

Review

Author(s): Roy Wagner

Review by: Roy Wagner

Source: *Anthropological Quarterly*, Vol. 51, No. 4 (Oct., 1978), pp. 267-269

Published by: The George Washington University Institute for Ethnographic Research

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3317183>

Accessed: 07-04-2016 12:02 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at

<http://about.jstor.org/terms>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).



The George Washington University Institute for Ethnographic Research is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Anthropological Quarterly*

a ritual of reaffirmation of the brotherhood of all miners regardless of ethnic classification. Co-Editor Brett Williams undertakes the complex task of showing a consistency of relationships between inmates and non-inmates in a migratory labor setting. He discusses the honoring of the individual in an institutional setting, privacy within cramped and necessarily public areas, and the creation of a social unit from a diverse selection of people through ritual celebrations which obviate the deadening routine of the camp.

Part III, "From the Anvil of Experience", offers two articles by "inmates" of total institutions. Bob Blankmann presents a masterly portrait of the SAC contingent stationed on Guam during the Vietnam War. His portrayal of Air Force Personnel as inmates in a total institution is thorough, convincing, and pervaded by a fine and subtle sense of humor. Celia Sardenberg and Deborah Donnellan sympathetically but sketchily outline the institutional aspects of a college sorority.

Perhaps the weakest section of the book is the fourth and final part, "Extending the Model and Metaphor." In this section

four authors undertake the extension of the idea of total institution to broader areas. David Lark attempts to demonstrate the applicability of the model to American slums, David Rosen considers colonialism as a total institution, and Richard Basham ambitiously depicts ethnicity in general as a form of institutionalization. In all three cases the arguments are tentative and not completely convincing. M. Estelle Smith's article on the strengths and weaknesses of the model in relation to maritime life and lifestyles is the most cogently argued of the set.

Smith also provides the best summation of the volume itself when she states that "the ability of any model resides not in its ability to give a Procrustean bed for others to sleep in but in its potential to spark inquiry, controversy, dialogue—and hypotheses which, even when negated, produce new data and further lines of inquiry" (p. 156). *Exploring Total Institutions* is a step in this direction; and, whether the reader agrees or disagrees with the individual presentations, the volume is valuable precisely because of its variety and enthusiasm.

---

*The Second Ring of Power.* CARLOS CASTANEDA. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1977, 316 pages, \$9.95 (cloth).

*Reviewed by* ROY WAGNER  
University of Virginia

Carlos Castaneda's books have generally been marketed under the heading of "non-fiction," and the author holds a Ph.D. in anthropology. The demystification of his books has made the fortune of some, and for many others it has rescued the improbable realities of modern secular life from the doubts that bedevil the good soldiers of science. But, if sorcery and knowledge are a deadly game, I find that of verification a deadly boring one, and in this review I shall

take the author's claims and qualifications at face value, for what I can learn from them.

The present volume is the fifth in a sequence documenting Castaneda's experiences as an initiate into the psychic world of a Yaqui shaman known here as Don Juan Matus, and his Mazatec co-practitioner, Don Genaro Flores. Each successive addition to the sequence represents a significant shift or "turning" of the dialectic.

tic between an increasingly self-aware author and his increasingly sophisticated and enigmatic mentors. The search of a young man, originally mystified by the secrets of hallucinogenic plants, for the sources of shamanistic power and knowledge, culminates, in the fourth volume, *Tales of Power*, in the exquisite "sorcerer's explanation" and the author's leap from a cliff into the abyss of the unknown, the "crack between the worlds."

*The Second Ring of Power* takes up the inquiry from the familiar anthropological dilemma of the fieldworker who has just been shown the ultimate mystery and is searching frantically for an informant who will explain just what he has seen. Don Juan and Don Genaro are unavailable, having detotalized their powers among their disciples and executed each a personal denouement into the *nagual*, the eternal unknowable. The final deposition is an event, wholly consistent with "the sorcerer's world": Castaneda and five hitherto unsuspected female protégés of Don Juan are "set up" in a series of deadly sorcerer's contests designed to allow one or another to recoup the faculties of their mentor.

Thus the book begins with high adventure; almost killed in a grotesquely transparent seduction and murder attempt (the most insidious sorcerers seem remarkably opaque to cultural difference), Castaneda comes to know the uncertain, suspicious, and temperamental young women who share Don Juan's tutelage. In a world overflowing with incongruous and ingenuous ethnic apparitions, haunted by the specter of the limited good, he finds a trustworthy informant in La Gorda, the most adept protégé, and a foil in the self-indulgent "Genaros," the three young men who shared Don Genaro as a principal confidant. Eventually the "power" discourse is resumed: dreaming (the facility taught by Genaro to Don Juan's disciples) and the art of the stalker (taught by Don Juan to the Genaros) are revealed as techniques to grasp the

second ring of power—the ability to "hold an image" of the *nagual*.

Like Castaneda's second book, *A Separate Reality*, which also begins at a point of doubt and confusion, *The Second Ring of Power* offers some tantalizing details of the sorcerer's world, and also, like the earlier work, it goes beyond the immediate anthropologist-informant dyad. Women, we learn, have an intrinsic capacity for the unfocused attention that is the key to power; at menstruation the "crack between the worlds" stands open before them. And we learn of the "emptying" of adults by children (who "take their edge"), hindering their completion as sorcerers, and of the "mold of man," a kind of Platonic universal of human essence with dazzling eyes, occasionally sighted near watercourses by people who think they have seen God.

It also becomes apparent, though much more inferentially, that Castaneda simply does not operate on the same communicational wavelength as his ethnic Mexican confreres. Continual hazing by Don Genaro and others for his inveterate habit of note-taking and fastidious questioning, as well as exasperated admissions that "you're so dumb" by Don Juan (*Journey to Ixtlan*) and his protégés (the present work), suggest a discrepancy more serious than the usual "anthropologist-shock" (and the author of *Tales of Power* is by no means a stupid man). "Knowledge," for the warriors of Don Juan's circle, is communicated through performative symbols; it is elicited nonverbally, rather than being articulated, often via a strange *ballet folklórico* of mind-body gymnastics, and the witness is expected to work out the details for himself. It is likely that a Carlos Castaneda who had grown up intellectually amid such a culture of the self-revealing symbol would have been spared the contempt of his associates, and even that he might have entered the *nagual* by now; it is highly unlikely, however, that he would have written a word about it.

Finally, we are permitted some surmises regarding the qualifications of a warrior. Virtually without exception, the "successful" sorcerers in this book are "no-hopers," socially degraded or outcast people rescued by Don Juan and Don Genaro from critical situations. They are people who can face the prospect of death, or jump off a cliff, with equanimity, for they have quite liter-

ally nothing to lose. Pablito, the wholesome peasant boy who is Castaneda's "partner," is finally the captive of real second thoughts about sorcery, and plays at machismo. Carlos Castaneda, the educated student from Los Angeles with his notebooks and his tricky questions, returned from the nagual to write a book about it.

---

*The Irish Tinkers: The Urbanization of an Itinerant People.* GEORGE GMELCH.  
Menlo Park, California: Cummings, 1977; iv, 176 pages, index, \$3.95 (paper).

Reviewed by LARRY TAYLOR  
*Lafayette College*

Anyone who has travelled in Ireland will have noticed the typically ramshackle and debris-strewn encampments most often found on the edge of rural towns. The tourist in Dublin is not likely to escape the tartan-shawled beggars of O'Connell Bridge. Far from being a category of the social scientific imagination, the Tinkers, or "Travelling People," as they call themselves, are a visually striking feature of the Irish scene that has long attracted the attention of folklorists, social workers, and casual tourists. Gmelch's intriguing study offers the first systematic description of Tinker social organization and lifestyle by an anthropologist, and is to be welcomed accordingly by students of "marginal groups," the "culture of poverty" and of Irish society and culture in general.

The author's account begins with a reconstruction of the Tinkers' "Traditional Adaptation" (mid-nineteenth century until 1950). Writing from an elementary ecological perspective, Gmelch argues that the traditional Tinker economy was an adaptation to the conditions of the landed peasantry; itinerants filling the gaps, so to speak, in the dispersed environment. The name Tinker evidently arises from one of these functions, the production and repair of

tin utensils. But itinerants were also important in the provision of other essential economic services including horse trading, chimney cleaning, peddling, and occasional agricultural labor. Such services were especially important in the West, where towns of any magnitude were scarce, and transportation difficult. One would imagine that itinerants would have been even more important in the period before the mid-nineteenth century, when many Western regions were characterized by rising populations combined with the absence of even local street towns. In Southwest Donegal, in fact, local historic traditions account a formative role to "carters" in the establishment of such towns in the mid-nineteenth century. Were such peddlers Tinkers? If so, then the growth of small towns may have provided early opportunities for settlement.

The author's description of traditional social organization accounts nothing startlingly different from contemporary settled peasant life—save the flexibility of the small camp units. Even though these travel groups were characterized by a frequently changing composition, however, the author maintains that "families who travelled to-