

---

**HMD**Croatian  
Musicological  
SocietyHrvatsko  
muzikološko  
društvoKroatische  
musikwissenschaftliche  
GesellschaftSociété  
croate de  
musicologie

---

The Aesthetic Theories of Heinrich Christoph Koch

Author(s): Nancy Kovaleff Baker

Source: *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music*, Vol. 8, No. 2 (Dec., 1977), pp. 183-209

Published by: [Croatian Musicological Society](#)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/836886>

Accessed: 12-08-2014 02:03 UTC

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



Croatian Musicological Society is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

# THE AESTHETIC THEORIES OF HEINRICH CHRISTOPH KOCH

NANCY KOVALEFF BAKER

*Columbia University, New York*

Heinrich Christoph Koch (1749—1816) wrote his three-volume treatise *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition* (1782—1793) in an attempt to provide a comprehensive theory of musical composition — and to fill what he saw as certain gaps in current musical instruction. His discussion begins with the origins of tones and works up through various compositional levels to complex forms, such as the symphony and the concerto. Although Koch systematically presents rules which he feels are the essence of music theory, yet there are certain matters connected with the »inner nature« of music for which no absolute rules can be established. Only genius can explain how a beautiful melody is created; only taste, the ultimate eighteenth-century arbiter, can be the final judge of what is beautiful. Yet there are guidelines applicable to the fine arts, and Koch outlines them before continuing with the »external nature« of music.<sup>1</sup> He aims to make clear three things: the highest function of art, the principal aesthetic qualities of a composition, and, most important, the way in which a composition must arise if it is to attain the aim of art.

<sup>1</sup> According to his original plan for the treatise, outlined in the Introduction to Volume I, the first section would give instruction in harmony and counterpoint, and the second section would focus on melody. Provided these first two parts of his treatise were well-received, Koch promised to discuss aesthetics and other matters relevant to composition in an appendix. Upon further reflection, however, he altered his outline and began the second volume with subjects originally intended for that appendix. The way in which a composition should arise in the mind of the composer is studied most appropriately *before* one begins to compose. Considered subjectively, composition is a spiritual process involving the intangible forces of taste, genius, and inspiration; discussion of their roles at this point will make his later teachings on the objective or external aspects of melody more meaningful. Also, when no

Koch is heavily indebted to Johann G. Sulzer (1720—1779), whose *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* (1771—1774) is the source of all of his aesthetic pronouncements.<sup>2</sup> This work drew on the talents of Johann P. Kirnberger (1721—1783) and Johann A. P. Schulz (1747—1800) for the musical articles, but Sulzer alone was responsible for the aesthetic parts.<sup>3</sup> In these articles he stressed the necessity for unity (*Einheit*) and variety (*Mannigfaltigkeit*) and the need to express a particular feeling. In music, of course, such expression is best accomplished in conjunction with a text, and, because of its more undefined character, instrumental music is rated rather low. Though he marveled at how many instrumental works actually can arouse a particular feeling, Koch took over Sulzer's ideas without questioning them and, in effect, served as one of the last exponents of the eighteenth-century theory of imitation. Of more interest is Koch's attempt to apply Sulzer's three stages of creation, the plan (*Anlage*), the realization (*Ausführung*), and the elaboration (*Ausarbeitung*), to actual musical composition. It is a basic impossibility to find musical equivalents for certain of these terms as Sulzer defines them. Yet the mere fact that Koch made the attempt shows that he was not concerned with aesthetic systems *per se*, but sought to apply them to musical reality. He was most interested in the art of composition and the means, be they theoretical or aesthetic, by which a student might better understand and thus practice this art.

\*  
\*       \*  
\*

In the first part of his *Versuch*, Koch referred to music as the fine art which expresses feelings through tones. Now in his section

rules can be supplied for a given situation, Koch will be able to refer back to these intangible factors in order to decide what is right. See Heinrich Christoph KÖCH, *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition*, 3 vols., Leipzig 1782—1793; facs. ed., Georg Olms Verlag, Hildesheim 1969, I, pp. 9—14.

<sup>2</sup> For orientation, Koch refers his reader not only to Sulzer's work, but also to the *Einleitung in die schönen Wissenschaften* (1756—1758) of Karl RAMLER. This work is a translation, with commentary, of the *Cours de belles-lettres* (1747—1748) of Charles BATTEUX, [also entitled *Principes de la littérature* in the second and following editions], in which he expanded upon the ideas expressed in his *Les beaux-arts réduits à un même principe* (1746). It does not appear to have had a significant influence on Koch. He quotes from Ramler (Batteux) twice, once to emphasize the need to avoid wittiness in art, the second time to draw a comparison between music and painting. Koch's primary source for aesthetic ideas was indisputably Sulzer's encyclopedia. This, to be sure, was directly influenced by Batteux and others.

<sup>3</sup> Up to the article »Modulation«, Kirnberger provided all the material for the musical articles, which Sulzer then put into a more polished form. Then Johann A. P. Schulz began to help his mentor Kirnberger, who entrusted to him all the work on the musical articles from »S« on. (SCHULZ tells of their collaboration in the *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, 1800, II, cols. 276—280). The articles on aesthetics and, indeed, anything not specifically musical in nature are the work solely of Sulzer.

on aesthetics he explains that the purpose of such expression is to awaken lofty feelings in the listener.<sup>4</sup> These will ideally inspire noble resolutions and thus cultivate and improve him. Koch describes this chain of events as follows:

The fine arts in general, and thus also music, possess something peculiar to them which enables them to awaken feelings in us through artistic inducements . . . If now the fine arts avail themselves of this inherent ability so that the feelings aroused by them bring about lofty resolutions, so that these feelings have an effect on the development and ennoblement of the heart, then they fulfill their highest aim and demonstrate their proper worth. If one robs them of this noble purpose and uses them to another end, then one degrades and dishonors them.<sup>5</sup>

The use of music as a vehicle of virtuosity, therefore, is an abuse of the art; mechanical display arouses no lofty feelings and thus can have no ennobling influence. Sulzer, too, emphasizes the moral effect of the fine arts:

Their immediate effect is to awaken feeling in the psychological sense; their ultimate aim, however, is directed towards moral feelings, through which man attains his ethical worth.<sup>6</sup>

Through such influence, the fine arts attain their worth and may be considered the sisters of philosophy, rather than merely girls with whom to waste time.<sup>7</sup> The existence of the fine arts is thus justified: they have a beneficial effect just as do more respected disciplines such as philosophy and science. They differ only in that the means to their effect are the feelings rather than the mind.

<sup>4</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 15: »Die Tonkunst ist eine schöne Kunst, welche die Absicht hat edle Empfindungen in uns zu erwecken.«

<sup>5</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 16: »Die schönen Künste überhaupt, und also auch die Tonkunst, besitzen etwas Eigenthümliches, welches sie in den Stand setzt, durch künstliche Veranlassungen in uns Empfindungen zu erwecken... Bedienen sich nun die schönen Künste dieses ihnen eigenthümlichen Vermögens so, daß die durch sie erregten Empfindungen edle Entschlüsse bewürken, so, daß diese Empfindungen auf die Bildung und Veredlung des Herzens Einfluß haben, dann bedienen sie sich ihrer höchsten Absicht, und zeigen sich in der ihnen eigenthümlichen Würde. Raubt man ihnen diese hohe Absicht, gehet man mit ihnen auf einen andern Zweck aus, so erniedriget, so entehrt man sie.«

<sup>6</sup> Johann Georg SULZER, ed., *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* (4 vols., Heilmannsche Buchhandlung, Biel 1777), »Empfindung«, II, p. 417: »Ihre unmittelbare Wirkung ist Empfindung in psychologischem Sinn zu erwecken; ihr letzter Endzweck aber geht auf moralische Empfindungen, wodurch der Mensch seinen sittlichen Werth bekommt.« See also p. 419.

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, »Empfindung«, II, p. 417: »Sollen die schönen Künste Schwestern der Philosophie, nicht blos leichtfertige Dirnen seyn, die man zum Zeitvertreib herbey ruft; so müssen sie bey Ausstreuung der Empfindungen von Verstand und Weisheit geleitet werden.«

Although the fine arts derive their importance through their ultimate moral influence, Sulzer and Koch both focus on their more immediate effect and the means by which it is achieved. The fine arts must express feelings and arouse the same feelings in the listener or viewer. For this reason, music should only direct itself towards the heart; attempts to »paint« extramusical sounds and objects require the intermediary of the mind or the imagination and are thus inappropriate to the art.<sup>8</sup> Koch observes that Batteux and others taught that the subject of the artist is imitation of nature; those who interpret this to mean musical depiction of screaming women or singing cuckoos have neither read nor understood Batteux.<sup>9</sup> The nature to be imitated in art is not the outer world, but rather the inner world of feelings.

A given composition, however, may or may not have the desired effect upon the listener. The reason for this may be found in the listener, the performance, or the work itself. Some people have neither the ear nor the heart for music, and thus it can have no effect on them. Others have the necessary sensibility, but are already transported by a strong feeling; they are thus immune to the feeling expressed by the music, unless it happens to coincide with that which already has mastered them. The ideal listener has both the ear and heart for music and is not preoccupied by other concerns or emotions. He is receptive to the feelings expressed by the music, such feelings will be aroused in him, and art will thereby attain its highest aim.

Another circumstance which can influence the effect of a composition is the performance. Unlike the painter, poet, or sculptor, the composer needs the intermediary of the performer for the presentation of his work. If this person lacks taste or an understanding of the composition, then it may have no effect, or at least not that intended by its creator.

The most important factors determining the effect of a composition are to be found in the work itself. It must be the expression of a particular feeling; it must have both variety and unity; and it must observe the mechanical rules of the art.<sup>10</sup> Without these four characteristics, it is doubtful whether a composition can attain the true aim of art.

Koch stresses the importance of expression by a lengthy and emphatic statement from the *Allgemeine Theorie*:

The correct expression of feelings and passions in all their special shadings . . . is the principal, if not the sole function of

<sup>8</sup> See *ibid.*, »Mahlerey«, III, p. 206; »Musik«, III, pp. 266—267.

<sup>9</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, pp. 42—43.

<sup>10</sup> Important aspects of Koch's mechanical rules of melody are discussed in Nancy K. BAKER, »Heinrich Koch and the Theory of Melody«, *Journal of Music Theory*, 1976, XX, pp. 1—48.

a perfect composition . . . Expression is the soul of music: without it, it is merely a pleasant play of sound; through it, music becomes a most emphatic speech, which works irresistibly on our heart.<sup>11</sup>

The feeling, however, must be maintained or it will be but a fleeting impression and will have no effect on us. It must be presented in varying degrees of intensity, from different viewpoints, and in numerous relationships. This is in accord with the nature of our emotions, which, indeed, we must study to express them properly through art. Our feelings vary in intensity; they may suggest to us other feelings or ideas and appear in different connections. Always, however, we return to the principal feeling, drawn as if by a gravitational force. Thus the accurate expression of feelings is actually a series of presentations which reflect our successive emotional states.<sup>12</sup> Musically this is accomplished by the manipulation of the main ideas, which themselves are a succinct expression of the dominant feeling. To maintain their effect they are fragmented, put in new relationships, and given different harmonies. Their various modifications give the listener new insights into the nature of both the ideas themselves and the feeling which they express. Not only is this feeling thereby maintained and presented in all its guises, but the composition also obtains the variety necessary for it to be effective.

Multiplicity or variety (*Mannigfaltigkeit*) is the second of the characteristics essential to effective expression. By maintaining the listener's interest and involvement, it enables the music to affect and improve him. Use of different melodic ideas and harmonies is, of course, one source of variety, but should not be carried to extremes. Most desirable is the imaginative manipulation of but a few well-chosen ideas. The feeling will thus be maintained without a confusing plethora of ideas, and consequently there will be a greater unity amongst all the sections.

The variety necessary to maintain the feeling is subsumed under an all-embracing unity (*Einheit*) through which that feeling is clearly and unequivocally expressed. Each section and each idea

<sup>11</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, 128: »Der richtige Ausdruck der Empfindungen und Leidenschaften in allen ihren besondern Schattirungen . . . ist das vornehmste, wo nicht gar das einzige Verdienst eines vollkommenen Tonstückes . . . Der Ausdruck ist die Seele der Musik: ohne ihn ist sie blos ein angenehmes Spielwerk; durch ihn wird sie zur nachdrücklichsten Rede, die unwiderstehlich auf unser Herz würet«. Quoted from SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Ausdruck«, I, p. 146.

<sup>12</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, pp. 129—131. Both Koch and Sulzer use the term »*Gemüthsbewegungen*« to describe this series of emotions connected to one feeling. See Heinrich KOCH, *Musikalisches Lexikon*, Frankfurt 1802; facs. ed., Georg Olms Verlag, Hildesheim 1964, »Ausdruck«, col. 185; SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Ausdruck in der Musik«, I, p. 147.

must pursue the same aim, that is, reflect facets of the same feeling. Unity and variety thus cooperate in a common goal and are essential ingredients in any work of art. Just as the melodic ideas relate to a few principal themes treated in various ways, so all the harmonies all relate to one key from which one may make modulatory excursions: different rhythms may vary the musical motion, but all must be within one prevailing meter.<sup>13</sup>

The rules of the art must be observed constantly or the listener will be distracted, his ear offended, and his involvement diminished. The dissonances must be correctly resolved, the modulations smoothly effected, and all the mechanics of music properly handled. There will thus be no hindrance to the awakening of feelings in the listener and the attainment of the highest aim of art.

What feelings, however, can be awakened by music? Music itself speaks the language of feeling (*die Sprache der Empfindung*) and affects the heart directly. The reasons for this effect, however, are not explained; we do not know why we are led from one feeling to another, why we are caused to feel joy or sorrow. The emotion aroused in us therefore appears to be without purpose and can have no ethical effect.<sup>14</sup> When music and poetry are joined, however, this ambiguity disappears; not only can each feeling and its gradations be clearly defined, but the circumstances arousing the feeling are described. Music and poetry combined may attain the highest aim of art:

Thus together they affect the higher powers of the soul: they let us compare cause and effect, deed and feeling. Not only does this cause our heart to be interested in these feelings, but also these feelings, present for a purpose, will now bring about resolutions in us and will be able to contribute to the ennoblement of our heart.<sup>15</sup>

Music and poetry thus work towards a common goal and have a greater effect than either could have had separately. At times, the poetry must predominate, as music cannot distinguish some feelings such as disdain or envy; on the other hand, music can express the

<sup>13</sup> The three movements of a composition such as a symphony present various aesthetic difficulties, as they have such totally different content and express contrasting feelings. Koch feels that these abrupt emotional transitions are both difficult and unnatural. He proposes no solution for the problem, however; his own personal solution is to discuss one movement at a time. See KOCH, *Versuch*, II, pp. 44–45.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, II, pp. 29–30.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 31: »Sie würkt also zugleich auf die höhern Kräfte der Seele, sie läßt uns Ursache und Wirkung, Handlung und Empfindung mit einander vergleichen, und dieses verursacht, daß sich nicht allein unser Herz bey diesen Empfindungen interessirt fühlet, sondern diese zu einem Zwecke vorhandene Empfindungen werden nun auch in uns Entschlüsse bewürken, werden zur Veredlung unsers Herzens beytragen können«.

most intense anguish or joy, for which poetry has no adequate words. Together the two arts are capable of expressing all types and all degrees of emotion.

Deprived of the explanations of poetry, instrumental music has far more limited capabilities of expression. It still can depict both pleasant and unpleasant feelings; the latter, which might be painful in real life, have no such effect when inspired through art. However, music alone cannot differentiate between types of feelings which might have similar musical expression. Thus it must confine itself to reflecting more general feelings or impressions such as joy, tenderness, the sublime, and the comic. These it can distinguish clearly enough to avoid misinterpretation.<sup>16</sup>

Because of its limitations, therefore, Koch concludes that instrumental music is inferior to vocal music in both importance and effect. In his view, instrumental music is but an inadequate imitation of vocal music; hence the frequent parallels between the chorus and the symphony, the solo and the sonata.<sup>17</sup> Koch's prejudice against instrumental music is a natural corollary to the aesthetic system which he adopted from Sulzer. Kirnberger and Sulzer granted that music could speak the language of feeling, but thought that it required the aid of poetry if the circumstances of the feeling were to be explained. Thus music could achieve its full effect only when united with text.<sup>18</sup> The evaluation of instrumental music was rather low:

In the last place we put the application of music to concertos, which are contrived merely to pass the time and perhaps for practice in playing. To that category belong the concertos, the symphonies, the sonatas, [and] the solos, which in general present a lively and not unpleasant noise or an agreeable and amusing babble, which, however, does not engage the heart.<sup>19</sup>

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 34: »Nur in so weit kann er sich Rechnung machen, eine bestimmte Art der angenehmen oder unangenehmen Empfindungen in seinen Zuhörern zu erwecken, in so ferne er im Stande ist, die Aeusserungen dieser bestimmten Empfindung unterscheidend genug fühlbar zu machen«.

<sup>17</sup> KOCH, *Musikalisches Lexikon*, »Sinfonie oder Symphonie«, col. 1386: »die Instrumentalmusik überhaupt nichts anders ist, als Nachahmung des Gesanges...« See also KOCH, *Versuch*, III, pp. 315—316. As the voice is the most effective musical medium, the best instruments are those which most closely approximate the voice. See *Versuch*, II, pp. 139—140, and SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Instrumentalmusik«, II, pp. 750—751.

<sup>18</sup> SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Instrumentalmusik«, II, p. 749: »Hieraus lernen wir mit völliger Gewißheit, daß die Musik erst ihre volle Wirkung thut, wenn sie mit der Dichtkunst vereinigt ist, wenn Vocal- und Instrumentalmusik verbunden sind«.

<sup>19</sup> *Ibid.*, »Musik«, III, p. 273: »In die letzte Stelle setzen wir die Anwendung der Musik auf Concerte, die blos zum Zeitvertreib und etwa zur Uebung im Spielen angestellt werden. Dazu gehören die Concerte, die Symphonien, die Sonaten, die Solo, die insgesamt ein lebhaftes und nicht unangenehmes Geräusch, oder ein artiges und unterhaltendes, aber das Herz nicht beschäftigendes Geschwätz vorstellen«.

As instrumental music is limited in both its means and effect, Koch finds current trends somewhat puzzling. There had recently been a great proliferation of instrumental works and a concomitant neglect of vocal music.<sup>20</sup> His reaction is mixed — musical realities do not quite conform to his aesthetic beliefs. On the one hand, he wonders how people can be content with mere instrumental music when their pleasure could be so increased and ennobled if poetry were involved. On the other hand, he notes how very many of these instrumental works actually are adequate to the high aim of art and are capable of awakening pleasure through feeling.<sup>21</sup> No mention is here made of noble resolutions arising from this pleasure, but Koch's uncertainty is evident. Instrumental music seems to have far more powerful an effect than the aesthetic system would indicate possible.

Koch feels that one must first acquire skill in writing instrumental music before attempting the more difficult study of fugue and vocal music, which involve additional and complicated rules.<sup>22</sup> For this reason, in the *Versuch* he focuses on the more »elementary« study of instrumental music and refers the student to Marpurg's *Anleitung zur Singecomposition* for instruction in vocal composition. Koch's emphasis, therefore, is a reflection of his pedagogical beliefs rather than personal preference. He himself composed both vocal and instrumental music, nearly all of which is apparently lost, save for excerpts included in his prose works.<sup>23</sup>

Both vocal and instrumental music have as their purpose the expression of a feeling, with whatever accuracy and intensity is possible for the medium. The success or failure of this attempt is determined by its effect upon the listener; this, indeed, is the only just criterion, provided he is equipped with taste and artistic sensibility. The feeling expressed by the music should arouse that same feeling in the listener; if his emotion is intense, then the artwork is

<sup>20</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 35.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 36: »wie viele von der Menge dieser Instrumentalstücke, wie viele von unsern Sinfonien, Concerten, Quartetten u.s.w. wirklich der Absicht der Kunst entsprechen, wie viel derselben im Stande sind, durch Erregung dieser oder jener Empfindung Vergnügen zu erwecken!«

<sup>22</sup> See *ibid.*, III, pp. 51, 240.

<sup>23</sup> Koch wrote numerous occasional pieces, such as birthday and mourning cantatas, a chorale book for the court chapel, and solos, trios, concertos, and church music. See *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*, »Nachrichten«, 1816, XVIII, cols. 302—303. All of these works are apparently lost. However, in the archives of Rudolstadt, there are seven symphonies in manuscript, formerly belonging to the court chapel, which bear the name »Koch« on the title pages. These are the sole works by Koch which have been found, and there is the possibility that even these are not by Heinrich Christoph Koch. See Hans Heinrich EGGBRECHT, »Heinrich Christoph Koch«, in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, ed. by Friedrich Blume, 14 vols., Bärenreiter Verlag, Kassel 1949—1968, VII, col. 1297; and Peter GÜLKE, *Musik und Musiker in Rudolstadt*, Sonderausgabe der Rudolstädter Heimathefte, Rudolstadt 1963, pp. 31—32.

highly expressive.<sup>24</sup> Thus the feeling aroused is the only measure of the expression of feeling and the success of the composer's efforts.

The composer himself must possess certain qualities if he is to be capable of effective expression. He must be able to think melody harmonically; he must have inspiration; and he must be gifted with genius and taste. Conceiving of the melody first in a composition results in harmonic monotony; on the other hand, composing the harmonic progressions first and thence deriving a melody produces equally uninspired results. Most enviable is the ability to invent melodies while considering at the same time their harmonic implications; this is the skill of thinking melody harmonically. A composer so gifted will be able to provide just the proper harmonic variety and unity, and the expression of the composition will thereby be heightened.

An inspired state of soul (*Begeisterung*) is also necessary in order to compose. In this condition, the artist attains new perceptive powers and invents with uncommon ease. Koch quotes Sulzer for a description of inspiration, and Sulzer himself cannot fully explain the phenomenon.<sup>25</sup> This condition may be induced by intense concentration on one matter, or by the reading and study of works which express the feeling by which the artist wishes to be possessed. By the power of imagination (*Einbildungskraft*) he may arouse in himself any feeling, and thus more closely approach a state of inspiration, which will heighten his power to arouse this feeling in others.<sup>26</sup> It is, indeed, a condition best understood by those who have themselves been inspired.

Although his instruction in music theory is indeed comprehensive, Koch still has to admit that some things are inexplicable.<sup>27</sup> He can supply no recipe for the invention of melodies and therefore attributes this power to genius. Inspiration is but a temporary condition which presupposes this gift. It is in genius that beautiful melodies have their source; inspiration only makes them flow more freely. Genius, however, must always operate in conjunction with taste, or the aim of art will not be achieved. While genius enables the composer to invent with ease, taste must judge, which of his melodic ideas may be joined together, which are beautiful, and

<sup>24</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 129: »denn das Tonstück hat mehr oder weniger Ausdruck einer bestimmten Empfindung, wenn es die Eigenschaft hat diese Empfindung in einem stärkern oder schwächern Grade in uns zu erwecken«.

<sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*, II, pp. 94—95. Later in the article from which Koch quoted SULZER admits (*op. cit.*, »Begeisterung«, I, p. 185): »Niemand hat die Tiefen der menschlichen Seele hinlänglich ergründet, um dieses völlig zu erklären«.

<sup>26</sup> SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Einbildungskraft«, I, pp. 389—393. This power is but another aspect of genius.

<sup>27</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 94: »Wie es aber der angehende Tonsetzer anzufangen habe, daß in seiner Seele schöne Melodie entstehe, darzu wird nie die Theorie ächte Hilfsmittel erfinden können«.

which are appropriate to the expression of the work. By this faculty, developed through practice and the study of good compositions, the indiscriminate inventions of genius are evaluated and the best ideas selected and ordered into an effective whole.

Assuming that a composer has the requisite abilities, how, then, does a composition arise in his mind? This is indeed a difficult question, the answer to which is »better felt than described« — again Koch senses the limitations of music theory.<sup>28</sup> Nevertheless, because many people entertain misconceptions about the compositional process, and because it is a subject generally neglected, Koch attempts to explain the way in which a work arises in the mind of a composer, how he invents it, and how he works it out. To distinguish the phases of the creative process, Koch borrows three terms which Sulzer had applied to the fine arts in general: »Anlage,« »Ausführung,« and »Ausarbeitung.«<sup>29</sup> He relies heavily on Sulzer for his definitions as well as his terminology. Koch is original in his application of these ideas, however, and he elaborates on and modifies their earlier meanings.

\*  
\*            \*

Sulzer believes that the creation of any work of art involves a three-fold process: the sketch or plan (*Anlage*); its realization (*Ausführung*); and its elaboration (*Ausarbeitung*). He explains them as follows:

In the plan, the layout of the work, with its principal sections, is determined; the realization gives each main section its form; and the elaboration manipulates the smaller connections and completely fits together the smallest sections, each in its proper relationship and best form.<sup>30</sup>

He elaborates on this by specific reference to the painting of a portrait. In the plan, the artist will first sketch the picture as a whole and decide upon the colors of the principal areas. In the realization of this sketch, each of these sections will be given its true form and

<sup>28</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 51: »Diese Frage . . . eine Sache betrifft, die sich besser empfinden als beschreiben läßt, und bey welcher man sich, indem man davon spricht, leicht der Gefahr aussetzt mißverstanden zu werden.«

<sup>29</sup> Sulzer in turn borrowed the concepts from Mattheson, who viewed music and its composition in rhetorical terms; see discussion below.

<sup>30</sup> Sulzer, *op. cit.*, »Anlage«, I, p. 74: »In der Anlage wird der Plan des Werks, mit den Haupttheilen desselben bestimmt, die Ausführung giebt jedem Haupttheil seine Gestalt, und die Ausarbeitung bearbeitet die kleinern Verbindungen, und füget die kleinsten Theile völlig, jeden in seinem rechten Verhältniß, und bester Form zusammen.«

appropriate colors and shadings. The work is further refined in the elaboration by reflections and finer gradations of color, and the smallest details are added.<sup>31</sup>

Of these three stages of creation, the first is the most crucial; the later phases are only possible within the framework of the finished plan. It is this which is the essence of a work and through which it becomes a coherent artistic expression. Sulzer says:

When the plan is completed, then nothing more that is essential can come into the work. It already contains all the important ideas, and for that reason requires the most genius. Therefore a work acquires its greatest value from the plan. That constitutes the soul of a work and establishes everything that pertains to its inner character and to the effect which it should have.<sup>32</sup>

The plan, therefore, is a product of genius which contains all the essential ideas and defines the affection to be expressed. The later stages of creation, accomplished when the artist is in a calmer state of mind, are but amplifications and refinements of this initial inspiration.

Sulzer is specific in his distinctions between phases of the creative process, but the process he outlines is itself but a general formula for the arts. Concerned with the practical matter of composition, Koch seeks to apply these aesthetic abstractions to musical realities.

Koch defines the plan (*Anlage*) of a musical work as

the main ideas of the composition already connected with one another, which present themselves together to the composer as a complete whole, along with its main harmonic features . . .<sup>33</sup>

If the ideas present themselves in this fashion during the first burst of inspiration, the composer need only consider their accompaniment, and his outline is complete. Usually, however, the composer is less fortunate and an overabundance of appropriate ideas comes to him. Here taste must come to the aid of genius and select only those ideas which are beautiful and may also be joined together into

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, »Ausarbeitung«, I, p. 126.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, »Anlage«, I, p. 74: »Wenn die Anlage vollendet ist, so muß nichts wesentliches mehr in das Werk hinein kommen können. Sie enthält schon alles wichtige der Gedanken, und erfordert [*sic*] deßwegen das meiste Genie. Darum bekommt ein Werk seinen größten Werth von der Anlage. Sie bildet die Seele desselben, und setzt alles feste, was zu seinem innerlichen Charakter, und zu der Wirkung, die es thun soll, gehöret«.

<sup>33</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 53: »die schon mit einander in Verbindung gebrachten Hauptgedanken des Satzes, die sich zusammen dem Tonsetzer als ein vollkommnes Ganzes darstellen, nebst den harmonischen Hauptzügen desselben . . .« See also KOCH, *Musikalisches Lexikon*, »Anlage«, cols. 146—147.

a harmonious whole. In the final plan, the ideas must appear in what seems the only possible order. Once this order is established, the composer must use his skill in thinking melody harmonically and mentally experiment with accompanying harmonies and figures which might reinforce the affection to be expressed. When this plan is conceived in its most complete form, then he must, of course, set it down in writing. For the written version of the plan Koch uses a different word, »*Entwurf*,« and thereby indicates that »*Anlage*« denotes a mental construct only. The two terms, however, refer to the same stage of composition, and Koch uses them interchangeably.<sup>34</sup>

When the plan is completed and notated, then one is ready to proceed with its realization (*Ausführung*). Both Koch and Sulzer stress that the composer must be completely content with the plan before going on to the next stage of composition. A deficient plan will generally result in a mediocre realization and is best abandoned.<sup>35</sup> Assuming it is satisfactory, however, one may then begin to manipulate the ideas contained therein.

In the realization, the ideas of the plan are presented in modified and fragmented forms; this occurs in the course of various main periods, through which the work attains its dimensions.<sup>36</sup> Koch recommends the study of good compositions as the best instruction in this process, for he himself cannot provide rules. Again this is a matter »better felt than described,« for it involves that intangible agent, taste.<sup>37</sup> Although inspired genius brings forth the plan, its realization is accomplished through the combined efforts of reason and taste.<sup>38</sup>

The manipulations of the main ideas and the subsidiary ideas which are connected with them must at all times be appropriate to the prevailing affection. The purpose of these modifications is to

<sup>34</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, pp. 96—97: »Diese nun sichtbar dargestellte, oder in Noten gesetzte Anlage wird der Entwurf des Tonstücks genennet...« Koch does not stress the distinction between these terms, and consistently refers to the plan of Graun's aria as the *Anlage*. Since it is notated, it would by definition be the *Entwurf*.

<sup>35</sup> SULZER, *op. cit.*, »*Anlage*«, I, p. 74. Koch quotes at length from this article in the *Versuch*, II, p. 57.

<sup>36</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 97. Manipulation of the main ideas also occurs in the first main period, which contains the plan. This is apparent in Koch's analysis of the Graun aria, discussed below.

<sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 103: »Schicklicher und von mehrerm Nutzen sind in diesem Stücke gute practische Beyspiele, weil die vollkommen passende Verbindung sowohl der wesentlichen als zufälligen Theile eines Stücks sich besser empfinden als beschreiben läßt«.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 98: »So wie die Anlage hauptsächlich die Sache des begeisterten Genies war, so ist nun die Ausführung mehr der Gegenstand des Geschmacks, wobey aber auch zugleich die höhern Seelenkräfte, z. B. Verstand und Beurtheilungskraft ihre Würksamkeit äussern müssen...« This statement is but a paraphrase of Sulzer's ideas; see SULZER, *op. cit.*, »*Entwurf*«, I, p. 440.

create variety which will sustain the feeling expressed by the ideas of the plan. The composer, therefore, must adapt his realization to the nature of the affection, and for this must have studied the theory of feelings (*die Theorie der Empfindungen*).<sup>39</sup> Only then will he be familiar with the series of emotions connected with one affection and thus capable of presenting the main ideas in an appropriate series of modifications. Since the fine arts have as their aim the expression and awakening of feelings, it is an obvious requirement that the artist himself must be thoroughly familiar with these feelings. As Sulzer observes, the word »aesthetics,« or the theory of the fine arts, actually means the science of feelings; the rules which govern these arts are derived from the system of the emotions which they seek to express.<sup>40</sup>

The mechanical aspects of the realization must also be considered, as these are crucial to the achievement of an emotional effect. Koch demonstrates how the realization is structural in nature:

One usually considers the harmonic plan [the modulations] and the form of a composition as the mechanical part of the realization, and the latter is for the most part determined by the former.<sup>41</sup>

Thus it is through the realization of the plan that a composition attains its form; conversely, the various forms in music arise from different types of realization. The number of periods, their size, their modulations, and the repetitions they contain all combine to create the form of a composition.<sup>42</sup> Ideally this should arise from

<sup>39</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 99: »Man siehet überdies aus diesem Beyspiele zugleich, wie nöthig es für den Tonsetzer sey, die Theorie der Empfindungen zu studiren, damit er nicht allein im Stande sey, alle Mittel zu entdecken, wodurch in der Tonkunst diese oder jene Empfindung erweckt werden kann, sondern damit er auch die Ausführung nach der Natur und Beschaffenheit der Empfindung, die er behandelt, einrichten, und bestimmen kann, wie eine Empfindung auf die andere geleitet werden muß.«

<sup>40</sup> SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Aesthetik«, I, p. 27: »Das Wort bedeutet eigentlich die Wissenschaft der Empfindungen, welche in der griechischen Sprache genennt werden. Die Hauptabsicht der schönen Künste geht auf die Erwekung eines lebhaften Gefühls des Wahren und des Guten, also muß die Theorie derselben auf die Theorie der undeutlichen Erkenntnis und der Empfindungen gegründet seyn.«

<sup>41</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 103: »Zu dem mechanischen Theile der Ausführung rechnet man gewöhnlich die Tonausweichung und die Form des Tonstücks; und diese wird größtentheils durch jene bestimmt.« For further discussion of Koch's ideas concerning the relationship between harmony and form, see Nancy K. BAKER, »From *Teil* to *Tonstück*: The Significance of the *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition* by Heinrich Christoph Koch«, Ph.D. dissertation, Yale University, 1975.

<sup>42</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 97: »Die Anzahl, der Umfang und die Stellung dieser Perioden, desgleichen auch die dabey beobachtete Tonausweichung, der Ort wo dieser oder jener Haupttheil des Ganzen wiederholt wird, u. s. w. giebt dem Stücke die Form.«

the expression of the feeling rather than from adherence to an arbitrary pattern. Although Koch has no objection to the established forms, he feels they must not be considered inflexible.<sup>43</sup>

The form itself, however, is produced and defined by the harmonic plan, the pattern of modulations. Modulation creates variety and highlights different facets of the affection. Thus one must use this harmonic tool with great attention to its effect. Particularly in vocal music, modulation is an essential means by which to illustrate events or moods described by the text. Koch demonstrates its expressive powers by the final chorus from a cantata he wrote on a text by Weismann.<sup>44</sup> There, for example, anxious longing is reflected in the use of the minor mode, and, with the transition to a happier feeling, there is a modulation to the relative major. Modulation thus functions to increase the expression of the text, and the most expressive form therefore will arise from the feeling itself.

When the composer has realized the ideas of the plan in various modifications and harmonic contexts, his composition is well on its way to completion. If all this is written down, along with the entire bass part and occasional indications for the content of the secondary parts, then he is ready to proceed with the final stage of his work.

In the elaboration, the composer completes those subsidiary parts already begun, adds others, and provides the decorative details through which the work attains its final polish. The degree of elaboration must be appropriate to the prevailing affection; it is this which should determine whether the harmony is full or thin, whether the subsidiary parts consist of excited metrical figures or calm and unobtrusive lines. When the feeling is at its highest intensity, details should be at a minimum or the effect will be diminished. At all times one must avoid extremes of elaboration, for too much detail can disguise the main ideas and their expression. Koch quotes Sulzer's caution that excess elaboration is comparable to sharpening a knife until it disappears: refinement carried to extremes can destroy the power of a work.<sup>45</sup> Other matters affecting the degree of elaboration are the type of composition, the place of performance, and the distribution of parts. Compositions involving many parts, such as a chorus or symphony, will have less subtle refinements than an aria or solo instrumental piece. A work to be performed in intimate settings will have greater elaboration than one intended

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 119: »so binde man sich nicht ängstlich an die bekannte Form, sondern man bilde sie so, wie es der Saz [*sic*] den man bearbeitet, erfordert . . .«

<sup>44</sup> See *ibid.*, II, pp. 105—116. The text originated with an ode by Weismann, to which the poet added two more strophes for Koch's cantata. According to Koch, it was published by Weismann with an essay on the cantata.

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid.*, II, p. 127; quoted from SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Ausarbeitung«, I, p. 128.

for large halls or the outdoors. If many instruments are performing each part, then, again, great refinement would be unsuitable. Always taste must help one determine exactly what is the appropriate degree of elaboration.

Although some of the decisions concerning the accompanying parts are part of the plan, their actual execution takes place in the realization and elaboration. These parts must be appropriate not only to the prevailing feeling but also to the harmony determined by the bass. Thus, in essence, they will be derived from a preexistent harmonic progression. Koch does not recommend composing the harmony first in a plan, when the composer will ideally be conceiving his melody and harmony simultaneously; in the realization and elaboration, however, he feels this method can be most useful. In the realization, the composer may transfer melodic ideas to the bass and then derive the upper part from its implied harmonies. In the elaboration, this method enables him to add middle parts which are in accord with the established harmony. Such an approach to composition is familiar to the student through his exercises in the harmonic species, when the cantus firmus is in the bass part. Used with the guidance of taste, it can be most effective.<sup>46</sup>

Koch repeatedly recommends the study of good compositions as the best possible instruction in composition. This approach is especially necessary with regard to the second phase of creation, the realization of the plan, for which there are few rules. Since, of course, the models are already complete compositions, one must first imagine the plan of the work in order to appreciate its realization.<sup>47</sup> As a demonstration, Koch abstracts what he considers the plan of a work so well-known that he assumes all his readers will have the complete version at hand. The composition which he analyzes is »Ein Gebeth um neue Stärke«, the second aria from the cantata *Der Tod Jesu* (1755) of Karl Heinrich Graun; Koch's plan for the first part of this work appears as Example 1.<sup>48</sup>

Koch observes that the aria which Graun realized from this plan contains no other new ideas: all is repetition, elaboration, or continuation of these main ideas. He justifies the inclusion in the plan of certain figures which might be questioned as essential elements. The sixteenth-note figure of the violins in mm. 8—9 and again in mm. 10—11 is a part of the plan as it connects two main sections

<sup>46</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, pp. 76—81. Concerning the harmonic species, see *ibid.*, I, pp. 257—365, and BÄKER, »From *Teil* to *Tonstück*«, pp. 78—94.

<sup>47</sup> KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 103: »Bey diesem Studio muß man aber nothwendig den *Satz*, dessen Ausführung man studiren will, sich erst als Anlage denken, das heißt, man muß erst untersuchen, welches die Hauptgedanken desselben sind, die in verschiedenen Wendungen und Zergliederungen, und mit Nebengedanken vermischt, ausgeführt worden sind«.

<sup>48</sup> KOCH's plan for the aria and his commentary appear in *ibid.*, II, pp. 60—70.

**Allegretto**

Ein Ge - beth um neu - e

5 Stärke, zur Voll - en - dung ed - ler

10 Werke, theilt die Wolken

theilt die Wolken dringt zum Herrn,

15 und der Herr er - hört es gern er -

20 hört es gern der Herr er - hört es gern.

Example 1

(*Haupttheile*) of the whole. The figures in the violins beginning in m. 15 are also essential, he says, as they belong to the total melodic picture of the movement.

What Koch has omitted from the plan is of equal interest. The repetition of »dringt zum Herrn,« with a slight variation in the melody, found in mm. 38—40 of the complete version is not included in the plan. Koch evidently considers it part of the realization. Why, then, did he include the second statement of »theilt die Wolken,« which also has a similar musical accompaniment? (See Example 2.) The answer to this may lie in the harmony. The repetition of »dringt zum Herrn« takes place over the same harmony as that with which the first statement ended; it is essentially a prolongation of the D major triad. By contrast, the repetition of »theilt die Wolken« is accompanied by the same melodic figure as the first statement, but on different scale degrees. With the change in harmony, this repetition becomes significant. While the first statement goes from the tonic to the dominant, the repetition goes from the dominant back to the tonic. These two statements thus contain in microcosm the harmonic plan of the entire first section of the aria. In addition, this brief juxtaposition of the two tonal areas immediately precedes the actual modulation to the dominant. Since the repetition is thus connected with »the main harmonic features« of the composition, it qualifies for inclusion in the plan.<sup>49</sup>

Koch's own interpretations, however, are flexible. Although he initially states that »no more and no less« may be considered part of the plan of this aria, he later allows that the repetition of »dringt zum Herrn« might indeed be included. His reason is that this emphatic repetition appears immediately after the idea is first stated.<sup>50</sup> He, too, may have seen some inconsistency in his exclusion of this repetition and the inclusion of the other one.

To the realization of the plan belong the following: the repetition of »dringt zum Herrn« (mm. 38—40); the ritornelli (mm. 1—24, 63—70, 127—143); the remainder of the first solo section (m. 47 to the cadence in mm. 69—70); and the entire second solo section (mm. 71—127). All of this is but repetition and modification of the essential ideas of the plan. They are presented in different relationships and given new twists, but nothing truly new appears.

Koch assumes that when writing his plan Graun determined the nature of the accompanying parts. He evidently decided that they would have no distinguishing metrical figures, that the first violin would support the vocal part at the unison, and that the viola

<sup>49</sup> Koch's description of the plan includes not only the main ideas of the composition, but also its main harmonic features.

<sup>50</sup> See KOCH, *Versuch*, II, p. 63, note \*. His rationalization is weak; the initial exclusion of this repetition from the plan seems more in keeping with his general ideas concerning the three stages of the compositional process.

theilt die Wol - ken,

This system contains measures 31 through 34. The music is in G major (one sharp) and 4/4 time. The vocal line begins with a sixteenth-note triplet in measure 31, followed by a dotted quarter note in measure 32. The piano accompaniment consists of a steady eighth-note bass line in the left hand and a treble line with chords and some sixteenth-note patterns.

35  
theilt die Wol - ken, dringt zum

This system contains measures 35 through 38. Measure 35 starts with a measure rest. The vocal line continues with a dotted quarter note in measure 35, followed by a half note in measure 36, and a half note in measure 37. A slur covers the vocal line in measure 38, which ends with a fermata. The piano accompaniment continues with a steady eighth-note bass line and chords in the treble.

40  
Herrn, dringt zum Herrn,

This system contains measures 39 through 42. Measure 39 starts with a measure rest. The vocal line has a half note in measure 39, followed by a half note in measure 40, and a half note in measure 41. A slur covers the vocal line in measure 42, which ends with a fermata. The piano accompaniment continues with a steady eighth-note bass line and chords in the treble.

Example 2

and bassoon would frequently double the bass part at the octave. The elaboration of the aria thus involves composing the second violin part, which usually accompanies the vocal part in thirds and sixths, and the viola and bassoon parts, when they are not doubling the bass. When all these are written, along with the final polish of phrase indications and similar details, the aria is complete. By having abstracted the plan, one comes to a better understanding of its realization and elaboration.

There are various options for the second part of an aria.<sup>51</sup> In some instances, one plan can serve for the entire aria; the second section therefore will be part of a rather extensive elaboration. In this case, it is permissible to introduce new ideas in the realization, provided they appear in the second part. Because of textual considerations, however, the second part will frequently require its own contrasting plan. If this is written immediately after the plan for the first section, the two plans may have subtle relationships which contribute to the unity of the aria as a whole. Yet, in this case, there is always the danger of waning inspiration. Whatever the source of its plan, the second part of an aria is usually quite brief, without any extensive realization.

The second section of the Graun aria, for which Koch does not provide the plan, differs from the first part in meter, mode, and plan. There are numerous resemblances between the sections, however, which suggest that Graun might have composed the second plan upon finishing the first. The principal idea of the second section is an eighth-note motive consisting of a rising gesture over a simple bass, which may be a dominant pedal point (mm. 144—146 seen in Example 3, 160—165, 172—176, and varied in 179—183); it

*Allegretto*

145

*Klimm ich, zu der Tu - gend*

*p*

Example 3

is probably intended to illustrate the climbing heavenwards of the believer. This is related to a figure found in the first section (mm. 41—45 seen in Example 4a, 110—117) and also to the opening mo-

<sup>51</sup> KOCH discusses these in *ibid.*, II, pp. 64—67.

tive of the aria (see Example 4b), which permeates the entire first section in various forms. With the words »und erleichte meinen Gang« (mm. 168—171 seen in Example 5a) there appears the motive previously used to accompany the phrase »theilt die Wolken« (mm. 33—36, 104—107, and especially 79—82 seen in Example 5b). Despite their difference in meter, the resemblances between these phrases are unmistakable. The continuous use of parallel thirds in both sections only contributes further to the overall unity within the variety found in the aria.

41

und der Herr er -

45

hört es gern, er - hört

Example 4a

25

Ein Ge - beth um

*p*

Example 4b

Although Koch accepts most of Sulzer's ideas concerning the three stages of creation, he has some difficulty finding a musical equivalent for the plan. Sulzer, whose orientation was primarily visual, compares the plan to the sketch of a work as a whole. The principal sections are outlined and the effect which the work should have is established. Thus the realization and elaboration are merely suc-

Example 5a

Example 5b

cessive stages of refinement. In music, however, the concept of plan is more difficult: how does one show the basic melodic and harmonic events without, in effect, composing the piece?

Koch was faced with a problem in attempting to define a plan: Sulzer's formula of »all the important ideas« of a work as well as »the layout of a work, with its principal sections« was a virtual impossibility with regard to music. In his illustration of the plan of the Graun aria, Koch does present some of what he prescribed for a plan — »the main ideas of the composition already connected with one another.« It is an abstraction, consisting of the principal ideas joined together in a skeletal state. Although Koch also defines the plan as containing the »main harmonic features« of a composition, he shows in his example that these features comprise the harmony of only a part of the first section, not the entire piece. The remaining periods receive their form, through harmony, in the realization. Although the complete content of a composition is present in the plan, its form is as yet undetermined. Because of the nature of the medium, therefore, Koch's conception of the plan is more limited than that of Sulzer.<sup>52</sup>

<sup>52</sup> In the twentieth century, Heinrich Schenker (1868—1935) developed a method by which to show the harmonic and contrapuntal nature of a composition in its totality. He outlines three main structural levels: the background, or *Ursatz*, which is the fundamental skeleton of a composition; the middleground, which shows the essential expansions of the basic *Ursatz* through unfoldings and prolongations; and the foreground, which elaborates the middleground (and background). The complete composition therefore

The musical plan is roughly analogous to the first section of a composition, if one disregards introductions, opening ritornelli, etc. Yet one must avoid the facile equation of the plan with the completed exposition of a symphony or sonata, or the finished first section of an aria. It is a musical abstraction which provides the material for an actual composition. However, not all of the parts are present, and those that are notated are incomplete and unpolished. More important, however, such areas of pure, distilled statement are seldom found in musical reality. Instead, developmental procedures are practiced upon the ideas immediately after their initial statement, as in the Graun aria.<sup>53</sup>

Koch's conception of the realization more closely accords with that of Sulzer, who stated that »the realization gives each main section its form.« Although for Koch the main sections had not yet been determined, in the realization they are established and do receive their form. In this process, form is also given to the first section, which contains the ideas of the plan. As in the Graun aria, repetition and slight modifications may be found following the appearance of the essential ideas.<sup>54</sup> The harmonic areas through which

may be regarded as a composite of those three levels (*Schichten*). Although there are parallels with Sulzer's three stages of creation which Koch then applied to composition, they are superficial. The background of Schenker, while it presents the overall framework, does not include the main melodic ideas, which Koch also prescribed for the plan; they would be a part of the foreground and middleground. In Koch's view, the main melodic ideas are essential to the effect of a work of art and thus to the attainment of the highest aim of art. As the soul of a work, they would have to be present in all stages of creation and are not merely a part of the final elaboration. In addition, Koch's presentation is intended to elucidate compositional procedure and to be used by the composer. Schenker, on the other hand, was explicit in warning that his analytical method could not be used to generate masterworks, since such works could only be produced by composers of genius. [I am very grateful to Professor Allen Forte for his criticism and suggestions concerning the above paragraph].

<sup>53</sup> Later, when he discusses the two main parts of the Allegro of a symphony, KOCH states (*Versuch*, III, pp. 304—305): »Der erste derselben, in welchem die Anlage der Sinfonie, das ist, die melodischen Hauptsätze in ihrer ursprünglichen Folge vorgetragen, und hernach einige derselben zergliedert werden, bestehet nur aus einem einzigen Hauptperioden«. Although grammatically this statement leaves much to be desired, it is clear that developmental procedures such as fragmentation are found in the first section, or exposition. The plan is present in this first section, and the main ideas appear in their original order, but this does not preclude the possibility of interpolations between these ideas. For further discussion of the content of the first section of an Allegro, see BAKER, »From *Teil* to *Tonstück*«, pp. 251—300.

<sup>54</sup> In demonstrating the inaccuracy of typical textbook descriptions of sonata form, Leonard RATNER stresses that the areas of statement and development are not mutually exclusive, but instead are combined throughout a composition. See his excellent article, »Harmonic Aspects of Classic Form«, *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 1949, II, pp. 159—168.

the form is defined are, of course, those of the entire composition. For obvious reasons therefore, one cannot equate the realization to the so-called »development« section of sonata form.

The elaboration is, for both Koch and Sulzer, the completion and perfection of the work, in which finishing touches are added to all of its sections. After this, one may test the effect of the artwork on the listener or viewer.

\*  
\*            \*

The aesthetic ideas of Sulzer which Koch adapted to music were not in the vanguard of eighteenth-century thought. Sulzer's emphasis on the creator's feeling and its expression and on the importance of inspiration and genius do herald attitudes of the following decades, when these were indeed matters of central importance, discussed almost more than the artwork itself. In many ways, however, Sulzer's ideas are quite conservative, particularly with regard to music.

The three successive stages in creation which Sulzer describes have their origin in the art of rhetoric. They do not differ essentially from the disposition, elaboration, and decoration described by Johann Mattheson (1681—1764) in his *Der vollkommene Capellmeister* of 1739. Discussing melodic invention, Mattheson writes:

If now a further instructive consideration of the art of invention is to be undertaken, then in the first place it will be necessary to demonstrate that this very art must have three inseparable comrades, without which even the most beautiful ideas are of little value. These three are called *Dispositio*, *Elaboratio* & *Decoratio*, that is, the appropriate *disposition*, assiduous *elaboration*, and judicious *decoration* of the melodic work . . .<sup>55</sup>

Like Sulzer's plan, Mattheson's disposition (*Einrichtung*) involves the entire work; it is a sketch of the principal sections, which Mattheson labels with the rhetorical terms *Exordium*, *Narratio*, *Propositio*, *Confirmatio*, *Confutatio*, and *Peroratio*.<sup>56</sup> Mattheson's elaboration (*Ausarbeitung*) is parallel to Sulzer's second stage of

<sup>55</sup> Johann MATTHESON, *Der vollkommene Capellmeister*, ed. Margarete Reimann, Hamburg 1739; facs. ed., Bärenreiter Verlag, Kassel 1954, Part II, p. 122: »Wenn nun hier eine fernere lehrreiche Betrachtung von der Erfindungs-Kunst angestellet werden soll, so wird zuvörderst nöthig seyn darzuthun, daß dieselbe Kunst drey unzertrennliche Gefährten haben müsse, ohne welche auch die allerschönsten Einfälle von schlechter Würde sind. Diese drey heissen: *Dispositio*, *Elaboratio* & *Decoratio*, d. i. die geschickte *Einrichtung*, fleißige *Ausarbeitung* und gescheute *Schmückung* des melodischen Wercks . . .«

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*, Part II, p. 235.

creation, the realization of the plan, in which these principal sections are more fully developed. Both men stress the need for a good disposition/plan before approaching this phase. The elaboration requires »cold blood« and »reflection« according to Mattheson; similarly, Sulzer feels the realization is a somewhat mechanical process, requiring the guidance of reason and taste.<sup>57</sup> Mattheson's decoration (*Schmückung*) and Sulzer's elaboration (*Ausarbeitung*) are clearly parallel and involve the finishing details of a work. Neither writer is overly clear concerning the second stage of creation, and it seems to have much in common with the final stage. For both, however, the initial disposition/plan is definitely the most essential part of the creative process.

Although he borrows rhetorical concepts, Sulzer does not regard music solely in terms of rhetoric, nor does he describe a system of the affections comparable to that of Mattheson. Nevertheless, he was strongly influenced by ideas which in effect developed from the doctrine(s) of the affections in the mid-eighteenth century. In his concept of both the content and aim of art, Sulzer shows strong traces of the theory of art as imitation, traces which are consequently to be found in Koch's aesthetic ideas as well.

In his article on aesthetics, Sulzer mentions that, amongst the moderns, only Dubos and Baumgarten have made significant advances over the ideas of the Greeks, specifically Aristotle. Dubos, he says, was the first to found aesthetic theory upon a general principle, and Baumgarten the first to develop an entire philosophy of the fine arts.<sup>58</sup> At the time unaware of some of the new ideas developing in England and France, Sulzer concludes that, in general, aesthetics is a relatively neglected field. His own ideas are greatly indebted to those expressed by Jean Dubos (1670—1742) in his *Réflexions critiques sur la poésie et sur la peinture* of 1719, in which the author advances an imitative theory of art.

Dubos believes that the function of the arts is to give man pleasure through emotional gratification. The arts approach the heart through the senses and arouse passions in men through their imitation of nature. Dubos distinguishes between a lower type of imitation in which natural objects and phenomena are reproduced, and a higher type which reflects the world of the passions.<sup>59</sup> As this

<sup>57</sup> *Ibid.*, Part II, p. 241: »Die Erfindung will Feuer und Geist haben; die Einrichtung Ordnung und Maasse; die *Ausarbeitung* kalt Blut und Bedachtsamkeit«. Unlike Sulzer, Mattheson here distinguishes between the invention and the disposition (plan).

<sup>58</sup> SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Aesthetik«, I, pp. 27—29. Baumgarten applied his theory only to rhetoric and poetry and thus lacked the comprehensiveness which Sulzer himself hoped to achieve.

<sup>59</sup> Jean DUBOS, *Réflexions critiques sur la poésie et sur la peinture*, 3 vols., P. J. Mariette, Paris 1746, 5th ed., rev. and corr., I, pp. 208—209, 213.

reality is not seen but felt, its imitation requires both intuition and genius: »one must . . . know how to copy nature without seeing it.«<sup>60</sup>

These two types of imitation are also possible in music. The inferior type attempts to reproduce the sounds of reality, and the nobler type imitates the passions, man's inner nature. The necessity of imitation results in the same value judgment with regard to vocal and instrumental music which Sulzer and Koch were later to express. Abstract instrumental music is greatly inferior as it lacks an object of imitation, and therefore has no artistic justification. When fortified by extramusical associations, instrumental music can present a lower form of imitation. Dubos thinks most highly of a symphony representing a storm from the opera *Alcione* (1706) of Marin Marais.<sup>61</sup> The higher form of imitation, however, is only possible when music is allied with poetry. The passion which is the object of imitation can then be defined, and the music will give »a new force to the poetry.«<sup>62</sup> If the imitation is an accurate one, the same passion will be excited in the listener and the artwork itself thereby justified.

Later in the century, Charles Batteux (1713—1780) further developed Dubos's ideas in his *Les beaux-arts réduits à un même principe* of 1746. For him, the very purpose and not merely the means of art is imitation of an idealized version of nature, what he calls »la belle nature«. He, too, distinguishes between literal imitation of the external world and a nobler imitation of the human passions. The latter type of imitation is possible in music, he concludes, only in conjunction with a text.<sup>63</sup>

Sulzer shares with Dubos a concern for the effect of art on man; this, they believe, is its true function, rather than mere imitation, as in Batteux's system. Sulzer goes one step further than Dubos and requires that the immediate emotional effect of the arts have a longer-range ethical effect. For Dubos, arousal of emotion is sufficient justification for art. All three men, however, are essentially agreed upon one basic point: namely, that art is an imitation of nature.

On the surface, Sulzer seems to reject the theory of imitation. He states that of the fine arts, only painting originates from imitation of nature; other arts, such as poetry and music, arise from the need to express feelings. However, he believes that one should

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid.*, I, p. 208: »Il faut . . . sçavoir copier la nature sans la voir«.

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid.*, I, pp. 439—440. He is referring to the »Tempeste« from Act IV of *Alcione*.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, I, p. 435: »une nouvelle force à la Poësie«.

<sup>63</sup> Charles BATTEUX, *Les beaux-arts réduits à un même principe*, new ed., Durand, Paris 1747, p. 284: »La Musique étant significative dans la symphonie, où elle n'a qu'une demi-vie, que la moitié de son être, que sera-t'elle dans le chant, où elle devient le tableau du cœur humain?«

imitate nature in her »general method.«<sup>64</sup> If the artist needs to depict specific circumstances, he must select from nature only those aspects which are appropriate to his goal. This is advice directly related to Batteux's concept of »*la belle nature*,« the idealized version of nature which the artist extracts from reality.<sup>65</sup> Indeed, despite his denial of its imitative character, Sulzer's concept of music seems closely related to that of Dubos and Batteux — it is only his concept of nature which is different. The expression in music to which Sulzer so frequently refers appears to be more an imitation of an affection or a series of affections than an individual's expression of feeling. It does not seem essentially different from the higher imitation of »inner nature« described by Dubos. Both the content and the immediate purpose are the same: portrayal of an emotion and the arousal of that same emotion in the viewer or listener. For Sulzer, however, nature is more than outer reality or human emotions; it is now a god-like power whose actions determine our destiny and whose methods we would do well to study. Sulzer's view of nature and his continual emphasis on expression are both signs of current aesthetic trends. They appear, however, in conjunction with ideas related to the earlier concepts of art as imitation and music as comparable to rhetoric. Sulzer's aesthetic position is indeed difficult to define. Although one might explain his inconsistencies by his eclecticism, they are perhaps more justly viewed as a sign of the rapid development then taking place in the field of aesthetics.

Koch made no significant advances over the theories of Sulzer, which he adopted so totally. His own contribution lies only in his attempt to apply general rules of invention specifically to composition. Whether or not the method of composing which Koch outlines could ever have been used is another matter. In theory, it is possible — although in all likelihood Koch himself did not compose this way. What Koch is attempting to do is to present an aesthetic system which has some relevance to the practical side of the art. Indeed, his primary interest is in practical rather than abstract considerations. Nevertheless, he feels that an awareness of aesthetic concepts and a knowledge of the intangibles of composition are essential to anyone attempting to produce effective works of art. In the course of his discussion, he also establishes precisely what cannot be taught.

<sup>64</sup> SULZER, *op. cit.*, »Nachahmung«, III, p. 285: »Dadurch erfährt der Künstler, durch was für Mittel die Natur Vergnügen und Mißvergnügen in uns erweket, und wie wunderbar sie bald die eine, bald die andere dieser Empfindungen ins Spiel setzet, um auch den sittlichen Menschen auszubilden, und ihn dahin zu bringen, wo sie ihn haben will... Kurz, die Natur ist die wahre Schule, in der er die Maximen seiner Kunst lernen kann, und wo er durch Nachahmung ihres allgemeinen Verfahrens, die Regeln des seingens zu entdecken hat«.

<sup>65</sup> BATTEUX, *op. cit.*, pp. 24—28.

## Sažetak

## ESTETIČKE TEORIJE HEINRICHA CHRISTOPHA KOCHA

Djelo Heinricha Christopa Kocha *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition* pokušaj je da se dade sveobuhvatna teorija kompozicije. Ne razmatraju se samo pravila teorije glazbe već i ono što je u vezi s unutarnjom prirodom glazbe, a za što se ne mogu postaviti apsolutna pravila. Ipak, postoje crte vodilje primjenjive na lijepe umjetnosti općenito koje Koch dovodi u vezu s glazbom. Koch mnogo toga ostaje dužan djelu *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* Johanna Sulzera. Ono je izvor većine Kochovih estetičkih ideja koje su prema tome radije konzervativne.

Koch vjeruje da je najviša funkcija umjetnosti izazivanje osjećaja u slušaocu i u krajnjoj liniji njegovo oplemenjivanje. Taj se učinak može postići samo ako umjetničko djelo posjeduje stanovite estetske kvalitete; ono mora biti izraz određenog osjećaja i mora istovremeno posjedovati jedinstvo i različnost. Kako kompozicija u stvari nastaje u duhu umjetnika mnogo je teži problem. Da bi razlikovao faze stvaralačkog procesa Koch je posudio tri termina koje je Sulzer primijenio na lijepe umjetnosti općenito: *Anlage* (postava), *Ausführung* (izvođenje) i *Ausarbeitung* (doradba). Te je termine Koch primijenio posebno na glazbu upotrebljavajući za ilustraciju ariju iz Graunova djela *Der Tod Jesu* (Isusova smrt). U osnovi je nemoguće pronaći glazbene ekvivalente za neke od ovih termina kako ih je definirao Sulzer. No i sama činjenica da je Koch to pokušao pokazuje da nije imao interesa za estetičke sisteme *per se* već da ih je nastojao primijeniti na glazbenu stvarnost.