Technol. 49 (2015) 13566–13574.
- [24] S.V. Mohan, V.L. Babu, P.N. Sarma, Bioresour. Technol. 99 (2008) 59–67.
- [25] S.V. Mohan, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy 34 (2009) 7460–7474.
- [26] M. Leclerc, A. Bernalier, G. Donadille, M. Lelait, Anaerobe 3 (1997) 307–315.
   [27] S.F. Lajoie, S. Bank, T.L. Miller, M.J. Wolin, App. Environ. Microbiol. (1988)
- 2723-2727.
- [28] H.L. Drake, S.L. Daniel, C. Matthies, K. Kusel, Acetogenesis, in: H.L. Drake (Ed.), Chapman and Hall, New York, 1994, pp. 3–60.
- [29] H.L. Drake, K. Kusel, C. Matthies, Prokaryotes 2 (2006) 354-420.
- [30] J. Wiege, M. Braun, G. Gotlschalk, Curr. Microbiol. 5 (1981) 255-260.
- [31] L.G. Ljungdahl, Annu. Rev. Microbiol. 40 (1986) 415-450.
- [32] S.W. Ragsdale, E. Pierce, Biochim.Biophys. Acta Proteins Proteomics 1784 (2008) 1873–1898.
- [33] R.K. Goud, O. Sarkar, S.V. Mohan, Int J. of Hyd. Energy 39 (2014) 7572–7586.[34] APHA, 20th ed., American Public Health Association/American Water Works
- Association/Water Environment Federation, Washington DC, USA, 1998. [35] S. Dahiya, O. Sarkar, Y.V. Swamy, S.V. Mohan, Bioresour. Technol. 182 (2015)
- [35] S. Dahiya, O. Sarkar, Y.V. Swamy, S.V. Mohan, Bioresour. Technol. 182 (2015) 103–113.

- [36] J.A. Rogers, C.L. Davis, J. Dairy Sci. 65 (1982) 944-952.
- [37] K. Chandrasekhar, K. Amulya, S.V. Mohan, Waste Manage. 45 (2015) 57-65.
- [38] W.I. Al Sadat, L.A. Archer, App. Sci. Eng. Sci. Adv. 2 (2016) e1600968.
- [39] J.A. Modestra, S.V. Mohan, RSC Adv. 4 (2014) 34045-34055.
- [40] G. Mohanakrishna, S.K. Butti, R.K. Goud, S.V. Mohan, Bioelectrochemistry 115 (2017) 11–18.
- [41] T.L. Miller, M.J. Wolin, Arch. Microbiol. 131 (1982) 14–18.
- [42] G.A. Weaver, J.A. Krause, T.L. Miller, M.J. Wolin, Gut 27 (1986) 698-704.
- [43] S.D. Molenaar, P. Saha, A.R. Mol, T.H.J.A. Sleutels, A. Heijne, C.J.N. Buisman, Int. J. Mol. Sci. 18 (2017) 204.
- [44] K.V. Krishna, S.V. Mohan, Biores. Technol. 213 (2016) 146-154.
- [45] O.R. Kotsyurbenko, M.V. Glagolev, A.N. Nozhevnikova, R. Conrad, FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 38 (2001) 153–159.
- [46] K. Sugaya, D. Tuse, J.L. Jones, Biotechnol. Bioeng. 28 (1986) 678-683.
- [47] S. Chen, X. Dong, Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol. 55 (2005) 2257-2261.
- [48] F.H. Yildiz, H. Gest, C.E. Bauer, J. Bacteriol. 173 (1991) 5502–5506.
- [49] F.S. Baskaya, X. Zhao, M.C. Flickinger, P. Wang, Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol. 162 (2010) 391–398.
- [50] S.V. Mohan, G.N. Nikhil, P. Chiranjeevi, C.N. Reddy, M.V. Rohit, A. Naresh Kumar, O. Sarkar, Biores. Technol. 215 (2016) 2–12.