



# Vaya con Dios: Religion and the Transnational History of the Americas

Pamela Voekel\* and  
*The University of Georgia*

Bethany Moreton with  
*The University of Georgia*

Michael Jo  
*Yale University*

---

## Abstract

Over the past decade, the transnational turn within US academic history has won recognition from the country's key legitimating professional institutions, from journals of record to first-tier search committees and major conferences. For historians of Latin America, as for scholars of diaspora and others who have long worked to historicize the nation-state, this is familiar territory. Their work has always challenged imperial hubris and debunked claims to national autogenesis. World systems theory, dependency theory, the Atlantic World tradition, border studies, the historical record seen from the vantage of the invaded – these insured that simply telling the truth about history was an inherently anti-imperialist act. What has yet to be thoroughly integrated into this tradition, however, are recent questions raised by scholars of religious developments in the global south or the margins of first-world nation-states. As arguably the most successful transnational movement in history, religion commands our attention. Moreover, despite the unease it arouses, the study of transnational religion has much to offer to even self-consciously anti-imperialist scholarship. Since the Enlightenment, secular states and rational subjects have proclaimed themselves the rightful tutors of their counterparts mired in magical religion and primitive superstition. Because many anti-imperialist theories share some of the Enlightenment assumptions animating this particular civilizing mission, they cede key ground to imperialism. Recent scholarship on religion challenges a series of dichotomies at the heart of imperialism and some anti-imperialisms as well: religion and secularism, faith and reason, tradition and modernity, obedience and free will. These interventions suggest that to win the debate over Empire, transnational history must change its terms.

---

[T]he current discourse about the American Empire embodies fantasies of a global monolithic order extending outward from a national center. How

can we draw on our knowledge of the past to bring a sense of contingency to this idea of empire, to show that imperialism is an interconnected network of power relations, which entail engagements and encounters as well as military might and which are riddled with instability, tension, and disorder . . . ?

– Amy Kaplan, ‘Violent Belongings and the Question of Empire Today’, 7

[T]he persistence of reductive stances toward religion in the Latin American social sciences issues from remnants of a modernist, Enlightenment-based prejudice. Save for brief episodes of turmoil, as in the heyday of liberation theology, religion is always associated with premodern, conservative patterns oppressive to women, people of color, and others at the margin.

– Manuel A. Vásquez, ‘Toward a New Agenda for the Study of Religion in the Americas’, 15

Over the past decade, the ‘transnational turn’ within academic history generally has won recognition from the key legitimating institutions of the profession, from journals of record to first-tier search committees and major conferences.<sup>1</sup> Indeed, as the former American Studies Association President Amy Kaplan reported in the address quoted above, the sudden adoption of ‘empire’ as a category of analysis by mainstream and conservative observers can be disorienting to those who risked attack by using that term just a few years before.<sup>2</sup> For Latin Americanists, as for scholars of diasporas and others who have long worked to historicize the nation-state, this is familiar territory.<sup>3</sup> Their work has always challenged imperial hubris and debunked claims to national autogenesis. World systems theory, dependency theory, the Atlantic World tradition, border studies, the historical record seen from the vantage of the invaded – these ensured that simply telling the truth about history was inherently an anti-imperialist act.

What has yet to be thoroughly integrated into this tradition, however, are recent questions raised by scholars of religion working in the global south or from the margins of first-world nation-states. Manuel Vásquez has stated the case baldly: For many Latin Americanist adherents of the transnational framework, ‘religion, unlike the feminist and environmental movements, cannot yield real “subjects”, capable of transforming personal and collective history’.<sup>4</sup> Grassroots globalization movements are rarely understood to include missionaries or evangelists alongside Teamsters and turtles, and Jesuits do not appear in the same analytical field with the many-headed hydra. In other words, given the anti-imperialist inheritance of transnational history, religion is a problem best addressed, apparently, by ignoring it.

Yet as arguably the most successful transnational movement in history, religion commands our attention. Moreover, despite the unease it arouses, the study of transnational religion has much to offer to even self-consciously anti-imperialist scholarship. Since the Enlightenment, secular states and rational subjects have proclaimed themselves the rightful

tutors of their counterparts mired in magical religion and primitive superstition. Because many anti-imperialist theories share some of the Enlightenment assumptions animating this particular civilizing mission, they cede key ground to imperialism. Recent scholarship in religious studies challenges a series of dichotomies at the heart of both imperialisms and some anti-imperialisms as well: religion and secularism, faith and reason, tradition and modernity, obedience and free will. These interventions raise the possibility that to win the debate over Empire, scholars must change its terms.

In what follows, we suggest one application of historian Florencia Mallon's advice that the best history is often written from the interstices of fields and approaches.<sup>5</sup> We open with a brief discussion of transnational history's antecedents and a sampling of recent works in transnational religious history. We then offer a four-part consideration of the less obvious contributions that religious studies can make to anti-imperialist transnational histories.

### *Transnational History: A Brief Overview*

Transnational history was born fighting, inheriting the intellectual mission of liberatory predecessors.<sup>6</sup> In a sense it continued the twentieth-century offensive against modernization theory, which had arranged splendidly isolated nation-states on an evolutionary ladder and occluded their interdependence. In reaction, world systems and dependency theories relentlessly exposed the interlocking global processes of wealth accumulation. On the eve of the Cold War in 1944, Trinidadian historian Eric Williams troubled the self-congratulatory story of England's precocious industrial transformation. Manchester's captains of industry, he argued, amassed their start-up capital in the slave trade. While the exact contribution of that income itself remains debated, Williams's thesis has ensured that no serious analysis of either slavery or capitalism can ignore the other.

In the decades that followed, many scholars wrote back to empire from the region whose silver floated the mercantilist system and whose sugar fueled the workforce of the dark satanic mills. Latin American scholars displayed a marked distrust of first-world nation-states' claims to pristine autonomy in the decades after World War II. From the most lyrical renderings – the South American dictator who exports his country's national lake to Arizona, the hemorrhage of resources through the hemispheric body – to the most econometric world-systems and dependency theories, such challenges punctured wealthy nations' sanctimony by relentlessly charting the flow of material wealth from South to North, periphery to core.<sup>7</sup>

If variations on world systems theory have exposed the economic dependence of the West on the rest, another branch of transnational

critique reveals the moral debt. This strain of argument resists the obfuscatory notion of the West's 'civilizing mission', pointing out that the liberal democratic freedoms the West imagines to be its own creation were forged in a transnational crucible. As C. L. R. James and now Laurent Dubois remind us, it was the Haitian Revolution, and not the French, that made the Rights of Man truly universal. In the wake of its slave revolt, the new Caribbean republic embraced the lofty principles France had rejected by abolishing slavery in its constitution. Its revolution reverberated across the water for contemporaries, inspiring Simón Bolívar as well as transforming the debate in France.<sup>8</sup>

The action of the colonized in universalizing the Rights of Man, however, was systematically erased from colonialism's self-representation. Imperialism in Africa and the Caribbean was figured as the spread of freedom outward from Europe to a benighted world. Meanwhile, these same colonists cited racial backwardness to justify denying to the descendants of slaves the very rights their forebears had created. A US marine who participated in one of the violent occupations of Haiti in the early twentieth century concluded that 'these people had never heard of democracy and couldn't have comprehended it if they had'.<sup>9</sup> The transnational frame thus undermines imperialist claims: 'they' cannot hate 'our' freedoms, for freedom is not produced in the West for export to the rest.

The myth of economic and political self-generation has a religious equivalent. The conversation around Latin America's recent boom in religious conversions contains within it an impassioned argument about the extent to which Protestantism represents an alien import from the North. One wing of analysis has emphasized the inputs from foreign, and especially North American, missionary endeavors, with the most spectacular evidence coming from Reagan-era efforts in Central America.<sup>10</sup> Concerned as they are with political developments internal to the US and with the obvious imbalances of power in play, some North American scholars imply unidirectional influence between bounded nation states. This model slights a generation of research on transnationalism and cultural reception, as well as world systems theory's challenge to the persistent myth of Western nations' autogenesis and autonomy.<sup>11</sup> The Christian fundamentalism spreading the globe, they assert, 'is clearly stamped "Made in the USA"'.<sup>12</sup> Their own metaphor should have signaled the anachronism: if by the mid-nineties an 'American-made' Boeing aircraft contained 30 percent foreign content, what are the odds that a complex, socially embedded belief system could be wholly constructed in one sovereign territory and shipped to another?<sup>13</sup>

Not very high, it turns out, if we believe recent scholars who employ the transnational as a category of analysis. Although extensive precedent exists for studying religious sensibilities through a transnational

lens, recent works have confirmed that faith communities are created and maintained through networks that seep through the pales marking off nations and empires.<sup>14</sup> Pentecostalism, for example, has long been understood within US historical circles as a hybrid creation, an impulse carried from the American heartland by itinerant preachers and bursting in 1906 into mass conversion in a multiracial revival in Los Angeles.<sup>15</sup> More recent historical accounts have focused on the outpourings of spirit that appeared almost concurrently with the California revival among Protestants in India, Korea, and Wales.<sup>16</sup> And now Gastón Espinosa has shown how the movement – today one of the fastest-growing religious formations on earth – was forged not just internationally but transnationally, by people whose own heartland actually occupied the space between national borders. Espinosa relates the spread of Pentecostalism through the life of a sugarcane cutter working in Hawaii, Juan Lugo, who tacked between California, Puerto Rico, and New York to establish churches in the 1930s. Lugo himself had been converted by missionaries who touched down in Hawaii on their way to Japan – a potent reminder that missionaries served as the first grassroots globalization movement of the twentieth century.<sup>17</sup>

Espinosa's transnational study is part of a growing trend to document networks that criss-cross nation-states and indeed political entities throughout the modern period – accounts that often turn on religious axes. Margarita Silva argues that Central America's only transnational political party operating at the turn of the last century relied on the region's spiritist and theosophist networks for party organizing and *esprit de corps*.<sup>18</sup> Christopher Domínguez Michael suggests the thoroughly transnational nature of the enlightened Catholic community at the turn of the eighteenth century: Mexico's most famous enlightened Catholic, Fray Servando Teresa de Mier, regularly corresponded and associated with far-flung fellow-travelers, including the French Abbé Gregoire and Simón Bolívar's tutor.<sup>19</sup> The importance of these enlightened Catholic networks to Latin America's decolonization struggle should not be underestimated. Historian Dale Van Kley has found neo-Augustinian Christians carrying the 'Patriot' banner against neo-Pelagian monarchical apologists throughout the Atlantic world.<sup>20</sup> Was Mier part of a larger Latin American and Atlantic network of neo-Augustinians? If so, what role did they play in generating anti-colonialist ideas during the Independence era? Analyzing religious communities as once-and-future transnationalists produces these questions and, potentially, sheds light on the utility of the transnational as a category of analysis more generally.

Indeed, transnationalism has already transformed the research agenda for Latin America's nineteenth century. In her eloquent gloss on the thoroughly non-secular world of late nineteenth-century Mexico, Silvia

Arrom documented the transnational *Hijas de la caridad* and the staggeringly large networks of Mexican Catholic women who participated. Derek Williams documents linkages between Catholic journals and newspapers throughout post-1850 Latin America as well as journalists' links to a larger 'Catholic Atlantic' world. His work illuminates the centrality of these Catholic networks in the creation of mass civil society and other modern social forms. Patricia Londoño-Vega depicted a full-fledged religious revival with transnational connections at its heart during Colombia's war-torn nineteenth century.<sup>21</sup>

Transnational religion does much of its best work, however, when we follow historical actors out of church or temple and into the other arenas of their lives. Aihwa Ong's research on Mormon conversion among Cambodian refugees richly illuminates technologies of racial and gender formation in the intimacies of family life.<sup>22</sup> Melani McAlister demonstrates the roles religion has played in interpreting US interests in the Middle East, from the blockbuster Biblical epics of the 1950s to evangelicals' political support for Israel.<sup>23</sup> Bethany Moreton details the web of religious relationships that have shadowed the Washington Consensus, that suite of economic reforms centered on privatization and free trade. To such well recognized motors of neoliberal restructuring as official government treaties and I. M. F. prescriptions, Moreton's research adds cross-border networks of evangelical businessmen. Neoliberal economic reform was achieved not just by nation-states and supranational enforcers, but also by multinational corporations and transnational communities of believers. In winning hearts and minds to the brave new world of the free market, it relied on faith as much as on fidelity to an abstract economic model and redefined the relevant community of moral accountability away from local affiliations to a global imagined congregation.<sup>24</sup>

*From Territory to Epistemology: The Calling of Transnational Religious Analysis*

Transnational religious historians, then, join economic and cultural historians of Latin America and the Caribbean as among the most prolific producers of histories that challenge national autogenesis. To these critiques, however, we would add the insights of other religious studies scholars working within nation-states yet across cultures – work that deserves full recognition as central to the anti-colonial project. Religious studies forces us to decenter not only the nation-state, but more importantly the cultural and philosophical frameworks of the civilizing mission itself – in both the stories we tell and the way we tell them. Religious belief and practice haunt the rationalist epistemology of the human sciences, an incommensurable adversary that reason can only contain and never fully represent. In the colonial

context the duel between faith and reason, or between irrational and rational faith, became a primary means of recoding cultural difference in terms of the hierarchical binaries of modernism. The problem that religion poses to rationalist epistemology is not merely a dimension of colonialism; it encapsulates its most essential and intractable cultural dynamic.

As historians, we inhabit a profession colored by the residues of this colonial project. We exhibit a palpable discomfort when confronting the unassailable truths of the pious, redefining them as social facts available for dissection by rational observers like ourselves. Religious studies confronts this embarrassment head-on, forcing us to question the hierarchical binaries that contain the religious within the secular. As historians reap the analytical benefits of the destabilized nation-state, scholars of religion across the Americas remind us that we have not yet followed this historical trail to its logical conclusion. With the unity of the nation-state revealed as a project rather than a given, its conjoined twin, secular modernity, is likewise returned to the flow of history.

One of the field's cottage industries has been the demystification of what Enrique Dussel tags the 'myth of modernity', the West's belief in its own self-creation, the fantastic conceit that it generated its economic wealth and cultural patrimony in splendid isolation and its concomitant belief in the autonomous individual as its fundamental constituent. Dussel reads Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda's 1550 treatise that declared the Indians natural slaves as one of modernity's opening salvos. For Sepúlveda, the evidence was clear: the natives held no private property, they were in thrall to their despotic rulers – in short, they failed to behave as rational individuals and instead spurned modernity's notion of free will and autonomous resistance to despotism.<sup>25</sup> In the myth's dominant twentieth-century iteration, modernization theory lined up societies on an evolutionary ladder from poor to rich, traditional to modern, religious to secular.<sup>26</sup> This evolutionary scheme places the West ahead of the rest, obscuring its actual debts. The model implies that the 'non-West' (within and without) occupies a different, distant temporality, and thus needs tutelage to pass through the West's prior social and economic stages into the present. Out of this story comes the dangerous imperative to civilize and develop those putatively left behind.

Historians working in the United States have often been slow to appreciate this religious critique, and no one has to look far to discover the proximate cause of this aversion. Some recent US religious formations so threaten secular knowledge production that even self-conscious critics of colonial binaries may seek sanctuary in colonialism's fundamental assumptions.<sup>27</sup> Offstage, scholars may well admit the fallacy of absolutist oppositions between religion and

secularism, faith and reason, stasis and progress, tradition and freedom. Yet they may well be loath to relinquish the related pairings of church and state, faith-based and reality-based, backwardness and reform, religious majorities and individual rights. As Janet Jakobsen points out in another context, ‘When the Christian-identified radical right has identified you as a target, secularism can look pretty good’.<sup>28</sup>

But defensive allegiances to these tropes intellectually hamstring the critique of imperialist civilizing projects. More to the point, research that takes religion seriously as both culture and epistemology suggests that the stand-off is both unproductive and unnecessary. Transnational history must break free of modernist binaries as well as nation-state boundaries if it is to dissolve rather than reinscribe modernity’s irrational myth of autogenesis and cultural superiority.

To keep in mind the reification of rationalist historical knowledge itself, however, is not to throw up our hands collectively at the task of producing historical knowledge. The rumors of the death of the footnote that circulated in the 1980s were discovered to be wildly exaggerated. At the end of the day, both the new social history and the ‘literary turn’ vastly enlarged our archives, and thus our knowledge. Jeremiads predicting the end of evidence and causal reasoning could not point to practicing historians who abandoned them, and no one could find the endowed chair of Madonna Studies. Similarly, by introducing religious understandings into the historical record, studies of the Madonna offer us productive questions, new sources, and a healthy dose of epistemological humility. They do not throw the baby of rationality out with the bathwater of rationalism. With that caveat, we examine below work that creatively re-engages with the four binaries of religion and secularism, faith and reason, tradition and modernity, obedience and free will, offering US-based scholars some potential exits from the labyrinth.

### *Religion versus Secularism*

When most Latin Americanists hear the words ‘religion’ and ‘imperialism’ in the same sentence we picture the betrayed Friar de Landa torturing his erstwhile converts in the Yucatán, or perhaps a Victorian with a Bible and a pith helmet, or even the Christian Broadcasting Company beaming Pat Robertson to millions of Guatemalans. The motivations of individual Christians certainly defy caricature – many were vocal critics of imperialism, from Bartolomé de las Casas to Robert E. Speer. But the cross conquered a continent for Spain, and some *fin de siècle* missions promoted foreign evangelism as an arm of neo-colonialist trade relations: Christian natives would demand Christian sewing machines, and who better to supply them than Singer?<sup>29</sup> In the lifetimes of today’s practicing historians, moreover, US



churchgoers sent millions to support the genocidal dictatorship of Efraín Ríos Montt in Guatemala.<sup>30</sup>

The missionary on the front lines of empire thus easily creates his own foil: If missionaries are agents of colonialism, then secularists must be the liberators. The West's secular public sphere assumes that all religions are equal and equally unwelcome in reasonable public debate, certainly a useful ground rule for the Europe of the sixteenth-century religious wars. At the same time, it can imply that secular people are inherently more rational than religious ones, that secularism is better than any religion, and that religion's universal claims are actually provincial, leaving secularism as the only universal. Within the traditional secularization thesis, any religion, if not completely privatized, easily becomes configured as dangerously anti-modern.<sup>31</sup>

The importance of this insight is considerable, for the promise of secular liberation from perceived religious primitivism and tyranny has been one of imperialism's dominant tropes since the Enlightenment. During its frequent occupations of Haiti from 1915 to 1934, the United States government and press, for example, recast Vodou to great effect. Though Vodou was forged in an encounter with factory discipline years before European industrialization and stood front and center in Haiti's democratic revolution, the occupiers understood it as primitive, unchanging, and centered on cannibalism and human sacrifice. Rational, secular science was called in to combat the religion's magic; US doctors accompanied the invasion. Vodou became a justification for the savage repression and violence that characterized the occupations.<sup>32</sup>

Scholarship less saturated in blood has also recently challenged the secularization thesis. This branch of religious studies proceeds not just by noting the theory's stunning failure in the face of worldwide revival, on display now since the 1960s at least. Rather, a new efflorescence of work on 'formations of the secular' treats secularism to the same comparative scrutiny that it typically employs in the study of 'world religions'. Talal Asad argues that, far from a universal category, 'the secular' is a Western particularity available to the descriptive tools of anthropology.<sup>33</sup> Banu Subramaniam makes the point concretely with her contrast between a US conception of secularism as the separation of church and state, on the one hand, and on the other, India's experience of secularism in the years following independence. Until recently, she finds, Indian secularism was expressed as 'pluralism – including the active support and encouragement of all religions. For example, Indian law accepts the religious codes of individual religions that govern inheritance, marriage, divorce, and so on'.<sup>34</sup> The real question, then, is not whether secularization is marching forward on schedule, but how, when, and by whom are the categories of religion and the secular defined.

Does the secular public sphere in the US – the one from which most academic historians write – then really leave Christianity behind as it claims? Certainly this secular arena bears an uncanny resemblance to classical Protestantism’s ‘disenchantment of the world’.<sup>35</sup> It is the Protestant notion of the secular, of a profane physical reality strictly cut off from the sacred, which provides a zone of scientific inquiry.

But, as we have been reminded since Max Weber himself pointed it out, the secular freedom promised by the market was forged out of a worldly yet decidedly Christian asceticism, a future-orientation that promoted savings and work discipline.<sup>36</sup> Janet Jakobsen thus argues that capitalism’s crucial ascetic technology of bodily control blended so completely into the ‘free market’ that we have forgotten its fundamental identity as reform Protestantism. And in contrast to Weber, who foretold the advent of the iron cage – the habits of capitalism without the religious content – Jakobsen sees in current Christian concerns with ‘family values’ a continued feedback loop between capitalism and American Christianity. In an economic climate of global competition, she argues, the state has outsourced to ‘the’ family the entire burden for defining the nation, heightening the stakes for absolutist definitions of legitimate and illegitimate families. This move freed the state from its Fordist role as mediator between the nation – the folk – and capital, allowing government to create the ‘healthy business climate’ that alone attracts de-nationalized investments. Therefore, Jakobsen concludes, a rear-guard defense of ‘the secular’ cannot in itself increase the social space for heterodox publics, for it misses the division of labor that ties nation, state, and capital under the new religious dispensation. Indeed, accepting at face value the presumed secularity of the market and the political sphere – where every president has been a Christian and the calendar begins with Jesus’ birth – may ‘simply reinforce the current efforts on the right to reestablish market-reform-Protestantism as the (singular) expression of “American” values’.<sup>37</sup>

Thus the category of the secular in Anglo-America remains tied to the Protestantism that birthed it, and has not cleft for historians in search of a hiding place. Religious studies’ critical evaluation of secularism underscores two generations of feminist scholarship in demonstrating the false dichotomy between public and private on which secularism depended.<sup>38</sup> Beyond these insights, though, scholars of religion offer a distinct critique undermining the false opposition between private religion and the secular public sphere. Talal Asad asks,

How have different conceptions and practices of religion helped to form the ability of listeners to be publicly responsive? For the experience of religion in the ‘private’ spaces of the home and school is crucial to the formation of subjects who will eventually inhabit a particular public culture.<sup>39</sup>

Linda Kintz answers this question with her graceful consideration of conservative Christianity's 'resonance', or its ability to link together as political actors people with few overt shared interests, based on their common emotional understandings. The work of familiarizing conservative cosmology, she argues, falls to a sacred style of motherhood that teaches absolute moral categories, independent of context. 'Children are raised to feel and experience their own sensuality, their own bodies, in very particular ways, and to look for and find others whose feeling, values, and identities are intimately familiar to them'.<sup>40</sup> Resonance at this somatic level familiarizes the assumptions that subsequent kinds of rational argumentation will invoke politically. There is, then, no real dividing line between public and private, religious belief and political action, for these Christians.

To take this insight to the historiographical field in question, re-entangling the secular and the religious frees us to ask whether the mid-nineteenth-century Latin American Liberals who so aggressively pruned back the Church's privileges may have been removing one form of religion in the public sphere to replace it with another.<sup>41</sup> Given the century's feminization of the Church charted by Sol Serrano, Pamela Voekel, and Margaret Chowning, the Liberals' new notions of what constituted secular society may well have served to delegitimize women's epistemologies from the new 'public sphere'.<sup>42</sup> The horror of the feminine – now there's an age-old faith.

Modernization theory and related imperialist imaginings posit secularization as modernity's telos. By refusing neat distinctions between the secular and the religious, and certainly by refusing to privilege the former over the latter, religious studies scholars render this imperial trope senseless and simultaneously demystify modernity's irrational myth at one of its key points.

### *Faith versus Reason*

Shaking up the opposition between the sacred and the secular weakens the mutual exclusivity of faith and reason. Religion has been deemed the provenance of the transcendent and the communitarian, whereas the secular world jealously claims the exclusive ownership of instrumental rationality.<sup>43</sup> The Enlightenment projected this distinction upon the colonial and post-colonial map, amalgamating reason and imperialism, religion and subalternity.

Religious studies destabilizes this distinction from both ends, unearthing the traces of faith within the secular and of rationality within religion. Western scientific rationality's pretense of universality depended on relegating other histories and epistemologies to the realm of the fantastic, the implausible, the traditional, and the stagnant. But rationalism – understood as the narrow, reductive, *cogito* version of

productive thought that came to stand for the whole – built its distinctions on sand.

Far from supplanting the category of religious magic, scientific progress invented it. Historians of Latin America and the Caribbean now document the knowledge – and the people – sacrificed on provincial Western magic's violent journey to universal scientific rationality.<sup>44</sup> In early Republican Cuba, Stephan Palmié explains, scientists in thrall to Cesare Lombroso's phrenological theories of criminality cast practitioners of Afro-Cuban religion as atavistic barbarians that threatened the 'civilized' nation-state. In the wave of panic that swept the island, the *brujos* were accused of trafficking in human remains and engaging in human sacrifice, those classic slurs of colonialism. But, reflecting the belief that anatomically visible stigmata marked the criminal, photos of these religious leaders' heads were captured on the pages of anthropologist Fernando Ortiz's 1906 treatise on Afro-Cuban spiritual practices.<sup>45</sup> And, in a tragic incident in 1919, a mob intent on killing a group of captured *brujos* stormed a Havana prison. The guards sacrificed the prisoners by shooting them. During this period as well many of the black religious leaders' body parts were trafficked to the national anthropology museum, where phrenologists spun their own authority out of these grisly remains. Here scientific reason created superstition and then ritually sacrificed its adherents to the fetish of the Republican nation-state.<sup>46</sup>

Some scholars, indeed, productively question aspects of their own technique, implicated in the same faith-reason dichotomy that they seek to problematize. Palmié invokes Afro-Cuban spiritist practices to probe Western historians' linear conceptions of 'unbridgeable temporal distance between past and present realities', which render illegible historical subjectivities marked by simultaneity and an immanent conception of the transcendent.<sup>47</sup>

Palmié's diagnosis of Western narrative as an exclusionary project irresistibly recalls Walter Benjamin's lifelong project to employ Jewish mystical theology in the service of Marxism.<sup>48</sup> Benjamin attacks the 'homogeneous, empty time' of 19th-century historicism for inscribing narratives of progress defined by the ruling classes and consigning subaltern historical actors to oblivion. In response, historical materialism enlists theology to advance a conception of Messianic time, drawn from the Kabala. In this 'time filled with the presence of the now', every second carries within it the possibility of redemption. The present creates its own history not through linear narratives, but by recognizing fleeting images from the past as incarnations of its own concerns, arising 'at a moment of danger'. In its search for a usable past, this theological-historical materialism literally transcends the continuum of historicism and stops linear time. The 'Messianic cessation of happening' is 'a revolutionary chance in the fight for the oppressed

past', for it empowers the working class to recognize utopian possibility in the past as immanent in the present and future.<sup>49</sup> Both Palmié and Benjamin deploy religious, non-linear, quasi-simultaneous notions of time to recall historical subjectivities marginalized and forgotten by the exclusions of Western historical narrative.

Working from the pasts of Haiti, historians and religious scholars push these insights even further, demonstrating that Western historical epistemology itself is not as far removed from other divining practices as we might like to think. Michel-Rolph Trouillot joins Arjun Appadurai in arguing that the conventions of historical credibility operate across societies independently of the Western academic tradition.<sup>50</sup> The erasure of the Haitian revolution from its ideologically and materially central place in the age of revolution, Laurent Dubois further declares, can be described as the operation of 'magical processes' of 'skilled revelation and concealment' on the part of historians.<sup>51</sup> These sorceries, for example, erased ex-slave Jean-Jacques Dessalines from his role in the revolution, his contribution to the universal right of man.

But Dubois takes the analysis in a different direction. He introduces Josué, a Vodou priest dwelling in a contemporary polyglot Parisian suburb. Dessalines regularly takes possession of the priest, using his voice to help people in a racist nation 'understand they are all united'.<sup>52</sup> Vodou preserves historical memory in songs, in possession, in dance, and in 'the commentary made through the manipulation and placement of objects such as the Haitian flag, the palm, the machete, and the elements that form altars'.<sup>53</sup> These may not be the easiest of sources from which to read the past, but the fortunes of the Haitian Revolution at the hands of formal historians do not offer much hope for their method, either. Indeed, says Trouillot, from the very moment of the revolution's inception, France's rational chroniclers rejected the evidence of their senses.<sup>54</sup>

Similarly, Dubois continues, scholar Leon Francois Hoffman undertook to debunk the country's foundational myth of a Vodou ceremony held at Bois-Caïman on the eve of the Haitian revolution. But the revolutionary myth of the Bastille itself owed much of its inscription into archives to the 'new religion' of the Republic. The incident at Bois-Caïman may or may not have happened, but it most certainly did not enjoy the same access to immediate historicization as its Parisian counterpart, the production and conservation of records so distinct from Vodou's necessary surreptitiousness. Moreover, it is not history but Vodou, through its sacred performances of the Bois-Caïman legend, that has kept alive the truth of women's participation in the 1791 insurrection. Who is really practicing irrational history?<sup>55</sup>

Facing the irrationalities that haunt our own discipline raises obvious costs for historians, eroding still further the triumphant certitude that

we now know. As if to ease the pain of this humbling move, religious studies provide the humanistic discipline of history a platform for investigating the truth claims of its old archrival, the hyper-mathematical form of economics that took hold in the academy in decades after World War II.<sup>56</sup> Some strains of this analysis have long histories among Latin Americanists and Caribbeanists. Fernando Ortiz's 1940 'allegorical tale' of tobacco and sugar as agents in Cuban history, writes Fernando Coronil in a new introduction, revealed 'commodities for what they are, social things impersonating autonomous actors'.<sup>57</sup> Likewise, scholars of Latin America have treated generations of students to Michael Taussig's stories of money that magically multiplies, growing like trees, if not actually on them – stories told by Colombian peasants and Wall Street financiers alike.<sup>58</sup>

More recently, Jean and John L. Comaroff have updated Taussig's work to fit the global post-Fordist economy, exploring the joint proliferation of 'occult economies and prosperity cults'.<sup>59</sup> Cargo cults, the gospel of health and wealth, rumors of zombies who steal your job and gringas who sell your organs – a pervasive concern, in other words, with supernatural forms of enterprise – all these, they assert, have exploded in recent years.<sup>60</sup> In the role of causality, the Comaroffs finger casino capitalism, the massive international flows of speculative finance that have uncoupled production from wealth creation.<sup>61</sup> Whose prosperity gospel is irrational if fabulous riches seemingly sprout from ethereal transactions everywhere we look?

In the generation of structural adjustment, the specter haunting Latin America has been Horatio Alger – or, more accurately, one of his rags-to-riches characters. Among a small technocratic class in the region's charismatic megachurches, support for entrepreneurial bootstrapping is not hard to come by. A young president of the Guatemalan Christian Businessmen's Association pays it homage with these words:

There are people who come to *Lluvias de Gracia* or other Christian churches and they pray, '*Señor, abra la puerta de los cielos, Señor*, rain down on me the riches I know are stored there, make me a millionaire!' But that's not how it works! You have to make the effort, and then it comes so easily. There's no shame in starting small: cut people's hair, change the oil in people's cars, make hamburgers, whatever – just make the best hamburgers, offer the best service, and you will succeed.<sup>62</sup>

This small businessman has many academic allies in his personal prescription for development. Scholars long searched for the Puritan in the *favela* whose savings could propel the continent out of agrarian dependency. Emilio Willems expected the Protestant ethic in Chile and Brazil to pay off big in an emerging Latin American industrial order. Jean-Pierre Bastian argued that late twentieth-century Pentecostals had betrayed the modernizing promise of their sober nineteenth-

century Protestant forebears. David Martin holds a more hopeful view of Pentecostalism in Latin America, seeing in it an updated Methodism that could similarly take the region down the English road of prosperity. And, indeed, Sheldon Annis found Protestant Guatemalan weavers ahead of their Catholic neighbors in earnings and savings.<sup>63</sup>

Here the scholars' exuberant faith joins that of the spirit-filled churches, for the original Horatio Alger tales were always a first-world zombie myth. Not diligence and thrift but extraordinary strokes of fortune transformed the working-class protagonists of dime novels into dukes and millionaires.<sup>64</sup> By the era of flexible production, however, these stories of fortunes spun by fortune circulated as straightforward exhortations to discipline. Each year in the United States, the Horatio Alger Award is presented to Americans exemplifying 'remarkable achievements accomplished through honesty, hard work, self-reliance, and perseverance'.<sup>65</sup>

But as in the dime novels, a magical *deus ex machina* is at work for many of these self-made men, in their unearned bonanza from the New Deal federal state. Produced largely by Northern industry, the money fell on the booming post-war Sunbelt like manna from heaven, but its beneficiaries insisted on their autogenesis. The biography of 1972 honoree H. Ross Perot demonstrates the strenuous repression required to sustain the myth of autonomous upward mobility. His publicly-financed education at the United States Naval Academy was followed by four years of technical development in the Cold War military. He then worked for IBM, a key recipient of defense contracts. In 1962, his wife gave him \$1000 saved from her schoolteacher's salary as seed money for his data processing company. With lucrative federal contracts to computerize Medicare records, Electronic Data Systems made Perot into the 'fastest, richest Texan' of the 1960s. Like a true Horatio Alger hero, Perot and the entire Sunbelt boom built fortunes on the invisible magic of Cold War federal subsidy. By denying the magical transformation, the carriers of this rational myth can continue to dream of riches in ragged Guatemala's future.

The myths of Orange County defense contractors, then, can be as fantastical as those of Bolivian tin miners. Spirit possession and memory can sometimes more closely mirror the past than the official record. Scientists, historians, and *brujos* can all work their magic through possession of the dead. Transnational history would do well to heed these insights from religious studies, for they recommend humility rather than imperial hubris.

### *Tradition versus Modernity*

If historians of religion challenge us to think in new ways about the reductive oppositions of religion and secularism and faith and rationality,

then a third contribution to anti-imperialist scholarship has been its refusal to accept that the struggle between religious tradition and modernity constitutes a zero-sum game. Recent work shows how modernist elites invented traditions as cultural categories, and recovers supposedly anachronistic subaltern religious practices as alternative modernities. This work also shows that religion can generate notions of politics and community formerly thought to be anathema to it. In so doing, these scholarly interventions refuse modernization theory's conflation of modernity with secularization and its notion that cultures occupy different temporal zones or positions on an evolutionary ladder.

Following the work of James Scott, Latin American historians have demonstrated that religious tradition often supplied modernity's victims with an ethical critique of the forces arrayed against them. The story classically opens with the arrival of the railroad, the vehicle of violent, disruptive capitalist relations. Given that starting point, however, peasant moral economies appear as the historical constant, leaving the reader the impression that they are static and unchanging. Todd Diacon's analysis of a millenarian revolt in turn-of-the-century Brazil, for example, underscores that exterior modernizing forces rapidly rent asunder the area's traditional social relations. Former patrons with religiously sanctioned ties to their tenant clients sold lands out from under them and delivered their now landless and desacralized charges to the railroad as wage laborers. Promising moral regeneration, the millenarian rebels called the elites back from the impending moral chaos into holy redoubts with venerable, if idealized, norms of religiously mandated reciprocity.<sup>66</sup> Here progressive, forward-moving forces clash with traditional and implicitly unchanging ones.

Influenced by subaltern studies and by secularization theorists like those above, a new wave of scholars reject the paradigm of dynamic secular societies encroaching on static religious ones, and favor instead the notion of 'alternative modernities'. As historian Reinaldo Román documents, Hilario Mustelier Garzón and other 'man-gods' attracted pilgrims and novelty-seekers during Cuba's Independence era. In 1920s Puerto Rico, illiterate tobacco worker Julia Vázquez lured those seeking spiritual solace to the mountains of San Lorenzo; her life inspired a blockbuster film. Their elite countrymen shuddered at the shame of it, for these curers challenged notions of individual identity with their beliefs in spirit possession and multi-faceted souls. In short, they confounded the universal verities that the era's scientists and proponents of 'rational' religion struggled mightily to impose.

But these popular religious leaders, Román explains, should not be read as atavistic outcasts of a modernizing world. Their self-conscious modernity more approximated the truth than did their detractors' accusations of primitivism and superstition. Like Flores Galindo's rebels, Román's *curanderos* are masters of invention, although his careful



historicizing leads him to conclude that Vázquez ‘was neither as innovative as salon Spiritists wanted to make out, nor as atavistic and backwards-gazing as rationalist critics charged’.<sup>67</sup> She and her fellow Caribbean curers vied for the meaning of modernity rather than rejecting it outright; no defensive struggles to preserve tradition here. Like Dipesh Chakrabarty, Román insists on the heterogeneity of modern ways of being in the world. Rather than resorting to ‘a project of cultural relativism’, or to descriptive *costumbrismo*, he heeds Chakrabarty’s exhortation to re-envision history as a site of ‘contradictory, plural, and heterogeneous struggles’ that play a decisive role in deciding ‘whose and which “universal” wins’.<sup>68</sup>

Many Latin American historians, then, have seen the wisdom of historicizing ‘tradition’, even when the traditions in question are religious. Given the essential common sense of this insight – how likely was it, after all, that belief remained unchanged while all changed around it? – the question remains why it is not more fully embraced in historical practice. An example from the US context suggests why North American practitioners may be slow to relinquish this particular dichotomy.

When Ronald Reagan completed the political revolution that Barry Goldwater began, liberal historians were caught by surprise: Hadn’t modernity reached even the Tennessee of the Scopes trial, thanks to the TVA? Didn’t Atlanta have a freeway, and Houston a space center? Weren’t these people finally on national time? The presumption of religion’s incompatibility with New Deal-style uplift stranded liberals in a continual state of wonderment at the post-war revival. In fact, like Galindo’s Andean rebels, the reputed anti-modernists have shown a consistent talent for innovation. Fundamentalism itself, some religious scholars argue, is the application of classically modern, scientific forms of understanding to a previously mystical text, the Bible.<sup>69</sup> The romance of air power captivated twentieth-century evangelicals as both broadcasting and flight. The ‘gospel of the air’ was a recurring image, and with the relatively low capital demands of independent radio and a veteran generation trained in radio technology, innumerable Christian enterprises put the Word out on the airwaves. Post-war mission publications carried titles like ‘Gospel Rocket’ and today the apocalyptic *Left Behind* series of best-selling Christian novels features ‘unflappable globetrotters’ equally at home with Gulfstream jets, the Internet, and ghostly flying horsemen.<sup>70</sup> Barred from access to the major television networks, evangelists built an alternative cable empire in the 1970s, and the Moral Majority created a new political constituency out of computerized direct mail campaigns.<sup>71</sup>

Thus in the US, historians report the wreck of the good ship Modernity on the Rock of Ages. Yet some liberal observers still relentlessly Orientalize their Christian fellow-citizens, and marvel over

high-tech church services with the same pornographic glee as Panajachel tourists gawking at the Maya with the Gameboy. 'They are drawn as if by magnetic forces', writes *Harper's* editor Jeff Sharlet, to the megachurches in Colorado's sanitized suburbs, making theirs a story about 'newness: new houses, new roads, new stores' that nevertheless insists on 'oldness, imagined'.<sup>72</sup> The *Boston Globe Magazine* reports that preachers with North Carolina accents – that tell-tale stamp of the primitive – are drawing even Harvard's best and brightest, who now 'clap and sway' in slack-jawed ecstasy.<sup>73</sup> This resemblance, this fascination with the odd hybrid, 'half . . . defender of traditional lifestyle, half entrepreneurial innovator', suggests the lingering collusion between progressive liberalism and the imperial denial of coevalness.<sup>74</sup> They might benefit from a reading of Flores Galindo.

The folks who supposedly crawled away in shame from the Scopes trial now reside at the White House. And as the Bryanites have risen, the party of Darrow has taken some hard hits: At our current juncture, science's former giddy promise to liberate man from nature, Ulrich Beck asserts, has given way to cleaning up its own obvious messes and calculating the inevitable risks of future ones.<sup>75</sup> With religion waxing and science waning, and with scholars pointing out their points of contact, we are now ready to concede that modernity and religion are not in a zero-sum game. Indeed, so powerful have these critiques become that even the crucible of the secular nation-state, the Enlightenment, and the so-called century of secularization, the nineteenth, are falling under their spell. The French Revolution's iconoclastic de-Christianization campaigns have not only been provincialized, but some scholars even point to the French Revolution's religious origins.<sup>76</sup>

The new objective science, the democratic public sphere of reasoned debate, the rights-bearing sovereign individual: in the classical rendering, obscurantist, authoritarian religion simply retreated when faced with the inexorable forward march of these secular Enlightenment heroes. In eighteenth-century Mexico, however, it was not secular *philosophes* who declared war on religion to free the individual, Pamela Voekel argues, but rather an emerging strain of Catholicism that elevated the individual to the starting point of knowledge – a move which actually proved conducive to new scientific epistemologies. Enlightened Mexican Catholicism's Augustinian notion of grace even led to the rehabilitation of human nature – a necessary pre-condition for the rights-bearing individual. And entry into the new public sphere of letters proved contingent on knowledge of religious tradition, not appeal to universal secular reason. 'Let hell vomit forth Voltaire', demanded an enlightened public intellectual: Christianity alone sufficed to justify democracy.<sup>77</sup> In Mexico as in the larger Atlantic world, religion was modernity's crucible and companion, not its spurned antecedent.

*Obedience versus Free Will*

Since the Enlightenment, religion has been cast as part of the traditional culture that modern societies had transcended or effectively rationalized and banished to a narrow, private sphere. Relationships with the divine that spilled outside this sphere were atavistic and threatening remnants of an earlier time, or, for some scholars, heroic bearers of pre-capitalist ethics that fueled resistance to modernity. They were not, however, part of coeval real time itself.

Religious studies have cast a jaundiced eye on the classic juxtaposition of tradition and freedom, obedience and free will. The notion that freedom must be defined as freedom *from* – from hierarchy, from tradition, from dependence on the supernatural – relies on a particular notion of the subject. In addition, sanctimonious liberalism's contribution to imperial ventures in our lifetimes has moved many scholars to rethink the classical scale that gauged freedom by the subject's political and moral autonomy.<sup>78</sup> In her examination of a fundamentalist revival among Egyptian Muslim women, Saba Mahmood cautions against the academic project of axiomatically searching for 'agency' or redemptive acts of 'resistance' when we analyze active participation in social structures that subordinate women. Instead, she counsels us to allow such encounters to

speak back to the normative liberal assumptions about human nature against which such a movement is held accountable – such as the belief that all human beings have an innate desire for freedom, that we all somehow seek to assert our autonomy when allowed to do so, that human agency primarily consists of acts that challenge social norms and not those that uphold them.<sup>79</sup>

Cecília Loreto Mariz, María das Dores Campos Machado, and Elizabeth Brusco have all arrived at a similar surprising conclusion: in the Latin American context, evangelical Christianity may function as a form of feminism. Brusco asserts that as Colombia was transformed into a post-peasant society in the late twentieth century, male and female realms diverged as they have under industrialism generally. Women moved into a female domestic sphere; men increasingly participated in the homosocial culture of street and work. In Brusco's account, however, evangelical women successfully domesticated these wayward men: when Christ freed their husbands from Lucifer, they received the will to resist expensive worldly temptations, especially alcohol, smoking, and gambling. These men eschewed brothels and bars and instead spent their earnings on radios and refrigerators, diapers and deep fryers; evangelical men, in short, embraced women's domestic priorities. In contrast to liberal feminism, Brusco argues, the Colombian Pentecostalism she studied

is not attempting to gain access for women to the male world; rather, it elevates domesticity, for both men and women, from the devalued position it

occupies as the result of the process of proletarianization. It does serve to transform gender roles, primarily by reattaching males to the family.<sup>80</sup>

Here is agency that works by transforming patriarchy – not by overthrowing it in the name of freeing an autonomous subject to pursue her own interests.

Taking these Pentecostal women's agency seriously entails taking the relational subject seriously. Freedom for these women is not another word for no one left to lose, a fully autonomous ego's battle to shuck off all cultural, economic, and religious dependencies. These women's dependence on God to resist Satan and their seeming submission to patriarchal authority in the home is anything but passive; their effect on their daily lives is momentous.

They have much to teach us. The cultivation of the rational bourgeois self, as Ann Laura Stoler argues, requires not only the expropriation of surplus value to produce wealth but also a necessary projection of all that is bodily, feminine, emotional, non-rational, and intersubjective onto others. These projections then haunt the subject in the form of desires for those with those imputed traits.<sup>81</sup> A fully autonomous person is as illusory as a self-generated nation-state. As literary scholar María Josefina Saldaña-Portillo has argued, twentieth-century revolutionaries like Che Guevara shared with their Washington antagonists a belief that autonomous, deracinated subjectivity was the highest form of consciousness. The task for both Che's guerillas and Washington's development experts, therefore, was to liberate peasants from their ethnic particularities, including religious beliefs, to usher them from tradition into a higher form of individual or universal proletarian consciousness. Saldaña-Portillo urges us to learn from Guevara's mistakes.<sup>82</sup>

The stakes in missing this lesson are high. As we have seen, scholarship on religion challenges the notion that the rights-bearing individual and his democratic freedoms are the property of any one country. It also demonstrates that liberal freedoms can be produced in a religious crucible, such as the trans-Atlantic networks of enlightened Catholics. In so doing, transnational history undercuts the imperialist trope of democracy promotion at the same time that it resists the faith-reason binary. What Mahmood, Saldaña-Portillo, Loreto, das Dores Campos Machado, and Brusco all suggest is that the universal sovereign subject who is the bearer of rights is neither the only form of subjectivity nor a necessarily superior one.

And indeed the glorification of the autonomous, deracinated subject as democracy's only core can be deadly. As historian Greg Grandin argues, in Central America the procedural democratic freedoms packaged with the 1990s free market economic model, the fabled 'Washington Consensus', carried a high price tag indeed: the extreme violence of the Guatemalan, El Salvadoran, and *Contra* armies in the 1980s, a violence that systematically eliminated anyone who included redistributive

economic justice and not just procedural freedoms in democracy's definition. William Robinson argues in fact that the explicit US foreign policy priority of 'democracy promotion' in the 1980s and 1990s is premised on precisely this devaluation of citizenship. The particular version of democracy to be promoted is not a timeless one. Rather, it 'isolates explicitly the political from the social and economic spheres and situates democracy within the bounds of the former (and even at that, it limits democratic participation to voting on elections)'.<sup>83</sup> Thus the form of democracy proliferates as its content dwindles.

Failing to take relational subjectivity seriously as a form of consciousness feeds the imperialist imperative to liberate the illusory autonomous subject from his oppressive cultural moorings. If you believe in this autonomous subject who rationally pursues his own interests unfettered by man or God, then 'tradition' and 'custom' can only signal a lack of rational evaluation, a failure to exercise autonomous will. Thus while consent rather than coercion is the basis of democratic rule, those who cling to their communities and religions can be subjected to 'necessary pedagogic violence' to bring them to reason. In this scenario, resistance to the civilizing project can only be read as 'they hate our freedoms'. In Dussel's words, 'the myth of modernity declares the Other the culpable cause of its own victimization and absolves the modern subject of any guilt for the victimizing act'.<sup>84</sup>

### *Conclusion*

At its best, transnational history strikes a blow to imperialism, revealing the myriad cultural and economic inputs underlying national delusions of autonomy. But merely telling the stories that fall outside the container of the nation-state or detailing the transnational processes that go into its making does not guarantee this outcome. The transnational is indeed a key category of analysis, but it is an empty category. The content that we give it matters. Histories – even transnational histories – that work within the binary oppositions of religion versus secularism, faith versus reason, modernity versus tradition, and obedience versus free will risk strengthening some of imperialism's favorite tropes.

Merely recognizing that belief overflows national containers does not guarantee anti-imperialist interventions, any more than the ubiquity of Coca-Cola signals a world in perfect harmony. At its best, transnational history tackles Dussel's 'myth of modernity' head on, accounting for the global flow of culture and wealth roiling behind claims to national or individual autonomy. If we fail to heed the lessons of religious studies, however, this accounting will be only partial, and will risk strengthening the very concepts that galvanize support for imperialist projects. Secularism is not religion's stalking alter-ego; neither faith nor scientific reason occupies an Archimedean point above historical contingency; modernity

and tradition are not in a zero-sum game; and, finally, 'no one left to lose' is not a superior definition of freedom.

### *Acknowledgements*

We would like to thank our anonymous reviewer at *History Compass* and our colleagues at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas for their constructive criticisms of this article. We are indebted to Laura Briggs, Frida Gorbach, Gabriela Sánchez Hernández, David Sartorius, Lia Schraeder, and especially Micol Seigel.

### *Short Biographies*

#### PAMELA VOEKEL

Pamela Voekel is an associate professor of history at the University of Georgia in Athens. She is the co-director of the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, an annual week-long workshop that brings together scholars from throughout the Americas. For more information on the Tepoztlán Institute, please see *Social Text* 92, 25/3 (summer 2007). She is the author of *Alone before God: The Religious Origins of Modernity in Mexico*.

#### BETHANY MORETON

Bethany Moreton is an assistant professor of history and women's studies at the University of Georgia in Athens. She is a founding member of the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas and an affiliate of the Yale Working Group on Globalization and Culture. Her book *Everyday Values: Wal-Mart and the Making of Christian Free Enterprise* is under contract with Harvard University Press.

#### MICHAEL JO

Michael Jo received a Ph.D. in history from Yale University in 2007.

### *Notes*

\* Correspondence address: University of Georgia – History, LeConte Hall, Athens Georgia 30602, USA. Email: voekel@uga.edu.

<sup>1</sup> See, for example, the various articles on the field in the *Journal of American History*, 86/2 (September, 1999) and the *American Historical Review*, 96/4 (October 1991). We should state clearly that transnational history as a distinct approach has quite different intellectual and political valences outside of the USA, the dominant nation-state of the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. We are here consciously addressing fellow historians writing from within that specific context, in the recognition that others lie outside the scope of this piece.

<sup>2</sup> A. Kaplan, 'Violent Belongings and the Question of Empire Today', Presidential Address to the American Studies Association, October 17, 2003, *American Quarterly*, 56/1 (March 2004): 2.

<sup>3</sup> The American Studies scholars calling for more transnational history as an antidote to American exceptionalism are not arguing that transnational history is a new project. Rather, they argue that it was an existing project submerged by the high tide of historical professionalization that occurred throughout the twentieth century – a process that tended to make professional historians both male and pale. Robin D. G. Kelley points out that early twentieth century black intellectuals were never invited to imagine themselves as part of the national community. 'How could anyone not write histories that were transnational in this context?', he asks, concluding that 'it is unfortunate that the same forces that compelled these scholars to look to the world also contributed to their relative silence in the profession, for had their vision been taken seriously, it could have overthrown American nationalism, jingoistic historiography once and for all'. Kelley, "'But a Local Phase of a World Problem": Black History's Global Vision, 1883–1950', *Journal of American History*, 86/3 (December 1999): 1077. Also see Laura Briggs, Gladys McCormick, and J. T. Way, 'Gender and Transnationalism in Latin American History', paper presented at the Tepoztlán Institute for Transnational History, Tepoztlán, Morelos, July 27–August 3, 2005; Shelley Fisher Fishkin, 'Crossroads of Cultures: The Transnational Turn in American Studies', *American Quarterly*, 57/1 (2005): 17–57; Kaplan, 'Violent Belongings'; Anne M. Martínez, 'Bordering on the Sacred: Religion, Nation, and U.S.-Mexican Relations, 1910–1929', Ph.D. dissertation (University of Minnesota, 2003), 3–27; Micol Seigel, 'Beyond Compare: Comparative Method after the Transnational Turn', *Radical History Review* (December 2004): 62–89; Michelle A. Stephens, 'Black Transnationalism and the Politics of National Identity: West Indian Intellectuals in Harlem in the Age of War and Revolution', *American Quarterly*, 50/3 (1998): 592–608.

<sup>4</sup> Manuel A. Vásquez, 'Toward a New Agenda for the Study of Religion in the Americas', *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs*, Special issue: *Churches in America: Religion, Globalization, and Democratization*, 41/4 (Winter 1999): 15.

<sup>5</sup> 'If we all agree that the importance of revisionism in history is opening up new questions that force us to see familiar processes or relationships in a new light, then it seems to me that the most important historical discussions will always go on at the margins – between different epistemological and methodological traditions, in the interstices between different fields and approaches'. Florencia Mallon, 'Time on the Wheel: Cycles of Revisionism and the New Cultural History', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 79/2 (May 1999): 336.

<sup>6</sup> The intellectual antecedents of transnational history are much more thoroughly explained in the works cited above in note 3, from which this account draws, and in Seigel, 'Beyond Compare'.

<sup>7</sup> For a representative sampling of some of the most influential works of this tradition, see Sidney W. Mintz, *Sweetness and Power. The Place of Sugar in Modern History* (New York, NY: Viking, 1985); Eduardo Galeano, *Open Veins of Latin America: Five Centuries of the Pillage of a Continent* (New York, NY: Monthly Review Press, 1975); Fernando Henrique Cardoso and Faletto Enzo, *Dependency and Development in Latin America* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1978); Caio Prado, Jr., *Formação do Brasil contemporâneo: Colônia* (Sao Paulo: Livraria Martins, 1942); Immanuel M. Wallerstein, *The Capitalist World Economy. Essays by Immanuel Wallerstein* (Cambridge/New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 1979); Steve J. Stern, 'Feudalism, Capitalism, and the World System in the Perspective of Latin America and the Caribbean', reprinted in *Confronting Historical Paradigms: Peasants, Labor, and the Capitalist World System in Africa and Latin America*, eds. Frederick Cooper et al. (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1993), 23–82.

<sup>8</sup> C. L. R. James, *The Black Jacobins: Toussaint L'Ouverture and the San Domingo Revolution* (New York, NY: Vintage, 1963); Laurent Dubois, *Avengers of the New World: The Story of the Haitian Revolution* (Cambridge, MA/London: Harvard University Press, 2004). Even Philip D. Curtin's early article tracing the reception of the Declaration of the Rights of Man in colonial Saint-Domingue, which assumed that the slave revolt of 1791 must have been inspired from without since 'the force of opinion among the slaves . . . was the only effective force keeping three-fourths of the population in subjection', pointed to the free African nativity of roughly two-thirds of the slaves and to a century of slave revolts predating the revolution. Curtin, 'The

Declaration of the Rights of Man in Saint-Domingue, 1788–1791', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 30/2 (1950): 171. On Bolívar's response to the Haitian Revolution, see Lester D. Langley, *The Americas in the Age of Revolution, 1750–1850* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1996), 196–200. The transnational or Atlantic World creation of liberal freedoms has its historiographical parallel in the intellectual histories that eschew diffusionist or core-to-periphery models of cultural interaction in favor of highlighting transnational networks and cultural webs. See, for example, Fernando Coronil's discussion of 'transculturation' in his new introduction to Fernando Ortiz's 1947 classic *Cuban Counterpoint: Tobacco and Sugar* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1995), xl–xlvii. Also see Mauricio Tenorio Trillo, 'Stereophonic Scientific Modernisms: Social Science between Mexico and the United States, 1880s–1930s', *Journal of American History*, 86/3 (December 1999): 1156–87; Edmundo O'Gorman, *Do the Americas Have a Common History?*, trans. Angel Flores (Washington, DC: Division of Intellectual Cooperation, Pan American Union, 1941).

<sup>9</sup> US marine and popular author John Craig quoted in Laurent Dubois, 'The Citizen's Trance: The Haitian Revolution and the Motor of History', in *Magic and Modernity: Interfaces of Revelation and Concealment*, eds. Birgit Meyer and Peter Pels (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003), 117.

<sup>10</sup> Sara Diamond has detailed the connections between the covert *contra* war against Nicaragua and a private aid network that funneled resources and personnel from such interesting bedfellows as Pat Robertson's Christian Broadcasting Network, the Unification Church – better known as the Moonies – and the Catholic Knights of Malta, alongside national neoconservative lobbyists and paramilitary soldiers of fortune. Sara Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare: The Politics of the Christian Right* (Boston, MA: South End Press, 1989), 161–81.

<sup>11</sup> Steve Brouwer, Paul Gifford, and Susan D. Rose, *Exporting the American Gospel: Global Christian Fundamentalism* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1996), 11. Not all scholars championing an import/export model are located in the United States. See, for example, Hugo Assman, *A Igreja Electronica y Su Impacto Na America Latina* (San José, Costa Rica: Departamento Ecueménico de Investigaciones, 1987). Manuel A. Vásquez and Marie Friedman Marquardt offer an alternative to Brouwer et al. and Assman's cultural export and import model of Christianity. They offer the neologism 'glocalization' to describe the local uses and adaptations of even the most global ideologies and products. See Manuel A. Vásquez and Marie Friedman Marquardt, *Globalizing the Sacred: Religion Across the Americas* (New Brunswick, NJ/London: Rutgers University Press, 2003), 197–222.

<sup>12</sup> Brouwer, Gifford, and Rose, *Exporting the American Gospel*, 11.

<sup>13</sup> The Boeing example, from 1994, appears in William Greider, *One World, Ready or Not: The Manic Logic of Global Capitalism* (New York, NY: Simon & Schuster, 1997), 125.

<sup>14</sup> Recent contributions to the literature on colonial missions, to name just one example, have focused less on the relationship between a particular mission field and Rome (or Spain or Portugal) and instead emphasized the web-like connections between missionaries across the globe. See, for example, Luke Sean Clossey, 'Distant Souls: Global Religion and the Jesuit Missions of Germany, Mexico, and China, 1595–1705', Ph.D. dissertation (University of California Berkeley, 2004); Dauril Alden, *The Making of an Enterprise: The Society of Jesus in Portugal, its Empire, and Beyond, 1540–1750* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996).

<sup>15</sup> Sidney E. Ahlstrom, *A Religious History of the American People*, 2nd ed, Foreword and Concluding chapter by David D. Hall (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2004), 816–22.

<sup>16</sup> Allan Anderson, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 19–38.

<sup>17</sup> Gastón Espinosa, 'Borderland Religion: Los Angeles and the Origins of the Latino Pentecostal Movement in the U.S., Mexico, and Puerto Rico, 1900–1945', Ph.D. Dissertation (University of California Santa Barbara, 1999). For an introduction to transnational religious studies focused on the contemporary period, see Susanne Hoeber Rudolph and James Piscatori (eds.), *Transnational Religion and Fading States* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997); for a review of contemporary sociological research on religious migrant communities, see Peggy Levitt, 'Redefining the Boundaries of Belonging: The Institutional Character of Transnational Religious Life', *Sociology of Religion*, 65/1 (2004): 1–18. Not surprisingly given Pentecostalism's



transnational origins, a number of scholars working on Protestantism in the Caribbean and elsewhere have rejected the foreign import model. See, for example, Nérida Agosto Cintrón, *Religión y cambio social en Puerto Rico (1898–1940)* (Río Piedras, PR: Ediciones Huracán, 1996); Elizabeth Carrillo and Minerva Rodríguez, *Pentecostalismo y espiritismo* (Havana: Editorial Academia, 1997); and Luis Martínez Fernández, *Protestantism and Political Conflict in the Nineteenth-Century Hispanic Caribbean* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2002). We thank Reinaldo L. Román for pointing these works out to us. For good summaries of the debates over the boom in Protestant conversions in Latin America, see Virginia Garrard Burnett, 'Protestantism in Latin America', *Latin American Research Review*, 27/1 (1992): 218–30; Sarah Cline, 'Competition and Fluidity in Latin American Christianity', *Latin American Research Review*, 35/2 (2000): 244–51; and, most recently, Reinaldo L. Román and Pamela Voekel, 'Enchanted Once More: Popular Religion in Latin America', in José Moya (ed.), *Latin American Historiography* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2007).

<sup>18</sup> Margarita Silva, 'El ideario político de los intelectuales unionistas centroamericanos, 1898–1921', paper given at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July 2005.

<sup>19</sup> Christopher Domínguez Michael, *La Vida de Fray Servando* (Mexico: Ediciones Era, 2005). On the Abbé Grégoire, see Alyssa Goldstein Sepinwall, *The Abbé Grégoire and the French Revolution. The Making of Modern Universalism* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2005). Goldstein Sepinwall points out that the democratic rights promoted by enlightened Catholics like Grégoire were tempered by notions such as the necessary 'regeneration' of particular groups and cultures before they could enjoy those rights – ideas that prevented their universalization. She reminds us that we can find both the seeds of democratic rights and their exclusions in these men's thought. Pamela Voekel explores the connections between enlightened Catholics and the birth of liberal freedoms and their exclusions in her *Alone before God. The Religious Origins of Modernity in Mexico* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002).

<sup>20</sup> Dale K. Van Kley, 'Patriotism', unpublished paper, July 2005. Van Kley is careful to point out that the Patriot/neo-Augustinian versus Monarchical/neo-Pelagian split did not prevail in every European case he studied. We thank Professor Van Kley for sending us this unpublished paper.

<sup>21</sup> Silvia M. Arrom, 'Mexican Laywomen Spearhead a Catholic Revival: The Ladies of Charity, 1863–1900', in Martin A. Nesvig (ed.), *Religious Culture in Modern Mexico* (Wilmington, DE: Scholarly Resources Press, 2006); Derek Williams, 'Networks of Catholic Journalism in Nineteenth-Century Latin America', presented at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August 2006; Patricia Londoño Vega, *Religion, Culture, and Society in Colombia: Medellín and Antioquia, 1850–1930* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2002).

<sup>22</sup> Aihwa Ong, *Buddha is Hiding: Refugees, Citizenship, the New America* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2003), ch. 8.

<sup>23</sup> Melani McAlister, *Epic Encounters: Culture, Media, and U.S. Interests in the Middle East* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2001), as well as her ongoing work tentatively entitled *Our God in the World: The Global Visions of American Evangelicals*.

<sup>24</sup> Bethany Moreton, 'The Soul of the Service Economy: Wal-Mart and the Making of Christian Free Enterprise, 1929–1994', Ph.D. dissertation (Yale University, 2006), 352–409; for a brief version of this argument, see Moreton, 'The Soul of Neoliberalism', *Social Text*, 92 (Fall 2007).

<sup>25</sup> Enrique Dussel, *The Invention of the Americas: The Eclipse of 'the Other' and the Myth of Modernity* (New York, NY: Continuum, 1995), 65. Also see Dussel, 'Beyond Eurocentrism: The World-System and the Limits of Modernity', in Frederick Jameson and Masao Miyoshi (eds.), *The Cultures of Globalization* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1998). Latin America, of course, has not had the luxury of laboring under the delusion of autogenesis. It is not at all surprising, then, that left-leaning public intellectuals in Mexico and the US have sounded very different on the question of seeing from the outside in and the political ramifications of transnational histories. In contrast to the works by US scholars cited above, the head of Mexico's National Institute for Anthropology and History, Guillermo Bonfil Batalla, has called

on Mexicans to stop judging themselves by the West's standards and instead measure the West with the yardstick of Mesoamerican culture. Bonfil Batalla, *México profundo: Una civilización negada* (Mexico: CIESAS, 1987); translated as *Mexico Profundo: Reclaiming a Civilization* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1996). That autogenesis and isolationism have not been a Latin American problem is eloquently argued in Roberto Schwarz, 'Brazilian Culture: Nationalism by Elimination', *Misplaced Ideas. Essays on Brazilian Culture*, ed. John Gledson (London/New York, NY: Verso, xxxx), 1–19. A concise discussion of Latin American historiography's early and deep appreciation for world historical currents can be found in Jeremy Adelman, 'Latin American and World Histories: Old and New Approaches to the Pluribus and the Unum', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 84/3 (2004): 399–409, esp. 405.

<sup>26</sup> See, for a most influential example, Walter Rostow, *Stages of Economic Growth. A Non-Communist Manifesto* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1960).

<sup>27</sup> For example, Nicholas Thompson, 'Science Friction: The Growing – and Dangerous – Divide between Scientists and the GOP', *Washington Monthly*, 35 (July/August 2003):11–15; United States House of Representatives Committee on Government Reform Minority Staff, Special Investigations Division, 'Politics and Science in the Bush Administration; prepared for Rep. Henry A Waxman', August 2003, [http://oversight.house.gov/features/politics\\_and\\_science/pdfs/pdf\\_politics\\_and\\_science\\_rep.pdf](http://oversight.house.gov/features/politics_and_science/pdfs/pdf_politics_and_science_rep.pdf). For issues of more immediate concern to historians, see Anne-Marie Borrego, 'Humanities Endowment Returns to "Flagging" Nontraditional Projects', *Chronicle of Higher Education*, January 16, 2004; Ellen Schreker, 'Worse than McCarthy', *Chronicle of Higher Education*, February 19, 2006.

<sup>28</sup> Janet R. Jakobsen, 'Can Homosexuals End Western Civilization as we Know it? Family Values in a Global Economy', in Arnaldo Cruz-Malavé and Martin F Manalansan (eds.), *Queer Globalizations: Citizenship and the Afterlife of Colonialism* (New York, NY/London: New York University Press, 2002), 53.

<sup>29</sup> Valentin H. Rabe, *Home Base of American China Missions, 1880–1920* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press), 129–37.

<sup>30</sup> Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare*, 171.

<sup>31</sup> Janet R. Jakobsen with Ann Pellegrini, 'World Secularisms at the Millennium', *Social Text*, 18/3 (2000): 9.

<sup>32</sup> Dubois, 'Citizen's Trance', 125. The most comprehensive work detailing how outsiders have depicted Haiti as barbarous is Laennec Hurbon's *El bárbaro imaginario*, trans. Jorge Padín (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1993).

<sup>33</sup> Talal Asad, *Formations of the Secular: Christianity, Islam, Modernity* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003).

<sup>34</sup> Banu Subramaniam, 'Archaic Modernities: Science, Secularism and Religion in Modern India', *Social Text*, 18/3 (2000): 72.

<sup>35</sup> Max Weber, *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism* (New York, NY: Penguin Classics, 2002).

<sup>36</sup> Weber, *Protestant Ethic*.

<sup>37</sup> Jakobsen, 'Western Civilization', 64.

<sup>38</sup> Pablo Piccato, 'Introducción: ¿Modelo para armar? Hacia un acercamiento crítico a la teoría de la esfera pública', in Cristina Sacristán and Pablo Piccato (eds.), *Actores, espacios y debates en la historia de la esfera pública en la ciudad de México* (Mexico: Instituto Mora, 2004), 9–41. Also see the debates following Jürgen Habermas's work on the public sphere summarized in Geoff Eley, 'Nations, Publics and Political Culture: Placing Habermas in the Nineteenth Century', in Nicholas B. Dirks, Geoff Eley, and Sherry B. Ortner (eds.), *Culture/Power/History* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993), 297–335; Nancy Fraser, 'What's Critical about Critical Theory? The Case of Habermas and Gender'. *New German Critique*, 35 (Spring/Summer 1985): 97–131.

<sup>39</sup> Asad, *Formations of the Secular*, 185.

<sup>40</sup> Linda Kintz, *Between Jesus and the Market. The Emotions that Matter in Right-Wing America* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1997), 7.

<sup>41</sup> On the question of mid-nineteenth-century Mexican Liberals' religious sensibilities and political projects, see Frederick B. Pike, 'Heresy, Real and Alleged, in Peru: An Aspect of the Conservative-Liberal Struggle, 1830–1875', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 47/1 (February

1967): 50–74; Pamela Voekel, 'Liberal Religion: The Schism of 1861', in Martin Nesvig (ed.), *Religious Culture in Modern Mexico* (New York, NY: Roman and Littlefield, 2007).

<sup>42</sup> Sol Serrano, 'Las mujeres y el templo: La privatización del culto en Santiago de Chile, 1860–1890', paper given at the Berkshire Conference on the History of Women, Claremont, CA, June 2005; Margaret Chowning, 'Liberals, Women, and the Church in Mexico: Politics and the Feminization of Piety, 1700–1930', unpublished paper delivered to the Harvard Latin American Studies Seminar, 2002. Also see Silvia Arrom, 'Mexican Laywomen', and Pamela Voekel, 'La feminización de la piedad barroca en la Ciudad de México, 1620–1850', paper prepared for the conference 'Vida Urbana, Familia y Vida Cotidiana en América Latina', Universidad Católica, Lima, Peru, 1999.

<sup>43</sup> Even as Weber insisted upon the mutual construction of the sacred and the secular in the elaboration of worldly asceticism and the Protestant ethic, he identified the transcendent as the quintessentially religious, and the rational as the quintessentially secular. See Max Weber, 'Religious Rejections of the World and Their Directions', trans. H. H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills, in *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1946 [1915]), 323–59.

<sup>44</sup> See, for example, Walter D. Mignolo, *Local Histories/Global Designs: Coloniality, Subaltern Knowledges, and Border Thinking* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000).

<sup>45</sup> Fernando Ortiz, *Los negros brujo*s (La Habana: Editorial de Ciencias Sociales, 1906); Coronil, 'Introduction', xvii.

<sup>46</sup> Stephan Palmié, *Wizards and Scientists: Explorations in Afro-Cuban Modernity and Tradition* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002), 241–8. A more detailed account of the witchcraft scare is found in Reinaldo Luis Román, 'Conjuring Progress and Divinity: Religion and Conflict in Cuba and Puerto Rico, 1899–1956', Ph.D. dissertation (Los Angeles, CA: UCLA, 2000), 140–82.

<sup>47</sup> Palmié, *Wizards and Scientists*, 4–16. Historian Juan Pedro Albán's account of a 1712 Indian revolt in Cancuk, Chiapas, relies on an innovative narrative technique that pushes the reader to take seriously the rebels' own religious notions of time and causality and also illuminates the difficulties of arriving at unassailable historical truth through even the most thorough archival investigations. See his *Indios rebeldes e idólotras: dos ensayos históricos sobre la rebelión India de Cancuk, Chiapas, acaecida en el año de 1712* (Mexico: CIESAS, 1997).

<sup>48</sup> Benjamin's preoccupation with Jewish mysticism and theology persisted throughout his life, sustained by his friendship with Gershom Scholem. Scholem's influence also extended to Theodor Adorno and other members of the Frankfurt School, providing them with a means of articulating a critical position outside Enlightenment historical narratives that embodied and obscured the violence of class struggle. Adorno advocated theological redemption as a philosophically untenable but strategically necessary critical strategy, whereas Benjamin placed some concrete revolutionary potential in the deployment of what he called 'Messianic' time. See Theodor W. Adorno, *Minima Moralia: Reflections from a Damaged Life*, trans. E. F. N. Jephcott (London: New Left Books, 1974), especially sections 151–3. For discussions of Messianism in Benjamin's thought, see for example, Irving Wohlfarth, 'On the Messianic Structure of Walter Benjamin's Last Reflections', *Glyph*, 3 (1978): 148–212; Susan Buck-Morss, *The Dialectics of Seeing: Walter Benjamin and the Arcades Project* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1989). For the formative influence of Jewish theology on the Frankfurt School, see Anson Rabinbach, 'Between Enlightenment and Apocalypse: Benjamin, Bloch, and Modern German Jewish Messianism', *New German Critique*, 34 (Winter 1985): 78–124.

<sup>49</sup> Walter Benjamin, 'Theses on the Philosophy of History', in Hannah Arendt (ed.), *Illuminations*, trans. Harry Zohn (New York, NY: Schocken Books, 1968), 253–64.

<sup>50</sup> Michel-Rolph Trouillot, *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1995), 8.

<sup>51</sup> Dubois, 'Citizen's Trance', 109.

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, 126.

<sup>53</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>54</sup> Trouillot, *Silencing the Past*, 70–107.

<sup>55</sup> Dubois, 'Citizen's Trance', 125.

<sup>56</sup> Critiques of this 'autistic' form of economics describe the neo-classical orthodoxy not as hyper-rational but as utterly unscientific, incapable of admitting real-world evidence into its frictionless mathematical models. See, for example, 'The Student Petition of Autisme-Economie' (June 2002) posted on the Post-Autistic Economic Networks Web site, <http://www.paecon.net/>, accessed 20 October 2005.

<sup>57</sup> Coronil, 'Introduction', xxviii.

<sup>58</sup> The literature on 'the fetishism of commodities and the secret thereof' is vast; works of particular relevance to Latin American history include Arjun Appadurai, *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988); Fernando Coronil, *The Magical State: Nature, Money, and Modernity in Venezuela* (Chicago, IL/London: University of Chicago Press, 1997); Lauren Derby, 'Haitians, Magic and Money: Raza and Society in the Haitian-Dominican Borderlands, 1900–1937', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 36/3 (July 1994): 488–526; Nancy Scheper-Hughes, 'Commodity Fetishism in Organs Trafficking', in Scheper-Hughes and Loïc Wacquant (eds.), *Commodifying Bodies* (London: Sage Publications, 2002), 31–62; Michael Taussig, *The Devil and Commodity Fetishism in South America* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1980).

<sup>59</sup> Jean Comaroff and John L. Comaroff, 'Millennial Capitalism: First Thoughts on a Second Coming', *Public Culture*, 12/2 (Spring 2000): 315.

<sup>60</sup> A number of interesting recent works in Latin American studies have taken up these themes. See, for example, Laura Briggs, 'Kidnapping, Organ Theft, Rescue: Transnational Adoption from Latin America to the U.S.', paper given at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August 2004; Lauren Derby, 'Vampiros del imperio, o por qué el Chupacabras acecha las Américas', in Ricardo Salvatorre (ed.), *Culturas Imperiales: Experiencia y representación en América, África y Asia* (Buenos Aires: Beatriz Viterbo Editora, 2005), 317–44. Reinaldo L. Román, 'Of Dread and Laughter: Chupacabras and Vampires as Parodies', papers prepared for the panel 'The Monstrous Caribbean', Meeting of the Association of Caribbean Historians, San Juan, Puerto Rico, 1 May 2003; Nancy Scheper-Hughes, 'The Last Commodity: Post-Human Ethics and the Global Traffic in "Fresh Organs"', in Aihwa Ong and Stephen Collier (eds.), *Global Assemblages: Technology, Politics, and Ethics as Anthropological Problems* (London: Basil Blackwell, 2005).

<sup>61</sup> The term is Susan Strange's *Casino Capitalism* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986). While international finance in some form is a hallmark of the modern world system from its inception, the Comaroffs and theorists of globalization generally are referring to the deregulation of international finance that dates from 1973, when the United States abandoned the exchange rates fixed under the Bretton Woods Agreements of 1944. This rejection of the gold standard essentially divested states of their control over the value of their currencies, and turned that power over to an international market in currency speculation, the invention by the financial sector of new instruments of securitization (e.g. junk bonds, the bundling, and trade of home mortgages), and the explosion of financial transactions relative to actual productive economic activity. The year 1992 might serve as a Year One of this new dispensation, the first time that the financial assets of the wealthy nations were double their economic output. Greider, *One World*, 232; the nations referred to are those belonging to the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development.

<sup>62</sup> Qtd. in Moreton, 'Soul of the Service Economy', 388.

<sup>63</sup> Sheldon Annis, *God and Production in a Guatemalan Town* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1989); Jean-Pierre Bastian, 'The Metamorphosis of Latin American Protestant Groups: A Socio-Historical Perspective', *Latin American Research Review*, 28/2 (1993): 33–61; David Martin, *Tongues of Fire: The Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America* (Cambridge, MA/Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1990); Emilio Willems, *Followers of the New Faith* (Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press, 1967).

<sup>64</sup> John G. Cawelti, *Apostles of the Self-Made Man: Changing Concepts of Success in America* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1965), 109–12.

<sup>65</sup> Horatio Alger Association of Distinguished Americans, <http://www.horatioalger.com/index.cfm>, accessed on 21 October 2005.

<sup>66</sup> Todd A. Diacon, *Millenarian Vision, Capitalist Reality: Brazil's Contestado Rebellion, 1912–1916* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1991); James C. Scott, *Weapons of the*

*Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1987). Writing about millenarian rebels in turn of the century Mexico, Paul Vanderwood employs a similar moral economy model, depicting the clash of modernity with traditional religious values in Vanderwood, *The Power of God Against the Guns of Government: Religious Upheaval in Mexico at the Turn of the Nineteenth Century* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1998). Steve Stern's account of the Taqi Onqoy revolt also relies on a moral economy model. Stern, *Peru's Indian Peoples and the Challenge of Spanish Conquest: Huamanga to 1640* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1993).

<sup>67</sup> Román, 'Conjuring Progress', 189. Transnational analysis allows Román to focus on a Hispanic Caribbean spirituality rather than on national spiritual essences. While many in the Anglophone academy are more familiar with the kilted version of the 'invented traditions' argument from Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds.), *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), see Alberto Flores Galindo, *Buscando un Inca: Identidad y utopía en los Andes* (Havana, Cuba: Ediciones Casa de las Américas, 1986), 72. In a similar vein, Néstor García Canclini writes of cultural hybridity to underscore the impossibility of pristine, autonomous cultures. García Canclini, *Hybrid Cultures: Strategies for Entering and Leaving Modernity* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1995). Also see Patricia Pessar, *From Fanatics to Folk: Brazilian Millenarianism and Popular Culture* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004); Edward N. Wright-Rios, 'Indian Saints and Nation-States: Ignacio Manuel Altamirano's Landscapes and Legends', *Mexican Studies/Estudios Mexicanos*, 20/1 (Winter 2004): 47–68.

<sup>68</sup> Dipesh Chakrabarty, *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000), 40–1. Influenced by the literature on 'alternative modernities', Lia Schraeder argues that scholars have misread Mexico's Porfiriato as a time of increasing secularization. Schraeder, 'Spiritist Women and Female Power in Nineteenth-Century Mexico City'; see also Gabriela Sánchez Hernández, 'De prácticas mágico religiosas en familias católicas del Distrito Federal (México)', both papers presented at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August, 2005. A brilliant intervention in the alternative modernities literature is Estela Roselló Soberón's 'La culpa y el perdón en Nueva España, siglos xvi y xvii', Ph.D. dissertation (El Colegio de México, 2005).

<sup>69</sup> See, for example, Karen Armstrong, *The Battle for God* (New York, NY: Ballantine, 2001).

<sup>70</sup> Melani McAlister, 'Prophecy, Politics, and the Popular: The *Left Behind* Series and Christian Fundamentalism's New World Order', *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 102/4 (2003): 773–98.

<sup>71</sup> On pre-war Christian radio, see Joel A. Carpenter, *Revive Us Again: The Reawakening of American Fundamentalism* (New York, NY/Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 126–40; on Christian television broadcasting, see Razelle Frankl, 'Transformation of Televangelism: Repackaging Christian Family Values', in Linda Kintz and Julia Lesage (eds.), *Media, Culture, and the Religious Right* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1998), 163–89; on the Moral Majority's use of direct mail, see Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare*, 57–60.

<sup>72</sup> Jeff Sharlet, 'Soldiers of Christ I: Inside America's Most Powerful Megachurch', *Harper's Magazine*, May 2005, 41.

<sup>73</sup> Neil Swidey, 'God Squad', *Boston Globe Magazine*, November 30, 2003, 16.

<sup>74</sup> Bruce J. Schulman, *The Seventies: The Great Shift in American Culture, Society, and Politics* (New York, NY: The Free Press, 2001), 109.

<sup>75</sup> Ulrich Beck, *Risk Society. Towards a New Modernity*, trans. Mark Ritter (London: Sage Publications, 1992).

<sup>76</sup> Dale K. Van Kley, *The Religious Origins of the French Revolution: From Calvin to the Civil Constitution, 1560–1791* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1996). For a useful summary of the voluminous literature refusing the hostile relationship between religion and the Enlightenment, see Jonathan Sheehan, 'Enlightenment, Religion, and the Enigma of Secularization: A Review Essay', *American Historical Review*, 108/4 (October 2003): 1061–80; Dale K. Van Kley, 'Christianity as Casualty and Chrysalis of Modernity: The Problem of Dechristianization in the French Revolution', *American Historical Review*, 108/4 (October 2003): 1081–1104.

<sup>77</sup> Voekel, *Alone Before God*.

<sup>78</sup> For a fascinating history of sanctimonious liberal imperialism in a US context, see Neil Smith, *The Endgame of Globalization* (New York, NY/London: Routledge, 2005).

<sup>79</sup> Saba Mahmood, *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject* (Princeton, NJ/Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2005), 5. The body of work she is explicitly challenging here is exemplified by Ranajit Guha and Gayatri Spivak (eds.), *Selected Subaltern Studies* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1988) and Scott, *Weapons of the Weak*. We would add to her cautionary note the rather more pedestrian point that liberal attempts to uncover the 'real' benefits women find in conservative patriarchal religion – domestication of men, magical healing in the absence of health care, an explanation for inescapable suffering caused by distant structures of injustice – risk accepting the false binary between rational, dispassionate economics (or medicine, or politics), on the one hand, and irrational, superstitious false belief on the other. Indeed, not only do such explanations reinforce that binary, they place the observer squarely on the side of reason and thus help to devalue the entire suite of concerns that are represented by sentiment and emotional knowledge.

<sup>80</sup> Elizabeth Brusco, *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Colombia* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1995), 3. Cecília Loreto Mariz and Maria das Dores Campos Machado, 'Pentecostalism and Women in Brazil', in Edward L. Cleary and Hannah W. Stewart-Gambino (eds.), *Power, Politics, and Pentecostals in Latin America* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997), 41–55. Also see Maria das Dores Campos Machado, *Carismáticos E Pentecostais: Adesão Religiosa Na Esfera Familiar* (Campinas, SP: Autores Associados; São Paulo, S.P.: ANPOCS, 1996); Cecília Loreto Mariz, *Coping with Poverty: Pentecostals and Christian Base Communities in Brazil* (Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 1994); Timothy J. Steigenga and David A. Smilde, 'Wrapped in the Holy Shawl: The Strange Case of Conservative Christians and Gender Equality in Latin America', in Christian Smith and Joshua Prokopy (eds.), *Latin American Religion in Motion* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1999), 173–86. Similarly, Ileana Gómez demonstrates the efficacy of Pentecostal congregations in El Salvador in another kind of reformation of machismo: disarming the violent young men who have whose gangs, or *maras*, have proliferated in the general collapse of social order following the civil war of 1980–92. Ileana Gómez, 'Religious and Social Participation in War-Torn Areas of El Salvador', trans. Carmen Meyers, Manuel A. Vásquez, and Philip Williams, *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs*, 41/4 (Winter 1999): 59–61. Steve J. Stern's discussion of patriarchal pacts in the late colonial period also illustrates the problems of reading agency exclusively as the struggle for individual autonomy; see his *The Secret History of Gender: Women, Men, and Power in Late Colonial Mexico* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1995).

<sup>81</sup> Ann Laura Stoler, *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Relations* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002). See also Eric Lott, *Love and Theft: Blackface Minstrelsy and the American Working Class* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1993).

<sup>82</sup> María Josefina Saldaña-Portillo, *The Revolutionary Imaginary in the Americas in the Age of Development* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003).

<sup>83</sup> William I. Robinson, 'Globalization, the World System, and "Democracy Promotion" in U.S. Foreign Policy', *Theory and Society*, 25 (1996): 624–5.

<sup>84</sup> Dussel, *Invention*, 64.

## Bibliography

- Adelman, J., 'Latin American and World Histories: Old and New Approaches to the Pluribus and the Unum', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 84/3 (2004): 399–409.
- Adorno, T. W., *Minima Moralia: Reflections from a Damaged Life*, trans. E. F. N. Jephcott (London: New Left Books, 1974).
- Ahlstrom, S. E., *A Religious History of the American People*, 2nd ed, Foreword and Concluding chapter by David D. Hall (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2004), 816–22.
- Albán, J. P., *Indios rebeldes e ídólotras: Dos ensayos históricos sobre la rebelión India de Cancuk, Chiapas, acaecida en el año de 1712* (Mexico: CIESAS, 1997).

- Alden, A., *The Making of an Enterprise: The Society of Jesus in Portugal, its Empire, and Beyond, 1540–1750* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996).
- Anderson, A., *An Introduction to Pentecostalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).
- Annis, S., *God and Production in a Guatemalan Town* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1989).
- Appadurai, A., *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988).
- Armstrong, K., *The Battle for God* (New York, NY: Ballantine, 2001).
- Arrom, S., 'Mexican Laywomen', paper prepared for the conference 'Vida Urbana, Familia y Vida Cotidiana en América Latina', Universidad Católica, Lima, Peru, 1999.
- Arrom, S. M., 'Mexican Laywomen Spearhead a Catholic Revival: The Ladies of Charity, 1863–1900', in Martin A. Nesvig (ed.), *Religious Culture in Modern Mexico* (Wilmington, DE: Scholarly Resources Press, 2006), 50–77.
- Asad, T., *Formations of the Secular: Christianity, Islam, Modernity* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003).
- Assman, H., *A Igreja Electronica y Su Impacto Na America Latina* (San José, Costa Rica: Departamento Ecueménico de Investigaciones, 1987).
- Bastian, J.-P., 'The Metamorphosis of Latin American Protestant Groups: A Socio-Historical Perspective', *Latin American Research Review*, 28/2 (1993): 33–61.
- Batalla, B., *México profundo: Una civilización negada* (Mexico: CIESAS, 1987).
- Beck, U., *Risk Society. Towards a New Modernity*, trans. M. Ritter (London: Sage Publications, 1992).
- Benjamin, W., 'Theses on the Philosophy of History', in Hannah Arendt (ed.), *Illuminations*, trans. H. Zohn (New York, NY: Schocken Books, 1968), 253–64.
- Borrego, A.-M., 'Humanities Endowment Returns to "Flagging" Nontraditional Projects', *Chronicle of Higher Education*, Jan. 16, 2004.
- Briggs, L., 'Kidnapping, Organ Theft, Rescue: Transnational Adoption from Latin America to the U.S.', paper given at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August, 2004.
- Briggs, L., McCormick, G., and Way, J.T. 'Gender and Transnationalism in Latin American History', paper given at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August, 2004.
- Brouwer, S., Gifford, P., and Rose, S. D., *Exporting the American Gospel: Global Christian Fundamentalism* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1996).
- Brusco, E., *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Colombia* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 1995).
- Buck-Morss, S., *The Dialectics of Seeing: Walter Benjamin and the Arcades Project* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1989).
- Burnett, V. G., 'Protestantism in Latin America', *Latin American Research Review*, 27/1 (1992): 218–30.
- Campos Machado, M. das Dores, *Carismaticos E Pentecostais: Adesão Religiosa Na Esfera Familiar* (Campinas, SP: Autores Associados; São Paulo, SP: ANPOCS, 1996).
- Canclini, N. G., *Hybrid Cultures: Strategies for Entering and Leaving Modernity* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1995).
- Cardoso, F. H., and Enzo, F., *Dependency and Development in Latin America* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1978).
- Carpenter, J. A., *Revive Us Again: The Reawakening of American Fundamentalism* (New York, NY/Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997).
- Carrillo, E., and Rodríguez, M., *Pentecostalismo y espiritismo* (Havana: Editorial Academia, 1997).
- Cawelti, J. G., *Apostles of the Self-Made Man: Changing Concepts of Success in America* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1965).
- Chakrabarty, D., *Provincializing Europe: Postcolonial Thought and Historical Difference* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000).
- Chowning, M., 'Liberals, Women, and the Church in Mexico: Politics and the Feminization of Piety, 1700–1930', unpublished paper delivered to the Harvard Latin American Studies Seminar, 2002.

- Cintrón, N. A., *Religión y cambio social en Puerto Rico (1898–1940)* (Río Piedras, PR: Ediciones Huracán, 1996).
- Cline, S., 'Competition and Fluidity in Latin American Christianity', *Latin American Research Review*, 35/2 (2000): 244–51.
- Clossey, L. S., 'Distant Souls: Global Religion and the Jesuit Missions of Germany, Mexico, and China, 1595–1705', Ph.D. dissertation (University of California Berkeley, 2004).
- Comaroff, J., and Comaroff, J. L., 'Millennial Capitalism: First Thoughts on a Second Coming', *Public Culture*, 12/2 (Spring 2000): 1–56.
- Coronil, F., 'Introduction', in Fernando Ortiz, *Cuban Counterpoint: Tobacco and Sugar* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1995 [1947]), xl–xlvii.
- Coronil, F., *The Magical State: Nature, Money, and Modernity in Venezuela* (Chicago, IL/London: University of Chicago Press, 1997).
- Curtin, P., 'The Declaration of the Rights of Man in Saint-Domingue, 1788–1791', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 30/2 (1950): 157–71.
- Derby, L., 'Haitians, Magic and Money: Raza and Society in the Haitian-Dominican Borderlands, 1900–1937', *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 36/3 (July 1994): 488–526.
- Derby, L., 'Vampiros del imperio, o por qué el Chupacabras acecha las Américas', in Ricardo Salvatore (ed.), *Culturas Imperiales: Experiencia y representación en América, África y Asia* (Buenos Aires: Beatriz Viterbo Editora, 2005), 317–44.
- Diacon, T. A., *Millenarian Vision, Capitalist Reality: Brazil's Contestado Rebellion, 1912–1916* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1991).
- Diamond, S., *Spiritual Warfare: The Politics of the Christian Right* (Boston, MA: South End Press, 1989).
- Domínguez Michael, C., *La Vida de Fray Servando* (Mexico: Ediciones Era, 2005).
- Dubois, L., 'The Citizen's Trance: The Haitian Revolution and the Motor of History', in Birgit Meyer and Peter Pels (eds.), *Magic and Modernity: Interfaces of Revelation and Concealment* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003).
- Dubois, L., *Avengers of the New World: The Story of the Haitian Revolution* (Cambridge, MA/London: Harvard University Press, 2004).
- Dussel, E., *The Invention of the Americas: The Eclipse of 'the Other' and the Myth of Modernity* (New York, NY: Continuum, 1995).
- Dussel, E., 'Beyond Eurocentrism: The World-System and the Limits of Modernity', in Frederick Jameson and Masao Miyoshi (eds.), *The Cultures of Globalization* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1998), 3–30.
- Eley, G., 'Nations, Publics and Political Culture: Placing Habermas in the Nineteenth Century', in Nicholas B. Dirks, Geoff Eley, and Sherry B. Ortner (eds.), *Culture/Power/History* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1993), 297–335.
- Espinosa, G., 'Borderland Religion: Los Angeles and the Origins of the Latino Pentecostal Movement in the U.S., Mexico, and Puerto Rico, 1900–1945', Ph.D. Dissertation (University of California Santa Barbara, 1999).
- Fisher Fishkin, S., 'Crossroads of Cultures: The Transnational Turn in American Studies', *American Quarterly*, 57/1 (2005): 17–57.
- Frankl, R., 'Transformation of Televangelism: Repackaging Christian Family Values', in Linda Kintz and Julia Lesage (eds.), *Media, Culture, and the Religious Right* (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 1998), 163–89.
- Fraser, N., 'What's Critical about Critical Theory? The Case of Habermas and Gender', *New German Critique*, 35 (Spring/Summer 1985): 97–131.
- Galeano, E., *Open Veins of Latin America. Five Centuries of the Pillage of a Continent* (New York, NY: Monthly Review Press, 1975).
- Galindo, A. F., *Buscando un Inca: Identidad y utopía en los Andes* (Havana, Cuba: Ediciones Casa de las Américas, 1986).
- Gómez, I., 'Religious and Social Participation in War-Torn Areas of El Salvador', trans. Carmen Meyers, Manuel A. Vásquez, and Philip Williams, *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs*, 41/4 (Winter 1999): 59–61.
- Greider, W., *One World, Ready or Not: The Manic Logic of Global Capitalism* (New York, NY: Simon & Schuster, 1997).



- Guha, R., and Spivak, G. (eds.), *Selected Subaltern Studies* (Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1988).
- Hobsbawm, E., and Ranger, T. (eds.), *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983).
- Horatio Alger Association of Distinguished Americans, <http://www.horatioalger.com/index.cfm>, accessed on 21 October 2005.
- Huntington, S., *The Clash of Civilizations and the Remaking of World Order* (New York, NY: Simon and Schuster, 1998).
- Hurbon, L., *El bárbaro imaginario*, trans. Jorge Padín (Mexico: Fondo de Cultura Económica, 1993).
- Jakobsen, J. R., 'Can Homosexuals End Western Civilization as We Know it? Family Values in a Global Economy', in Arnaldo Cruz-Malavé and Martin F. Manalansan (eds.), *Queer Globalizations: Citizenship and the Afterlife of Colonialism* (New York, NY/London: New York University Press, 2002).
- Jakobsen, J. R., with Pellegrini, A., 'World Secularisms at the Millennium', *Social Text*, 18/3 (2000): 1–27.
- James, C. L. R., *The Black Jacobins: Toussaint L'Ouverture and the San Domingo Revolution* (New York, NY: Vintage, 1963).
- Kaplan, A., 'Violent Belongings and the Question of Empire Today', Presidential Address to the American Studies Association, October 17, 2003, *American Quarterly*, 56/1 (March 2004): 1–18.
- Kelley, R. D. G., "'But a Local Phase of a World Problem": Black History's Global Vision, 1883–1950', *Journal of American History*, 86/3 (December 1999): 1045–77.
- Kintz, L., *Between Jesus and the Market. The Emotions that Matter in Right-Wing America* (Durham, NC/London: Duke University Press, 1997).
- Langley, L. D., *The Americas in the Age of Revolution, 1750–1850* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1996).
- Levine, R. M., *Vale of Tears: Revisiting the Canudos Massacre in Northeastern Brazil, 1893–1897* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1992).
- Levitt, P., 'Redefining the Boundaries of Belonging: The Institutional Character of Transnational Religious Life', *Sociology of Religion*, 65/1 (2004): 1–18.
- Lott, E., *Love and Theft: Blackface Minstrelsy and the American Working Class* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1993).
- McAlister, M., 'Prophecy, Politics, and the Popular: The *Left Behind* Series and Christian Fundamentalism's New World Order', *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 102/4 (2003): 773–98.
- McAlister, M., presentation at Yale University Conference, 'The Biopolitics of Global Subjectives', 24 March 2006.
- Mahmood, S., *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject* (Princeton, NJ/Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2005).
- Mallon, E., 'Time on the Wheel: Cycles of Revisionism and the New Cultural History', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 79/2 (May 1999): 336.
- Mariz, C., *Coping with Poverty: Pentecostals and Christian Base Communities in Brazil* (Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press, 1994).
- Mariz, C. L., and Campos Machado, M. das Dores, 'Pentecostalism and Women in Brazil', in Edward L. Cleary and Hannah W. Stewart-Gambino (eds.), *Power, Politics, and Pentecostals in Latin America* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1997), 41–55.
- Martin, D., *Tongues of Fire: The Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America* (Cambridge, MA/Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1990).
- Martínez, A. M., 'Bordering on the Sacred: Religion, Nation, and U.S.–Mexican Relations, 1910–1929', Ph.D. dissertation (University of Minnesota, 2003).
- Martínez Fernández, L., *Protestantism and Political Conflict in the Nineteenth-Century Hispanic Caribbean* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2002).
- Mignolo, W. D., *Local Histories/Global Designs: Coloniality, Subaltern Knowledges, and Border Thinking* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2000).
- Mintz, S. W., *Sweetness and Power. The Place of Sugar in Modern History* (New York, NY: Viking, 1985).

- Moreton, B., 'The Soul of the Service Economy: Wal-Mart and the Making of Christian Free Enterprise, 1929–1994', Ph.D. dissertation (Yale University, 2006).
- Moreton, B., 'The Soul of Neoliberalism', *Social Text*, 92 (Fall 2007).
- O'Gorman, E., *Do the Americas Have a Common History?*, trans. A. Flores (Washington, DC: Division of Intellectual Cooperation, Pan American Union, 1941).
- Ong, A., *Buddha is Hiding: Refugees, Citizenship, the New America* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2003).
- Ortiz, F., *Los negros brujos* (La Habana: Editorial de Ciencias Sociales, 1995); originally published as Ortiz, *Hampa afro-cubana: los negros brujos (apuntes para un estudio de etnología criminal)*. Con una carta prólogo del Dr. C. Lombroso. Con 48 figuras dibujos del Gustavino (Madrid: Librería de F. Fé, 1906).
- Palmié, S., *Wizards and Scientists: Explorations in Afro-Cuban Modernity and Tradition* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002).
- Pessar, P., *From Fanatics to Folk: Brazilian Millenarianism and Popular Culture* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004).
- Piccato, P., 'Introducción: ¿Modelo para armar? Hacia un acercamiento crítico a la teoría de la esfera pública', in Cristina Sacristán and Pablo Piccato (eds.), *Actores, espacios y debates en la historia de la esfera pública en la ciudad de México* (Mexico: Instituto Mora, 2004), 9–41.
- Pike, F. B., 'Heresy, Real and Alleged, in Peru: An Aspect of the Conservative-Liberal Struggle, 1830–1875', *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 47/1 (February 1967): 50–74.
- Prado, C., Jr., *Formação do Brasil contemporâneo: Colônia* (Sao Paulo: Livraria Martins, 1942).
- Rabe, V. H., *Home Base of American China Missions, 1880–1920* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1978).
- Rabinbach, A., 'Between Enlightenment and Apocalypse: Benjamin, Bloch, and Modern German Jewish Messianism', *New German Critique*, 34 (Winter 1985): 78–124.
- Robinson, W. I., 'Globalization, the World System, and "Democracy Promotion" in U.S. Foreign Policy', *Theory and Society*, 25 (1996): 624–5.
- Román, R. L., 'Conjuring Progress and Divinity: Religion and Conflict in Cuba and Puerto Rico, 1899–1956', Ph.D. dissertation (UCLA, 2000).
- Román, R. L., 'Of Dread and Laughter: Chupacabras and Vampires as Parodies', paper prepared for the panel 'The Monstrous Caribbean', Meeting of the Association of Caribbean Historians, San Juan, Puerto Rico, 1 May 2003.
- Román, R. L., and Voekel, P., 'Enchanted Once More: Popular Religion in Latin America', in José Moya (ed.), *Latin American Historiography* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2007).
- Rostow, W., *Stages of Economic Growth. A Non-Communist Manifesto* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1960).
- Rudolph, S. H., and Piscatori, J. (eds.), *Transnational Religion and Fading States* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, forthcoming).
- Saldaña-Portillo, M. J., *The Revolutionary Imaginary in the Americas in the Age of Development* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003).
- Sánchez Hernández, G., 'De prácticas mágico religiosas en familias católicas del Distrito Federal (México)', paper presented at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August, 2005.
- Scheper-Hughes, N., 'Commodity Fetishism in Organs Trafficking', in N. Scheper-Hughes and Loïc Wacquant (eds.), *Commodifying Bodies* (London: Sage Publications, 2002), 31–62.
- Scheper-Hughes, N., 'The Last Commodity: Post-Human Ethics and the Global Traffic in "Fresh Organs"', in Aihwa Ong and Stephen Collier (eds.), *Global Assemblages: Technology, Politics, and Ethics as Anthropological Problems* (London: Basil Blackwell, 2005).
- Schrader, L., 'Spiritist Women and Female Power in Nineteenth-Century Mexico City,' paper presented at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August, 2005.
- Schreker, E., 'Worse than McCarthy', *Chronicle of Higher Education*, February 19, 2006.
- Schulman, B. J., *The Seventies: The Great Shift in American Culture, Society, and Politics* (New York, NY: The Free Press, 2001).

- Schwarz, R., 'Brazilian Culture: Nationalism by Elimination', in John Gledson (ed.), *Misplaced Ideas. Essays on Brazilian Culture* (London: Verso, 1992).
- Scott, J. C., *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1987).
- Seigel, M., 'Beyond Compare: Comparative Method after the Transnational Turn', *Radical History Review* (December 2004): 62–89.
- Sepinwall, A. G., *The Abbé Grégoire and the French Revolution. The Making of Modern Universalism* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2005).
- Serrano, S., 'Las mujeres y el templo: La privatización del culto en Santiago de Chile, 1860–1890', paper presented at the Berkshire Conference on the History of Women, Claremont, CA, June 2005.
- Sharlet, J., 'Soldiers of Christ I: Inside America's Most Powerful Megachurch', *Harper's Magazine*, May 2005.
- Sheehan, J., 'Enlightenment, Religion, and the Enigma of Secularization: A Review Essay', *American Historical Review*, 108/4 (October 2003): 1061–80.
- Silva, M., 'El ideario político de los intelectuales unionistas centroamericanos, 1898–1921', paper given at the Teopoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Teopoztlán, Mexico, July 2005.
- Smith, N., *The Endgame of Globalization* (New York, NY/London: Routledge, 2005).
- Soberón, E. R., 'La culpa y el perdón en Nueva España, siglos xvi y xvii', Ph.D. dissertation (El Colegio de México, 2005).
- Steigenga, T. J., and Smilde, D. A., 'Wrapped in the Holy Shawl: The Strange Case of Conservative Christians and Gender Equality in Latin America', in Christian Smith and Joshua Prokopy (eds.), *Latin American Religion in Motion* (New York: Routledge, 1999), 173–86.
- Stephens, M. A., 'Black Transnationalism and the Politics of National Identity: West Indian Intellectuals in Harlem in the Age of War and Revolution', *American Quarterly*, 50/3 (1998): 592–608.
- Stern, S. J., 'Feudalism, Capitalism, and the World System in the Perspective of Latin America and the Caribbean, reprinted in Frederick Cooper et al. (eds.), *Confronting Historical Paradigms: Peasants, Labor, and the Capitalist World System in Africa and Latin America* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1993), 23–82.
- Stern, S., *Peru's Indian Peoples and the Challenge of Spanish Conquest: Huamanga to 1640* (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 1993).
- Stern, S. J., *The Secret History of Gender: Women, Men, and Power in Late Colonial Mexico* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1995).
- Stoler, A. L., *Carnal Knowledge and Imperial Power: Race and the Intimate in Colonial Relations* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2002).
- Strange, S., *Casino Capitalism* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986).
- 'The Student Petition of *Autisme-Economie*', June 2000, <http://www.paecon.net/0>, accessed 15 July 2007.
- Subramaniam, B., 'Archaic Modernities: Science, Secularism and Religion in Modern India', *Social Text*, 18/3 (2000): 67–86.
- Swidey, N., 'God Squad', *The Boston Globe Magazine*, 30 November 2003.
- Taussig, M., *The Devil and Commodity Fetishism in South America* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1980).
- Tenorio Trillo, M., 'Stereophonic Scientific Modernisms: Social Science between Mexico and the United States, 1880s–1930s', *Journal of American History*, Special issue: *The Nation and Beyond: Transnational Perspectives on United States History*, 86/3 (December 1999): 1156–87.
- Thompson, N., 'Science Friction: The Growing – and Dangerous – Divide between Scientists and the GOP', *Washington Monthly*, 35 (July/August 2003): 11–15.
- Trouillot, M.-R., *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* (Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 1995).
- United States House of Representatives Committee on Government Reform Minority Staff, Special Investigations Division, 'Politics and Science in the Bush Administration; prepared for Rep. Henry A Waxman', August 2003, [http://oversight.house.gov/features/politics\\_and\\_science/pdfs/pdf\\_politics\\_and\\_science\\_rep.pdf](http://oversight.house.gov/features/politics_and_science/pdfs/pdf_politics_and_science_rep.pdf), accessed 15 July 2007.

- Vanderwood, P., *The Power of God Against the Guns of Government: Religious Upheaval in Mexico at the Turn of the Nineteenth Century* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1998).
- Van Kley, D. K., *The Religious Origins of the French Revolution: From Calvin to the Civil Constitution, 1560–1791* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1996).
- Van Kley, D. K., 'Christianity as Casualty and Chrysalis of Modernity: The Problem of Dechristianization in the French Revolution', *American Historical Review*, 108/4 (October 2003): 1081–1104.
- Van Kley, D. K., 'Patriotism', unpublished paper in authors' possession, July 2005.
- Vásquez, M. A., 'Toward a New Agenda for the Study of Religion in the Americas', *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs*, Special issue: *Churches in America: Religion, Globalization, and Democratization*, 41/4 (Winter 1999): 1–20.
- Vásquez, M. A., and Friedman Marquardt, M., *Globalizing the Sacred: Religion Across the Americas* (New Brunswick, NJ/London: Rutgers University Press, 2003), 197–222.
- Vega, P. L., *Religion, Culture, and Society in Colombia: Medellín and Antioquia, 1850–1930* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2002).
- Voekel, P., 'La feminización de la piedad barroca en la Ciudad de México, 1620–1850', paper prepared for the conference 'Vida Urbana, Familia y Vida Cotidiana en América Latina', Universidad Católica, Lima, Peru, 1999.
- Voekel, P., *Alone Before God: The Religious Origins of Modernity in Mexico* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2002).
- Voekel, P., 'Liberal Religion: The Schism of 1861', in Martin Nesvig (ed.), *Religious Culture in Modern Mexico* (New York, NY: Roman and Littlefield, 2007).
- Wallerstein, I. M., *The Capitalist World Economy. Essays by Immanuel Wallerstein* (Cambridge/New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 1979).
- Weber, M., 'Religious Rejections of the World and Their Directions', *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*, trans. H. H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1946 [1915]), 323–59.
- Weber, M., *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism* (New York, NY: Penguin Classics, 2002).
- Willems, E., *Followers of the New Faith* (Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press, 1967).
- Williams, D., 'Networks of Catholic Journalism in Nineteenth-Century Latin America', presented at the Tepoztlán Institute for the Transnational History of the Americas, Tepoztlán, Mexico, July–August 2006.
- Williams, E., *Capitalism and Slavery* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1944).
- Wohlfarth, I., 'On the Messianic Structure of Walter Benjamin's Last Reflections', *Glyph*, 3 (1978): 148–212.
- Wright-Rios, E. N., 'Indian Saints and Nation-States: Ignacio Manuel Altamirano's Landscapes and Legends', *Mexican Studies/Estudios Mexicanos*, 20/1 (Winter 2004): 47–68.